



Human Service Education

**A Journal of the
National Organization
for Human Services**

**Volume 28, Number 1 • Fall 2008
ISSN 0890-5428**

National Organization for Human Services

The National Organization for Human Services (NOHS) was founded in 1975 as an outgrowth of a perceived need by professional care providers and legislators for improved methods of human service delivery. With the support of the National Institute of Mental Health and the Southern Regional Education Board, NOHSE focused its energies on developing and strengthening human service education programs at the associate, bachelor's, master's, and doctoral levels.

The current purposes of the organization are: (a) to provide a medium for cooperation and communication among human service organizations and individual practitioners, faculty, and students; (b) to foster excellence in teaching, research and curriculum development for improving the education of human service delivery personnel; (c) to encourage, support, and assist the development of local, state, and national organizations of human services; (d) to sponsor conferences, institutes, and symposia that foster creative approaches to meeting human service needs.

Members of NOHS are drawn from diverse educational and professional backgrounds that include corrections, mental health, child care, social services, human resource management, gerontology, developmental disabilities, addictions, recreation, and education. Membership is open to human service educators, students, fieldwork supervisors, direct care professionals, and administrators. Benefits of membership include subscriptions to Human Service Education and to the Link (the quarterly newsletter), access to exclusive online resources, and the availability of professional development workshops, professional development and research grants, and an annual conference.

Six regional organizations are affiliated with NOHS and provide additional benefits to their members. They are the New England Organization of Human Service Education, Mid-Atlantic Consortium for Human Services, Southern Organization for Human Service Education, Midwest-North Central Organization for Human Service Education, Northwest Human Services Association, and Western Region of Human Service Professionals.

NOHS is closely allied with the Council for Standards in Human Service Education (CSHSE). CSHSE, founded in 1979, has developed a highly respected set of standards for professional human service education programs and also provides technical assistance to programs seeking Council accreditation.

Membership information can be found on the organization's website at www.nationalhumanservices.org. Correspondence should be addressed to the NOHS headquarters office at 5601 Brodie Lane, Suite 620-215, Austin, Texas, 78745, telephone 512-692-9361, fax 512-692-9445, info@nationalhumanservices.org.

2008 Editorial Board
National Organization for Human Services

Editor

Sandra D. Haynes
Metropolitan State College of Denver

Reviewers

Joel Diambra
University of Tennessee
College of Education,
Health and Human Services
Educational Psychology
and Counseling

Rich Furman
University of Washington,
Tacoma

Jill C. Jurgens
Old Dominion University
Darden College of Education

Pam Kiser
Elon College
Human Services Department

Tricia McClam
University of Tennessee

Nancy Moke
Metro State College of Denver
Human Services Department

Patrick Morrissette
Brandon University
School of Health Studies

Edward Neukrug
Old Dominion University
College of Education

Frederick Sweitzer
University of Hartford

Table of Contents

Articles

Baby Boomers as Volunteers: Are Nonprofit Organizations Prepared? <i>Honey W. Nashman, Emily Morrison, and Radha Duggal</i>	5
Activities to Enhance the Cultural Competence of Human Services Students <i>Edward Neukrug and Tammi Milliken</i>	17
Assessing the Needs of Human Services Adjunct Faculty: Uncovering Strategies for Retaining Quality Instructors <i>Tammi F. Milliken and Jill C. Jurgens</i>	29
Cultural Competency Course Work, Personal Counseling or Both: What Influences Students' Ability to Work Effectively With Culturally Diverse Clients? <i>Jesse Brinson and Ramona Denby</i>	44
The Advocacy Project <i>Linda Wark</i>	69
At-Risk Decisions in Professional-Client Relationships: A Classroom Exercise <i>Linda Wark</i>	83
The Human Service Internship Portfolio: Benefits for Student Interns and Supervising Faculty <i>Jane D. Lanigan</i>	100
Latino Women's Perception of Gender Equity in Household Labor and its Relation to Marital Satisfaction <i>Beth Warner and Cara Leidy</i>	110
Students' Lived Experiences of Practice Courses Presented Through the Research Poem <i>Rich Furman, D. Bruce Taylor and Meredith Badinelli</i>	123
Working with Self-Injury: Ten Guidelines for Human Service Profes- sionals <i>Laurie M. Craigen, PhD, LPC</i>	132

Book Reviews

Review of Human Behavior in the Social Environment from an African-American Perspective, Second Edition by Letha A. Lee
Myron R. Anderson143

Review of the Successful Internship: Personal, Professional, and Civic Development, Third Edition by H. Frederick Sweitzer and Mary A. King
Susan A. Andresen.....147

Announcements

Guidelines for Authors150

Baby Boomers as Volunteers: Are Nonprofit Organizations Prepared?

Honey W. Nashman and Emily Morrison
The George Washington University

Radha Duggal
The Campus Kitchens Project

Abstract

To deepen learning and address community concerns about Baby Boomer retirements, one professor integrated community based research—a methodology involving undergraduate students and community leaders as co-researchers—into an upper level Human Services course. This study describes how a private Mid-Atlantic university class partnered with community organizations to understand the following: What do nonprofit organizations think of Baby Boomers as potential volunteers? To what extent are nonprofit organizations prepared to engage Baby Boomer volunteers? Guided by the professor, the students reviewed the literature, interviewed community leaders, analyzed data, and shared findings with community leaders. Results revealed that while interested, organizations are not yet adequately prepared for Baby Boomer volunteers. Suggestions for preparation are discussed.

Introduction

Baby Boomers as Volunteers: Are Nonprofit Organizations Prepared?

Educators in academic settings conduct research that contributes knowledge within a scientific discipline and in tandem apply knowledge gleaned from research to the practice of the discipline (Butschi & Steyn, 2006). To seamlessly weave together teaching, research, and practice in mutually reinforcing ways, a professor at a private university in the Mid-Atlantic region incorporated a service-learning and community based research project into an upper-level Human Services course. The project's purpose was to provide students the opportunity to understand an emerging issue more deeply through research, teaching, and service-learning, as well as explore a potential renaissance for service agencies.

As Strand, Marullo, Culforth, Stoecker, and Donohue (2003) summarized, research on service-learning experiences reveals that they can “enhance the ability to understand and solve problems, use subject matter to analyze a problem, know the workings of agencies and the

political system, and think critically” (p. 22). Hence, service-learning experience provided a strong foundation from which students were able to engage in community based research. Community based research is a unique approach to research, which often utilizes different methodologies than traditional quantitative research, that yields insights that can inform both theory and practice. Indeed, “productive undergraduate research serves to highlight the very academic nature of a discipline grounded in service and practice” (Fair, King & Vandermaas-Peeler, 2004, p. 66).

The idea for this innovative component to the course emerged in Fall 2006, when a local leader of an anti-hunger organization provided a guest lecture and challenged the class to consider the effects that the Baby Boomer generation would have on the United States when they retire, and more specifically, what the effects would be on the nonprofit community. After the local leader put this challenge forth, the professor engaged the class, other community leaders, and colleagues at the university in a dialogue about the relevance of this emerging issue.

Given the response, the professor sought IRB approval to conduct community-based research with the next semester’s class at two anti-hunger organizations. The students in the Spring 2007 course developed a survey to understand more about Baby Boomers and also piloted a study of non-profit organizations’ readiness to engage Boomers as volunteers. The community partners played key roles that included: assisting the students with the design of the survey, introducing the research project to colleagues and volunteers, and verifying results. The results from this initial pilot study informed the current Fall 2007 study. Before discussing the Fall 2007 study, however, it is important to understand more about the focus on Baby Boomers.

A Contemporary Issue

Members of the Baby Boomer generation, commonly defined as individuals born in the United States between 1946 and 1964 (Wilson & Simson, 2006), were born into a “uniquely American postwar era of prosperity, social freedom and anticipated longevity” (Johnson, 2003, p. vi). In 2001, the first Baby Boomer turned 55 and entered early retirement. The number of Americans age 65 and older will almost double between 2008 and 2030—from 35 million to over 70 million (U.S. Census Bureau, 2004). Considering the anticipated number of retiring Boomers over the next 20 years (Bradley, 2000), it is of vital importance to understand this generation and their relationship to the nonprofit community as both potential providers and recipients of service. This is especially pertinent for today’s Human Services students, who are the leaders and

scholars who will face this opportunity and challenge.

With a predisposition for active engagement, the generation is expected to fill post-retirement time with increased volunteer activities (Laurent, 2006) that contribute to society (Thoits & Hewitt, 2001). As such, the generation presents an inviting resource for nonprofit organizations provided that they can harness the generations' experience, skills, time, and money. In 2006, 65.4 million individuals volunteered in the US, representing 28.8% of the population (Corporation for National and Community Service [CNCS], 2007a). Volunteers staff essential positions for nonprofit organizations by filling positions of varying skill levels (e.g. high skills like bookkeeping and program management or basic skills like administrative work and meal distribution). Coordinating volunteers is an important investment by organizations that can build up a cadre of skilled volunteers who can provide needed work for free, offering financial relief to the organization (Ban, Drahnah-Faller, and Towers, 2003; Strigas, 2006).

Nonprofit organizations are beginning to focus on engaging the Baby Boomer volunteers. Boomers have started retiring and are looking towards volunteering as a means for utilizing their skills, developing their interests, and being involved in the community (CNCS, 2007a). Experts who study this cohort assert that organizations should redefine the character and scope of volunteer opportunities to appeal to Boomers' skills and desires with such efforts anticipated to yield high satisfaction levels for the Boomers and an enormous resource to organizations (CNCS, 2007b). Given this advice, how can Boomers be attracted and kept as active volunteers?

Background

This article provides a description of how an undergraduate Human Service course conducted a basic qualitative study that extends from one semester to the next with each new group of students in the class taking the research deeper and in new directions. In addition, the article shares the findings from the study and presents an approach for other Human Service educators to replicate. The course, Issues in Human Services, linked academic study, service-learning experience in the field of human services, and research, and included nine students in spring 2007 and eight students in fall 2007. The benefits that students receive as part of service-learning courses are well documented (Astin, Sax, & Avalos, 1999; Hollis, 2002; Jacoby, 1996; McClam, Diambra, Burton, Fuss, & Fudge, 2007; Mobley, 2007; Scudder, 1996). The service-learning experience was deepened by conducting original research, and intentionally designing coursework that afforded students a practical

and extensive learning experience. The six credit hour course was intentionally designed to develop students' knowledge, skills and abilities in bridging teachings, service, and research in the Human Services field.

Methods

In Spring 2007, the students, in collaboration with the professor and two leaders from anti-hunger nonprofit organizations, decided to understand the Baby Boomer generation's characteristics and disposition towards volunteering. Second, the co-researchers created an interview protocol, conducted interviews, and analyzed data on the two nonprofit organizations' preparedness to work with Boomer volunteers. Additionally they sought to understand current satisfaction of Baby Boomer volunteers. Initial findings revealed that the organizations were very interested in Boomers as volunteers, but were not prepared to accommodate special interests, skills, or needs.

Reviewing the research process, findings from the Spring class, and feedback from the community partners, the objective of the Fall 2007 course was to further the basic interpretive research study: What do nonprofit organizations think of Baby Boomers as potential volunteers? The secondary question was to what extent are nonprofit organizations prepared to engage Baby Boomer volunteers?

Students in the Fall 2007 course began by familiarizing themselves with the Baby Boomer generation by conducting an initial review of the literature. Together the students, professor, and a colleague from the University's Office of Community Service identified community leaders from different organizations who were familiar with their organization's philosophy, vision, and strategic plan, as well as had an intimate knowledge of volunteer processes. For some organizations, these criteria fit the Founder or CEO; in other organizations, the person most familiar with the organization and its volunteer needs, opportunities, and processes were full time volunteer coordinators. Interviewees ranged in age from 25 to 63 years. Neither position nor age was important; rather, the intent was to find people who could provide the most insight into the study's questions from a variety of human services issue areas.

The students were able to establish a relationship with the identified community leaders and gained entry into the organizations following an introductory e-mail and phone call from the colleague in the Office of Community Service and the course professor. Once participants consented to participate, students utilized the interview protocol and structured questions developed by the previous course members and conducted 40 minute (on average) interviews with each leader either in person or over the phone, if necessary.

A total of 33 different community leaders and organizations participated in the study. Participants were asked to share basic demographic information, their involvement and role at the organizations, information about the organization's volunteer system, their understanding of Baby Boomers, knowledge about the organization's current and future plans to work with Baby Boomers, and overall sense of awareness and preparedness to interact with Baby Boomers. Each interview was transcribed. Transcriptions were sent to participants to ensure accuracy and allow participants to change or add any thoughts and reflections. In addition, data were gathered from printed materials from the organization and its website (if applicable).

Once participants verified transcriptions, data analysis began. The students coded the interviews individually. If questions arose regarding what a participant meant, the students contacted the participant via e-mail or phone to clarify meaning before proceeding. Then, in small groups, students collaborated with each other to review their codes and to check that identified themes were grounded in the interview data. The small groups discovered several major themes and important passages of data that supported the findings. The groups triangulated interview data, observation notes (from on-site interviews), and printed materials from the respective organizations.

To ensure the trustworthiness of the data and accuracy of the interpretations overall, the professor and students invited all participants to join a dialogue session where the students presented their findings to the participants. This provided participants with another opportunity to share feedback, clarify meanings, as well as offer additional insights and reflections on the findings. Through triangulation, member checks, peer review, and a variety of participating organizations, the students, with guidance from the professor, honored the key aspects of basic interpretive study (Merriam, 2002).

Findings

The purpose of this study—beyond introducing undergraduate students to community-based research—was to understand how nonprofit organizations were making sense of the Baby Boomers and their impending retirements, as well as the role Boomers could play in organizations as volunteers. In analyzing the data, the responses to the research questions reinforced one another and provided an overall description of their level of preparedness.

When analyzed, themes emerged according to organizational awareness of the generation, needs of the organization, interest level in involving Boomers, and actions to involve Boomers as volunteers.

These themes clustered as follows: 1) organizations who were well aware that older people can provide a significant contribution of time and talents for their organization and engaged them; 2) organizations who were aware, but not actively seeking Boomers despite interest in Boomers as volunteers; 3) organizations who were aware of the Boomers and not seeking them as volunteers because the organizations had no interest; and 4) organizations who were unaware and not actively seeking Boomer volunteers.

Aware, Interested and Actively Seeking Boomers to Address Organizational Needs

The first cluster consists of organizations that were aware of the Baby Boomers, interested in including them as volunteers, and were actively seeking Boomers to address organizational needs. One leader from a domestic violence agency said, “[Boomers] have a lot of experience, they’re generous and giving, and they are good at recruiting who they know.... Seventy percent of our clients are Boomers, so the more Boomer volunteers we have, the better.” By involving Boomers who are socially connected, the organization is able to actively involve other skilled volunteers. One leader from an agency serving senior citizens said, “We rely mightily on senior leaders from the community. These seniors are recognized leaders, and the go-to people in the field, providing us with the first line of ears and eyes that direct us towards who needs our help.”

These organizations have positive attitudes towards Boomers and are highly receptive to their contributions as volunteers. In fact, several participants described how their organizations had created positions especially for Boomers to harness experience, skills, and knowledge. “We encourage volunteers to create their own position descriptions. This lets them choose what skills and experiences they want to use and have.” Moreover, volunteers that were over the age of 45 years exhibited dedication and concern for their community. MM, a leader who works with homeless and low-income people stated, “We like the older volunteers because we get a longer commitment from them and they tend to have better skills.” At an anti-hunger organization, a Boomer provided invaluable service: “We had one man who was a retired accountant and he was really helpful to our accounting department. He was a really great help and he allowed the permanent position to take vacation. He was reliable and we could have trust in him (CP).” Organizations in this cluster were utilizing the time, energy, and experience of Baby Boomers to satisfy organizational needs.

Aware, Interested and Not Actively Seeking Boomers to Address Organizational Needs

The second cluster includes those organizations that are aware of Baby Boomers as potential volunteers, interested in involving them, but not actively recruiting them. “I am very interested in expanding recruitment towards older populations [current volunteers are high school and college students]... I have taken steps towards recruiting older populations by contacting AARP and researching methods on how to reach out to boomers and retirees. However, I have not had much success. I don’t know how to reach out to them,” said the community leader from a pre-school for homeless children.

The majority of organizations interviewed reported that their volunteer base consisted primarily of high school and college students and young professionals. “Our average volunteer is a college-aged female (18-22) who volunteers on a monthly basis,” says MW from a transitional housing organization. MK from an aging services organization added, “students are an easy population to target because it’s all set up through programs such as the Office of Community Service or Greek organizations. In the workforce, service is not mandatory and this makes it harder to reach older volunteers.” SE, a leader who serves people with terminal illnesses discussed wanting to recruit volunteers of all ages, yet “has difficulty bringing in older volunteers.” Two other organizations said they relied heavily on “service-learning and corporate service as critical sources to fill organizational needs.”

Aware, Not Interested and Not Actively Seeking Boomers to Address Organizational Needs

The third cluster describes organizations that are aware of the Baby Boomers, but are not interested nor actively seeking Boomers to address organizational needs. For example, an HIV-AIDS prevention program targeting youth shared that “we focus on prevention, education, and treatment needs of young people. A main feature of [organizational name] is to mobilize young people in support of their peers.” Thus, Baby Boomer and older volunteers are less desirable. Moreover, JG, the organization’s volunteer coordinator said, “The biggest challenge is the safety issue with adults. When adults are volunteers, there has to be a background check, and most of the time a staff member must be present when working with a child. It involves more effort and time.” The organization is aware of the Baby Boom generation as potential volunteers but does not believe they are a valuable resource to their program.

Unaware and Not Seeking Boomers as Volunteers

The final cluster focuses on organizations that were unaware of the looming retirement wave of Baby Boomers and were not actively seeking Boomers as volunteers. These organizations did not consider Baby Boomers as a resource for volunteers until asked. While their organizations may have had unmet needs, they were not recruiting Baby Boomers to address this gap. SI, the leader at a small public high school shared that she was “unsure how the approaching Baby Boomers will affect the school. We are not prepared to utilize them as a valuable resource.” Moreover, BM, an environmental leader said, “the Baby Boomer generation [of which this participant is a part] is a lazy generation at this point in time. They get the feeling that ‘we went through this, it is someone else’s turn.’”

Overarching Themes

Given the range of interpretations of what the Baby Boomer generation could mean for organizations, it was not surprising to hear the challenges faced in trying to recruit Boomers for volunteer work. Most organizations were not actively recruiting Baby Boomers. HP, a leader at a soup kitchen and social services agency, said, “Time limitations on the part of staff and lack of knowledge about where to recruit boomers adds to the challenge. And, in many areas, it already has surplus volunteers, so it has not seemed necessary to target an additional population group.” Also, most organizations did not have a formal recruitment plan, relying instead on partner organizations to provide volunteers. GM, a grocery program coordinator, said, “Our recruitment efforts are rather passive. We don’t have position descriptions. We are not very sophisticated. We just show the volunteers what needs to be done and they organize themselves to do it.” Meanwhile, an agency providing healthcare to low-income clients shared, “For people with a special quality or skill, they seek us out on their own behalf and indicate these qualities on our application. A lot of it is by personal initiative. It’s really the same for everybody [whether a Boomer or not].” Many organizations simply stated, “...anyone who is interested in giving their time to our program is welcome,” with many reporting that their “recruitment and advertising do not target specific abilities,” says AL. Rather, “it is up to volunteers’ personal initiative.” Thus, volunteers’ skills, knowledge, and experience may be largely underutilized and untargeted by organizations.

The main challenge cited by organizational leaders with regards to engaging Baby Boomers was a lack of organizational capacity—not enough funding, time, staff, or overall support systems. For example, SE from a senior citizen center reported, “Recruitment is not a main fo-

cus right now... there is not much time for reaching out to more volunteers, because I am busy managing the volunteers we already have.” She continued saying, “Every new project needs staff support... Even volunteers require staff support—they are not simply a free service.” MA, from a different senior citizen organization, added, “I am supportive of the idea of marketing towards and engaging Boomers, but I don’t know the right way to do it... there is a fundamental problem in that we [the organization] don’t have the money to hire a new staff person, and it is unlikely that we will be able to raise the money necessary.” NB, a child advocate, said, “I am currently the only person within the agency that handles volunteer requests, interviews, training and evaluations.” KL, another organizational leader in the health realm, shared, “it is a strain on the full-time staff (there are only two of us) to constantly train new volunteers while juggling House duties.” To date, there has been insufficient staff, funding and time to assess organizational needs, as well as develop methods to engage Boomers.

Limitations

The findings of this study were limited to a particular urban geographical area and only incorporated insight from a single employee per organization. Moreover, participants’ schedules were extremely busy, which limited the depth of information provided, both in the initial survey and in follow-up discussions.

Discussion

These findings supported the literature reviewed on Boomers and volunteering and identified a way to involve community-based research on a contemporary issue and engage students in the Human Service field in the learning process. Moreover, the study identified an area where there is little known information. Despite believing in the importance of this generation in terms of the potential contributions in money, time and deed, organizations are not prepared to effectively and specifically engage Baby Boomers.

The majority of the nonprofit organizations surveyed were not prepared to recruit Boomers as volunteers. Organizations ranged from “aware, interested and actively seeking Boomers to address organizational needs” to “unaware and uninterested in seeking Boomers as volunteers.” The organizations that utilized Boomers in a more innovative way than common volunteer roles were most successful in retaining the volunteers’ interest and making the most of their expertise. Many of the organizations who were “aware, interested and not actively seeking Boomers to address organizational needs” desired to use an older popu-

lation in their programs but did not know how to approach and attract volunteers from the Baby Boomer generation. Some have taken measures in the past to increase recruitment of this age group but have been unsuccessful at forming solid connections. Other organizations were not interested in recruiting Baby Boomers because they were short staffed, did not have a recruitment plan, or did not see how Boomer volunteers could be a valuable resource.

To recruit Boomers, organizational leaders should be aware that Boomers may respond better to traditional mediums suggesting that recruitment in person, by peers, and other volunteers is effective (Cnaan & Cascio, 1999; Penner, 2002). Another study indicates that the Internet is an effective way to reach potential volunteers in this age group (VolunteerMatch, 2007). Recruitment efforts should appeal to the Boomers' interests, propensity for civic engagement, commitment to good health and interest in social networks. Because many older adults volunteer to interact with other people, ongoing supervision and support enhances volunteer satisfaction (Brudney, 1999; Li & Ferraro, 2006). Moreover, volunteers will be more likely to remain in positions that are good matches for their skill sets and interest (VolunteerMatch, 2007). Organizations should consider developing and utilizing a training protocol for Boomer volunteers. A final consideration is for agencies to create a staff position dedicated to recruiting and supporting Boomer volunteers.

Scant research examining the capacity of infrastructure supporting Baby Boomer volunteers or the agencies' ability to engage this population was uncovered in the review of literature on this topic. This research adds to the literature on this topic while also providing a model for others to follow. Future studies could investigate the following: how organizations anticipate Boomers as service recipients, what the experience is like to serve as a Boomer volunteer, how organizations in rural areas are making meaning of Boomers, or how older adults can be attracted to volunteer by specific recruitment and public relations ideas.

This study seemed to bolster student learning, as well as benefited the community and the University. The study employed the best practices for community-based research involving collaborative partnerships, community identified need, active participation by all, and a forum for the dissemination of knowledge that sought to achieve positive change and provide a stronger information base from which the agencies could plan and act (Strand et al., 2003). Additional study on the specific student outcomes is needed. Observation data showed that participants were energized because they saw their work "making a difference." Students experienced community-based research in an emerging area and service-learning, providing an invaluable opportunity to guide their pro-

fessional careers in Human Services. Meanwhile, community partners engaged in the research process were able to identify ways that Boomers may affect their respective organization and plan accordingly.

The authors wish to thank and are grateful to the students in the Issues in Human Services course, Kerry Kidwell-Slak, Eric Williams, and Pamela Davidson.

References

- Astin, A.W., Sax, L. J., & Avalos, J. (1999). Longterm effects of volunteerism during the undergraduate years. *Review of Higher Education*, 22, 187-202.
- Ban, C., Drahnah-Faller, A., & Towers, M. (2003). Human resource challenges in human service and community development organizations. *Review of Public Personnel Administration*, 23(2), 133-153.
- Bradley, D. B. (2000). A reason to rise each morning: The meaning of volunteering in the lives of older adults. *Generations*, 13(4), 45-50.
- Brudney, J. L. (1999). The effective use of volunteers: Best practices for the public sector [Electronic Version]. *Law and Contemporary Problems*, 62, 219-255.
- Butschi, G., & Steyn, B. (2006). Theory on strategic communication management is the key to unlocking the boardroom. *Journal of Communication Management*, 10, 106-109.
- Cnaan, R. A., & Cascio, T. (1999). Performance and commitment: Issues in management of volunteers in human service organizations. *Journal of Social Service Research*, 24(3/4), 1-50.
- Corporation for National and Community Service. (2007a). Office of Research and Policy Development. *Volunteering in America: 2007 state trends and rankings in civic life*. Washington, DC.
- Corporation for National and Community Service. (2007b). Office of Research and Policy Development. *Keeping baby boomers volunteering*. Washington, DC.
- Fair, C., King, C., & Vandermaas-Peeler, M. (2004). The cognitive apprenticeship model of undergraduate research in human services. *Journal of Human Service Education*, 24(1), 61-68.
- Hollis, S. A. (2002). Capturing the experience: Transforming community service into service learning. *Teaching Sociology*, 30, 200-213.
- Jacoby, B. (1996). *Service learning in higher education: Concepts and practices*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Johnson, C. (2003, October). *The strength of the infrastructure of volunteer agencies and its capacity to absorb "Baby Boomer" volunteers*. Working paper presented by the Points of Light Foundation and Volunteer Central National Network for the Conference on Baby Boomers and Retirement: Impact on Civic Engagement.
- Laurent, D. (2006). The re generation. *Science and Spirit*, 17, 38-42.
- Li, Y., & Ferraro, K. F. (2006). Volunteering in middle and later life: Is health a benefit, barrier, or both? *Social Forces*, 85(1), 497-520.

- McClam, T., Diambra, J. F., Burton, B., Fuss, A., & Fudge, D. L. (2007). Support: A key to successful service learning. *Journal of Human Service Education*, 27(1), 18-24.
- Merriam, S. B. (2002). *Qualitative research in practice*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass.
- Mobley, C. (2007). Breaking ground: Engaging undergraduates in social change through service learning. *Teaching Sociology*, 35, 125-137.
- Penner, L. A. (2002). Dispositional and organizational influences on sustained volunteerism: An interactionist perspective [Electronic Version]. *Journal of Social Issues*, 58(3), 447-467.
- Scudder, M. C. (1996). Introducing human service students to service in the university community. *Journal of Human Service Education*, 16(1), 57-61.
- Strand, K., Marullo, S., Culforth, N., Stoecker, R., & Donohue, P. (2003). Principles of best practice for community-based research. *Michigan Journal of Community Service Learning*, 9(3), 5-15.
- Strigas, A. (2006). Research update: Making the most of volunteers. *Parks and Recreation*, 41(4), 26-29.
- Thoits, P. A., & Hewitt, L. N. (2001). Volunteer work and well-being. *Journal of Health and Social Behavior*, 42, 115-131.
- U.S. Census Bureau. (2004). *US interim projections by age, sex, race, and Hispanic origin*. Retrieved July 10, 2007, from <http://www.census.gov/ipc/www/usinterimproj/natprojtab02a.pdf>
- VolunteerMatch. (2007). *Great expectations: Boomers and the future of volunteering*. Retrieved July 30, 2007, from <http://www.volunteermatch.org/nonprofits/resources/greatexpectations/>
- Wilson, L. B., & Simson, S. P. (2006). *The civic engagement and the baby boomer generation*. New York: The Haworth Press.

Activities to Enhance the Cultural Competence of Human Services Students

Edward Neukrug and Tammi F. Milliken
Old Dominion University

Abstract

This article provides evidence that culturally competent helping is not being taught effectively and describes a number of activities that can be used by human service programs to enhance the cross-cultural competence of their students, including: immersion activities, supervision, case studies, dilemma discussions, role plays, group interactions, journaling, and reading assignments. Suggestions for researching the effectiveness of such activities are made.

Introduction

Mental health services are not adequately meeting the needs of many clients from diverse backgrounds. Research has shown that when minority clients at community agencies are in helping relationships with White helpers, or minority helpers of a different cultural background from their own, they are frequently misunderstood, often misdiagnosed, find interventions less helpful, seek mental health services at lower rates, and terminate helping relationships earlier (Diala, Muntaner, Walrath, & Nickerson, 2000; Maramba & Nagayama Hall, 2002; Olfson, Marcus, Druss, & Pincus, 2002; Phelps, Taylor, & Gerard, 2001).

In schools, helpers too have problems being culturally competent. For instance, school counselors and school counselor interns who harbor racist attitudes, also have lower levels of both real and perceived multicultural competence (Constantine, 2002; Constantine & Gushue, 2003; Milliken, 2004). Additionally, those with less training in multicultural counseling tend to perceive themselves as being less culturally competent (Milliken, 2004). With many minorities, particularly African Americans, doing significantly worse academically as compared to Whites (National Center for Education Statistics [NAEP], 2005), it is critical that human service professionals be able to offer culturally competent helping in order to assist in lessening the achievement gap. This is particularly important as achievement in schools has been shown to be related to developing vocational goals, successful social skills, socioeconomic status, and a strong self-concept (Day-Vines, 2005; Indiana Educational Policy Center, 2000; Mahiri, 1998; Mayer & Peterson,

1999; The Education Trust, 2006).

Why is helping not working? Neukrug (2008) offers eight possible explanations including:

1. *The melting pot myth.* Some helpers view the United States as a melting pot when in actuality American society is more of a cultural mosaic. These human service professionals are less likely to honor their clients' unique cultural heritage.
2. *Incongruent expectations about the helping relationship.* The helping relationship tends to be based on Western values and consequently stresses the importance of expression of feelings, self-disclosure, cause and effect thinking, open-mindedness, and internal locus of control. A helpee who does not embrace these characteristics might be viewed as resistant or pathological and the helpee might feel disappointed, angry, or guilty when he or she does not live up to the helper's expectations.
3. *Lack of understanding of social forces.* Some helpers attribute most problems to internal conflicts and de-emphasize environmental issues. By de-emphasizing social forces, human service professionals are likely to have a difficult time building a relationship with a client who has been considerably harmed by external factors.
4. *Ethnocentric worldview.* Culturally incompetent helpers tend to view the world through the lens of their own culture. They falsely assume clients view the world in a similar manner to themselves or believe that when clients present a differing view they are emotionally disturbed, culturally brainwashed, or just simply wrong.
5. *Ignorance of one's own racist attitudes and prejudices.* The helper who has not spent time examining his or her own racist attitudes and prejudices will unconsciously project negative and harmful attitudes onto clients.
6. *Inability to understand cultural differences in the expression of symptomatology.* What may be seen as "abnormal" in the United States may be considered usual in another culture. The human service professional's lack of knowledge about cultural differences in the expression of symptoms can damage a helping relationship and result in misdiagnosis, mistreatment, and early termination.
7. *The unreliability of assessment and research instruments.* Over the years, assessment and research instruments have been notoriously culturally biased. Although advances have been made, human service professionals who are not familiar with these biases may utilize

instruments that may be inappropriate for certain clients or make assumptions about test results that may be incorrect.

8. *Institutional racism*. Because institutional racism is embedded in society and even within the professional organizations (D'Andrea & Daniels, 1991; 1999; 2005), materials used by human service professionals may be biased, and helpers will unknowingly have gained a skewed understanding of culturally different clients when using such materials.

If human service professionals are to be effective, programs must address these eight issues and others. Not surprising, many of these issues are highlighted in a number of the sections of the NOHS's ethical standards (National Organization of Human Services, 1996; Woodside & McClam, 2004). In addition, cross-cultural competence is highlighted as a critical curriculum area in the Council for Standards in Human Service Education's (CSHSE) accreditation guidelines:

Emphasis on context and the role of diversity (including, but not limited to ethnicity, culture, gender, sexual orientation, learning styles, ability, and socio-economic status) in determining and meeting human needs (CSHSE, 2005, Standard 12e).

In 2003 the Council on Standards for Human Service Education (CSHSE) endorsed the establishment of Standards for Culturally Competent Human Service Practice (Harold Gates, personal communication, September 18, 2007). A committee was soon formed to work on such competencies. Although some progress has been made, at this point no competencies have been developed. In addition, with only 40 programs being accredited by CSHSE, and a somewhat larger number being members of CSHSE, the ability to monitor the application of such competencies is limited. However, competencies would be one major step in providing an impetus toward the training of culturally competent human service practitioners (CSHSE, 2007a, b).

As one might expect, when professionals are effectively trained in cross-cultural helping, they are shown to be culturally competent (Constantine & Gainor, 2001; Constantine, 2002; Constantine & Gushue, 2003; Constantine & Yeh, 2001; Milliken, 2004; Sadowsky, Kuo-Jackson, Richardson & Corey, 1998). Culturally competent helpers are more likely to be:

- willing to obtain knowledge about all diverse groups,
- invested in becoming self-aware about their own attitudes and values that could deleteriously affect the helping relationship,
- willing and wanting to learn culturally appropriate helping skills,

- better able to regulate their defensiveness and more likely to establish a helping relationship toward a resistant minority client,
- knowledgeable about oppression, social inequities and political influences, and how such factors affect minority clients,
- tolerant and knowledgeable about the need for such social institutions as affirmative action, desegregation through bussing, and taxed social welfare programming.

Despite the evidence of the importance of multicultural training, little has been written in *Human Service Education* on this important topic, and thus little evidence exists as to whether programs are addressing this important issue. Perhaps more importantly, there is no evidence of any outcome research that has been conducted to see if programs are training culturally competent practitioners. In fact, although specific articles have been written on issues related to varying ethnic and cultural groups, only one article (Woodside & McClam, 2004) has addressed cross-cultural education in the journal within the past fifteen years. Considering the impact that effective multicultural education has on students in the helping professions, and ultimately on the health and well being of the diverse clients these students will eventually serve, it is critical that human services programs infuse effective methods of multicultural training into the curriculum, if they are not already doing so.

Multicultural Training

In recent years, some have suggested weaving multicultural perspectives throughout programs, while others have suggested having a separate course in multicultural awareness (Arthur & Achenbach, 2002; First Annual Diversity Challenge, 2003; Garcia, Wright, & Corey, 1991; Landis, Bennett, & Bennett, 2004). Whether weaving multicultural issues throughout one's program, offering it in a separate class, or doing both (as we suggest) a number of activities have been designed to support and challenge the student's evolution to becoming a culturally competent professional. The following offers a sampling of some of the activities that can be used to enhance the multicultural competence of trainees.

The Immersion Activity

DeRicco and Sciarra (2005) speak of the importance of an immersion activity that allows students time to experience another culture (e.g., spend a few weeks attending an African American church, work at a soup kitchen, volunteer at a nursing home, etc). Experiencing new perspectives, however, is always best when students are also able to process their experience (Reiman & Peace, 2002). Thus, students should

be asked to reflect on their immersion experiences in a variety of ways, such as writing journal entries, discussing their experiences in class, or writing a paper in which they draw from their immersion experience. In each case, instructors should provide both affirming and challenging feedback to support students' development and further encourage alternative perspectives. This activity is intended to shatter stereotypes, enhance empathy, and stimulate self-awareness. Because field experiences offer an opportunity to spend an extended amount of time at a site while being supervised, they can sometimes provide an intensive immersion experience. Thus, internship and service learning opportunities should always be considered as potential sources for such immersion experiences (Galura, Pasque, Schoem, & Howard, 2004).

Supervision Training

A triad model, developed by Pedersen (2001), suggests that a helper, a client of a different cultural group, an antihelper of the same cultural group as the client, and a prohelper also of the same cultural group as the client, all meet together during an interview. Paying particular attention to cultural exchanges, the prohelper's role is to describe to the helper the client's positive reactions to the helper while the antihelper's role is to describe the client's negative reactions to the helper. Particularly useful in methods classes or field placement supervision, the pro-helper and antihelper's continual and immediate feedback to the helper is intended to increase the helper's ability to understand the client's perspective, recognize client resistance, recognize the helper's defensiveness, and learn how to recover from mistakes that the helper might make during the interview.

Use of Case Studies

Woodside and McClam (2004) suggest the use of case studies as an interesting vehicle to facilitate students' examination of their cultural perceptions. Students are presented a case of a cultural minority individual. The case is written from the perspective of the depicted individual. Discussion following presentation of the case may include exploration of the depicted individual's cultural norms, issues, and challenges. Students can be asked to reflect upon their personal reactions to the individual as well. Culturally appropriate helping skills specific to the depicted individual as well as for others from his/her cultural group may also be identified. Instructors should aim to promote a comprehensive understanding of the cultural group depicted in the case.

Dilemma Discussions

Stemming from the work of Kohlberg, and later expanded by Belenky and Gilligan (Belenky, Clinchy, Goldberger, & Tarule, 1997; Gilligan, 1982; Power, Higgins, & Kohlberg, 1989), dilemma discussions foster a principled approach to solving challenging problems. In these discussions, students are provided with dilemmas related to issues helpers could face with minority clients. Some possible examples include: the morality of stealing to feed one's family if one is poor and out of work, how a helper might respond to an angry and mistrustful minority client, and whether a helper should "turn in" a client who is an undocumented worker as per agency policy. During the discussions the instructor acts as a moderator and helps students process their responses. Through group processing, multiple paradigms are examined and students are encouraged to abandon ethnocentric perspectives. These discussions challenge students to confront their own biases and assumptions and help students respect differing values and beliefs. Additionally, students are provided the forum to recognize the strengths and assets of their peers who are from different backgrounds and who hold different beliefs.

Role-Plays

Students are given an opportunity to practice their cross-cultural helping skills by role playing a helper with peers who are role-playing minority clients. Role-plays also provide a direct means of evaluation for instructors. Students can be coached, affirmed, and provided constructive feedback by an observing instructor (Glickauf-Hughes & Campbell, 1991). Possible topics for role-plays include: broaching cultural differences between the helper and client, engaging in advocacy with a client, examining diverse family structures, using assessment instruments with cultural sensitivity, discussing the role of oppression in a minority client's life, emphasizing cultural strengths in a minority client's life, completing a cultural genogram with a client, and utilizing culturally sensitive helping approaches.

Group Interactions

Group processing and guided reflection aim to enhance awareness of self and others. This is particularly helpful when a variety of cultural groups are represented by the students. If the group lacks ethnic diversity, bringing out other kinds of differences can be helpful (e.g., different ages, religions, social class, achievement levels). Then, through guided discussions, students are exposed to alternative perspectives and various group norms. Participants should be encouraged to discuss their

thoughts and concerns and react to comments made by peers. To be effective, the instructor should develop a trusting classroom environment where dialectical exchanges are encouraged (McGonigal, 2005).

Journaling

Journaling provides an outlet for reflection on experiences obtained as part of a course on multicultural helping. Students can be asked to reflect on topics presented in class, activities engaged in, discussions held, materials read, and projects completed. Writing about experiences can be less threatening as compared to having class discussions about those same experiences. Students should be asked to think critically about how their beliefs and perspectives were impacted by their experiences. While journaling can be a primary source of reflection, the instructors' written response to each entry acts as a cogent source of challenge and support. Feedback should affirm noted changes in perspective and should assist students in moving from a description of experience to an assessment of personal and professional growth (Griffith & Frieden, 2000).

Reading Assignments

Required reading is intended to provoke thought and emotion, and challenge values and beliefs. Students should be provided with the opportunity to discuss these materials during class and/or journal about their reactions to the reading. By using biographies, fiction, and historical accounts, and by reading well-known authors, the material is more likely to be engaging to students. Guided discussion regarding readings can increase self-awareness concerning highlighted issues. Table 1 provides a list of suggested materials.

These methods may assist helpers in developing awareness of how effective they are when working with minority clients. By engaging in activities such as these, it may be possible to promote tolerance in human services trainees as well as the necessary knowledge, skills, and awareness to be a culturally competent helper.

Discussion and Suggestions for Future Research

The effects of cross-cultural incompetence are dramatic and long-lasting. Today, we can no longer afford to have culturally incompetent human service professionals who are misdiagnosing and mistreating clients in a variety of settings. Unfortunately, although the ethical code of NOHS and the accreditation standards of CSHSE both support the importance of training culturally competent professionals, little has been

written in the human services literature to suggest how this might be done. This article makes some suggestions on how faculty might be able to infuse a number of activities in a course and throughout programs that could assist in effecting cross-culturally competent human service professionals. It is important, however, that such activities be researched for their effectiveness. A number of suggestions are made as to how this might be done.

Although it is suggested in this article that human service programs should consider infusing cross-cultural training throughout their programs and offer a separate course on multicultural counseling, such training needs to be carefully planned and researched. Offering too much of the same thing may do more harm than good. CSHSE might want to suggest training models, perhaps through the development of a monograph that can focus on important curriculum issues relative to cross-cultural helping. Research might want to examine whether differences exist between the cultural competence of professionals who went through a program that offered infusion and a separate course as compared to programs that only offered infusion or a separate course.

Pre-post cross-cultural competency tests and self-efficacy tests can be administered to students prior to and following taking a cross-cultural counseling course as well as prior to going through a human service program and at completion of that program. Such tests can measure knowledge gained as well as student perceptions of their competence. In addition, after having graduated, students can be followed in the field and self-perceptions of cross-cultural competence as well as their supervisor's perception of their knowledge base relative to cross-cultural helping could be assessed.

Of course, the development and application of Standards for Culturally Competent Human Service Practice is critical if programs are to train culturally competent helpers. It is imperative, therefore, that CSHSE make the adoption of such standards a priority and that such standards eventually become part of the program accreditation process. In addition, research that examines changes in students who attend programs that adopt such standards would help us understand their effectiveness.

Finally, the ultimate test of cross-cultural competence will be the assessment of and feedback from diverse clients who are seeking help from human service professionals. Although large in scope, it will be necessary to eventually examine whether minority clients are continuing to be misunderstood, be misdiagnosed, enter treatment less frequently, find the helping relationship unhelpful, and leave treatment early.

References

- Arthur, N. & Achenbach, K. (2002). Developing multicultural counseling competencies through experiential learning. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 42(1), 2–14.
- Belenky, M. F., Clinchy, B. M., Goldberger, N. R., & Tarule, J. M. (1997). *Women's ways of knowing*. New York: Basic Books. (Original work published 1986)
- Constantine, M. G. (2002). Racism attitudes, White racial identity attitudes, and multicultural counseling competences in school counselor trainees. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 41(3), 162-174.
- Constantine, M. G., & Gainor, K. A. (2001). Emotional intelligence and empathy: Their relation to multicultural counseling knowledge and awareness. *Professional School Counseling*, 5(2), 131-137.
- Constantine, M. G. & Gushue, G. V. (2003). School counselors' ethnic tolerance attitudes and racism attitudes as predictors of their multicultural case conceptualization of an immigrant student. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 81(2), 185.
- Constantine, M. G. & Yeh, C. J., (2001). Multicultural training, self-construals, and multicultural competence of school counselors. *Professional School Counseling*, 4, 202-207.
- CSHSE (Council for Standards in Human Service Education) (2007a). *CSHSE accredited programs*. Retrieved September 19, 2007, from <http://www.cshse.org/accredited.html>
- CSHSE (Council for Standards in Human Service Education) (2007b). *CSHSE program members*. Retrieved September 19, 2007, from <http://www.cshse.org/members.html>
- CSHSE (Council for Standards in Human Service Education) (2005). *CSHSE national standards for human service education*. Retrieved February 8, 2007, from <http://www.cshse.org/standards.html>
- D'Andrea, M., & Daniels, J. (1991). Exploring the different levels of multicultural counseling training in counselor education. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 70(1), 78–85.
- D'Andrea, M., & Daniels, J. (1999). Exploring the psychology of white racism through naturalistic inquiry. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 77(1), 93–101.
- D'Andrea, M., & Daniels, J. (2005, July). A socially responsible approach to counseling, mental health care. *Counseling Today*, 36–38.
- Day-Vines, N. (2005). Culturally congruent strategies for addressing the behavioral needs of urban, African American male adolescents. *Professional School Counseling*, 8(3), 236-244.
- DeRiccio, J. N., & Sciarra, D. T. (2005). The immersion experience in multicultural counselor training: Confronting covert racism. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 33(1), 2–16.
- Diala, C., Muntaner, C., Walrath, C., & Nickerson, K. J. (2000). Racial differences in attitudes toward professional mental health care and in the use of services. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, 70, 455–464.
- First Annual Diversity Challenge (2003). "How to survive teaching courses on

- race and culture.” [Special section]. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 31(1).
- Galura, J. A., Pasque, P. A., Schoem, D., & Howard, J. (2004) (Eds.). *Engaging the whole service-learning, diversity, and learning communities*. Ann Arbor, MI: The OCSL Press at the University of Michigan.
- Garcia, M. H., Wright, J. W., & Corey, G. (1991). A multicultural perspective in an undergraduate human services program. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 70(1), 86–90.
- Gilligan, C. (1982). *In a different voice: Psychological theory and women’s development*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Glickauf-Hughes, C. & Campbell, L. F. (1991). Experiential supervision: Applied techniques for a case presentation approach. *Psychotherapy*, 28(4), 625-635.
- Griffith, B. A. & Frieden, G. (2000). Facilitating reflective thinking in counselor education. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 40(2), 82-93.
- Indiana Education Policy Center (2000). *Safe and Responsive Schools Project at the Indiana Education Policy Center*. Retrieved February 8, 2007, from <http://www.indiana.edu/%7Esafeschl/>
- Landis, D., Bennett, J. M., & Bennett, M. J. (Eds.). (2004). *Handbook of intercultural training (3rd ed.)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Mahiri, J. (1998). *Shooting for excellence: African American and youth culture in new century schools*. (Report No. ED-99-CO-0035). New York, NY: ERIC Clearinghouse on Urban Education. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED423542)
- Maramba, G. G., & Nagayama Hall, G. C. (2002). Meta-analysis of ethnic match as a predictor of dropout, utilization, and level of functioning. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology*, 8, 290–297.
- Mayer, S., & Peterson, P. (1999). *Earning and learning: How schools matter*. Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press.
- McGonigal, K. (2005). Using class discussion to meet your teaching goals. *Speaking of Teaching*, 15(1). Retrieved February 12, 2007, from http://ctl.stanford.edu/Newsletter/discussion_leading.pdf
- Milliken, T. F. (2004). The impact of cognitive development on White school counselor interns’ perspectives and perceived competencies for addressing the needs of African American students. (Doctoral dissertation, College of William and Mary, 2003). *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 65, 420.
- National Center for Education Statistics (2005). *NAEP 2004 Long-Term Trend Summary Data Tables*. Retrieved February 8, 2007, from http://nces.ed.gov/nationsreportcard/ltr/results2004/2004_sdts.asp
- National Organization of Human Services (1996). Ethical standards of human service professionals. *Human Service Education*, 16(1), pp. 11–17.
- Neukrug, E. (2008). *Theory, practice, and trends in human services: An introduction*. Belmont, CA: Brooks/Cole.
- Olfson, M., Marcus, S. C., Druss, B., & Pincus, H. A. (2002). National trends in the use of outpatient psychotherapy. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, 159, 1914–1920.

- Pedersen, P. B. (2001). Triad counseling. In R. Corsini (Ed.), *Handbook of innovative psychotherapies* (2nd ed., pp. 704–714). New York: Wiley.
- Phelps, R. E., Taylor, J. D., & Gerard, P.A. (2001). Cultural mistrust, ethnic identity, racial identity, and self-esteem among ethnically diverse black university students. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 79, 209–216.
- Power, C., Higgins, A., & Kohlberg, L. (1989). *Lawrence Kohlberg's approach to moral education*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.
- Reiman, A., & Peace, S. (2002). Promoting teachers' moral reasoning and collaborative inquiry performance: A developmental role-taking and guided inquiry study. *Journal of Moral Education*, 31(1), 51-66. Retrieved Monday, February 05, 2007, from PsycINFO database.
- Sodowsky, G. R., Kuo-Jackson, P. Y., Richardson, M. F., & Corey, A. T. (1998). Correlates of self-reported multicultural competencies: Counselor multicultural social desirability, race, social inadequacy, locus-of-control racial ideology, and multicultural training. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 45, 256-264.
- The Education Trust (2005). *Gaining traction, gaining ground: How some high schools accelerate learning for struggling students*. Retrieved February 8, 2007, from <http://www2.edtrust.org/NR/rdonlyres/6226B581-83C3-4447-9CE7-31C5694B9EF6/0/GainingTractionGainingGround.pdf>
- Woodside, M., & McClam, T. (2004). Developing cultural competence: A case study approach. *Human Service Education*, 24, 87-91.

Suggested Reading Materials for Human Service Trainees

- Angelou, M. (1970). *I know why the caged bird sings*. New York, NY: Random House.
- Blum, L. (2002). *I'm not a racist, but...: The moral quandary of race*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Ellison, R. (1952). *Invisible man*. New York, NY: Random House.
- Gates, H. L. (1995). *Colored people: A memoir*. New York, NY: Knopf.
- Grier, W. & Cobbs, P. (1968). *Black rage*. New York, NY: Bantam Books.
- Griffin, J. H. (1960). *Black like me*. New York, NY: Signet.
- Hale-Benson, J. E. (1986). *Black children: Their roots, culture and learning styles*. Provo, UT: Brigham Young University Press.
- Kiselica, M. S. (1999). *Confronting prejudice and racism during multicultural training*. Alexandria, VA: American Counseling Association.

- Lee, C. C. (1995). *Counseling for diversity: A guide for school counselors and related professionals*. Needham Heights, MA: Allyn and Bacon.
- Majors, R., and Billson, J. M. (1993). *Cool pose: The dilemmas of black manhood in America*. New York, NY: Simon and Schuster.
- McBride, J. (1996). *The color of water*. New York, NY: Riverhead Books.
- McCall, N. (1994). *Makes me wanna holler*. New York, NY: Vintage Books.
- Morrison, T. (1994). *The bluest eye*. New York, NY: Penguin Books.
- Ridley, C. R. (1995). *Overcoming unintentional racism in counseling and therapy: A practitioner's guide to intentional intervention*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Stewart, J. (1996). *1001 things everyone should know about African American history*. New York, NY: Doubleday.
- Tatum, B. D. (1997). *Why are all the Black kids sitting together in the cafeteria?: And other conversations about race*. New York, NY: Basic Books.

Assessing the Needs of Human Services Adjunct Faculty: Uncovering Strategies for Retaining Quality Instructors

Tammi F. Milliken and Jill C. Jurgens
Old Dominion University

Abstract

There is a marked increase in the hiring of adjunct instructors across all disciplines in colleges and universities. Explanations for this increase range from inadequate amounts of full-time doctoral instructors to staff academic programs, to financial gains available to colleges and universities who employ part-time faculty. Although the demand for adjunct faculty exists, many part-time positions go unfilled. Consequently, an examination of support services and resources available to adjunct instructors may provide insight into the recruitment, hiring, and retention of these faculty. This study examines the importance and availability of various opportunities, services, and resources to human services adjuncts.

Introduction

There is a significant increase in the number of adjunct faculty being hired nationally and internationally, in all academic areas, at both undergraduate and graduate levels (Fagan-Wilen, & White, 2006). The National Education Association (2006) reported a 30% increase in the use of part-time instructors since 1993, and according to Leslie (1998) approximately 40% of all university faculty are being hired in adjunct positions.

The basis for these considerable shifts in the hiring practices of institutions of higher education has garnered considerable comment and discussion, and reasons for the increase in the hiring of part-time faculty may be due to a number of factors (Fagan-Wilen et al., 2006). First, there appears to be an inadequate supply of full-time doctoral instructors to staff the increase of undergraduate and graduate programs of study. Second, there are larger financial gains to colleges and universities in relation to tuition and faculty salary ratios (Noble, 2000). Use of adjunct faculty is a cost effective way for departments to provide quality instruction to a greater number of students. Third, hiring adjuncts can release tenured faculty from teaching responsibilities and allow for increased research and/or administrative responsibilities. Fourth, adjunct faculty allow programs to offer additional courses beyond that which

full-time faculty teach (Garii & Petersen, 2006). Finally, adjunct faculty members who are established practitioners in the community can bring their expertise to the classroom. Given the aforementioned justifications, it is likely that the hiring of part-time faculty will continue to increase into the next decade and beyond (Fagan-Wilen et al., 2006).

Although there is a marked increase in the hiring of adjunct faculty, a number of part-time positions are going unfilled. Higheredjobs.com (2003) reported that there were 250 to 300 unfilled adjunct faculty positions in the United States as well as 50 to 100 adjunct faculty positions unfilled abroad at all levels of higher education. One of the key reasons for the high number of unfilled positions is that many adjunct instructors feel ill supported and undervalued (Greisler, 2002). Research has investigated the experiences of adjunct instructors in general (Hinkel, 2007; Quinn, 2005; Smith, 2003; Wisneski, 2003). In one study of 77 adjunct faculty members, Quinn (2005) found that adjuncts did not experience institutional belongingness and were isolated within the constraints of their job categorization. Additionally, adjunct faculty were not encouraged to participate in career development activities and were not entitled to annual funding. These results indicate that many adjunct instructors feel undervalued and ill supported.

Discipline-specific research regarding the experiences of adjunct faculty has also been conducted. For example, Fagan-Wilen et al. (2006) studied the development and support of adjunct faculty at a school of social work. Several topics were examined including issues leading to the increased use of adjuncts; the training and supports needed to improve the quality of adjunct teaching; the linkage of adjuncts to tenured faculty in the delivery of classroom teaching; and the specific training, support, and retention needed to improve the quality of instruction. They asserted that adjunct faculty of social work programs performed more effectively and felt greater levels of job satisfaction when provided with an appropriate level of support.

Kilmer (2004) examined the use and abuse of adjunct faculty in the field of theology. By interviewing full-time faculty in a theology department, Kilmer found that their focus on teaching, writing, and on the tenure process left them with little time to address adjunct issues. According to Kilmer, the full-time faculty were not uneducated or heartless; they just didn't have time to deal with these issues. Although there are a number of discipline-specific studies regarding adjunct faculty's experiences, no such studies were found regarding the discipline of human services.

The purpose of the present study was to investigate the needs and experiences of adjunct faculty of human services programs at colleges

and universities across the nation. Quantitative data was obtained regarding the importance of various opportunities, services, and resources at institutions potentially available to human services adjuncts. In addition, the availability of these opportunities, services, and resources at the institutions was investigated. The perceived needs and current availability of resources and support services of adjunct faculty are reported. The overall goal of the research is to assist human services educators and institutions of higher education in advocating for supports deemed important by the representative sample of adjunct instructors surveyed.

Methodology

Participants

Participants consisted of 58 adjunct faculty teaching in human services programs. These adjuncts came from various geographic regions of the country. The convenience sample was drawn from two-year, four-year, and graduate-level human service programs holding membership in The Council for Standards in Human Service Education. The adjunct faculty participants were diverse in regards to ethnic backgrounds, gender, age, educational majors and degrees, and years of adjunct experience. See Table 1 for specific demographics of the sample.

Instrumentation

Adjunct Instructor Survey (AIS). A researcher-developed survey was utilized for the purpose of this study. The survey consisted of three sections. Sections one and two utilized a five-point Likert-type scale and section three employed a ranking method. Section one asked participants to indicate the level of importance to them as adjunct instructors, of a list of faculty development opportunities (e.g., workshops and teaching evaluations), library resources and services (e.g., access to databases and assistance with research), online resources and services (e.g., Blackboard and faculty e-mail), material resources (e.g., office space and computer access), campus resources and services (e.g., campus tours and information about upcoming events), and miscellaneous resources and services (e.g., parking services and benefits). Section two asked participants to indicate the current level of availability of the aforementioned items. Section three asked participants to rank their top three items based on the importance of the items to them as adjuncts. The survey was piloted on several colleagues and suggestions for clarification of directions, formatting, and additional items were applied.

Procedure

Packets of cover letters, demographic forms, and the AISs were

mailed to a convenience sample of Department Heads, Program Directors, and/or Deans of 77 human services and related programs, which are members of The Council for Standards in Human Service Education. Additional packets were distributed to faculty who attended the 2007 National Organization for Human Services conference. The instrument took approximately 20-minutes to complete. Participation was voluntary, and participants' identities were kept confidential. Information obtained from the demographic forms and surveys was coded and entered into a database, and results were generated.

Additionally, at the 2007 National Organization for Human Services conference, the researchers presented their preliminary findings and held an open forum with educators to discuss implications, obtain information on current best practices for supporting adjunct faculty, and elicit further recommendations to support part-time faculty. This input has been addressed in the discussion.

Results

Desired Versus Actual Availability

Overall, a significant difference was found between participants' ratings of the importance of opportunities, services, and resources available to them at their colleges and universities ($M = 3.76$, $SD = .61$) compared to their perceptions of the opportunities, services, and resources actual availability ($M = 3.18$, $SD = .74$), $\text{paired-}t(57) = 6.67$, $p = <.001$). The magnitude of the difference in means was strong ($D = .86$). This finding was replicated on the survey in four of the six categories of supports and for 19 of the 25 items depicting specific supports. Of the 19 significant items, 13 were significant at the .01 level and 6 at the .05 level. For only one item (faculty e-mail) was there a significant inverse difference in what was deemed important as opposed to what was actually available. Table 2 provides descriptive statistics, paired- t , and p values for each of the survey items.

Ranked Items

Of the 25 specific supports listed on the survey from which participants were asked to rank their top three in terms of importance, *adequate pay* was selected most frequently, being ranked in 63.7% of respondents' top three. For 44.8% of respondents, this item was given a ranking of "1" indicating "most important," making it the most frequently selected item with a ranking of "most important." The second most frequently cited item with a ranking of "most important" was *mentoring opportunities with full-time faculty*, accounting for 8.6% of participants.

Workshops, seminars, panel discussions on topics related to teaching was selected second most frequently in respondents' top three (27.6%). Two items, *participation in program and department meetings* and *evaluations of teaching*, were selected third most frequently in their top three, each by 19.0% of respondents. At 17.2% each, three items (*opportunities to attend conferences, mentoring opportunities with full-time faculty, and benefits*) were ranked fourth most frequently in participants' top three. Four items were not ranked in any of the participants' top three most important supports and the remaining items were ranked in participants' top three at a rate of 10% or less. Table 3 specifies the frequency of rankings for each item.

Influence of Demographic Variables

By disaggregating the sample by college type (two-year, four-year, and graduate) the sub groups would not have sufficient comparative power, thus the analyses were conducted on the total sample. There were no significant differences in participants' perceptions of the importance of the supports identified on the AIS or the current availability of those supports based on gender, ethnicity, age, degree area, or number of years experience as an adjunct instructor. However, a significant difference was found between masters and doctoral level respondents. While they agreed on the types of supports deemed important for adjuncts, doctoral level participants reported at a significantly higher rate that the supports were already in place (mean difference = .751; $F(2, 55) = 4.99, p = .008$).

Discussion

Related to the study described above pertaining to adjunct faculty of social work programs (Fagan-Wilen et al, 2006), it stands to reason that adjunct faculty of human services programs who feel ill supported and undervalued will not perform as effectively. Unfortunately, the results of the current study indicate that, overall, adjuncts of human services programs do not feel that the supports they deem to be important are readily available to them. In fact, for 19 of the 25 specific items on the AIS depicting various opportunities, services, and resources for adjunct faculty of human services at colleges and universities, respondents showed a significant difference between what they deemed to be important to have available and what they perceived to be actually available. The results of this study signify the need for colleges and universities with human services programs to establish mechanisms for providing more supports to adjuncts as a means to enhance teaching and service. What follows are a multitude of suggestions for instituting these sup-

ports. The suggestions are offered to encourage institutions to make adjustments to current practices or develop new resources to better accommodate adjunct faculty as needed and when feasible.

Some might argue that their institutions do not have the funds to implement additional supports for adjuncts. However, many of the resources desired can be established for very little if any cost. In fact, many existing resources could simply be modified to include adjunct faculty. Specifically, under the category of *Faculty Development Opportunities*, respondents felt strongly that it is important to have workshops, seminars, and panel discussions on teaching related topics, opportunities to attend conferences, mentoring opportunities with full-time faculty, participation in program and department meetings, and evaluations of teaching.

Teaching related trainings are often readily available to full-time faculty at colleges and universities. When these trainings are also open to adjuncts, the results from the current study indicate that the part-time faculty are often unaware that these trainings are available. In this case, institutions could enhance their communication of the existing trainings to part-time faculty through such methods as e-mail alerts, mailings, and posted flyers in main offices in which adjuncts commonly enter. Schools at which adjunct faculty are currently excluded from teaching related trainings could open the trainings to adjuncts and advertise their availability. In this manner, no separate facilitators would need to be hired and the cost of additional copies of materials would be minimal.

The awarding of mini-grants for financial assistance to attend conferences is an additional service commonly available to full-time faculty that might also be opened to adjuncts. The only cost to making this service available is in the additional time it may take to review adjuncts' proposals. Additionally, adjunct faculty could be invited to attend several department and program meetings each year, particularly when topics being covered address teaching-related issues relevant to adjuncts. Allowing their participation in these meetings would be cost free yet may contribute to their sense of connection to the institution and human services program.

It would also be cost free to pair adjunct faculty with full-time faculty for mentoring. Full-time faculty could be rewarded with credit for service to the program for meeting with designated adjunct instructors on a regularly scheduled basis. In this manner, everyone wins - the adjuncts feel more supported and can potentially become better integrated into the system, and the full-time faculty can fulfill service requirements. Since adjuncts feel that evaluations of their teaching are very important, in addition to their classes being included in the standardized

university evaluation system, the faculty mentors could conduct live classroom evaluations and provide feedback. As part of their service-related duties, this function would also be cost free. Full-time faculty mentors could also offer some material resources deemed important to human services adjuncts, such as access to sample course syllabi and recognition through positive affirmations.

Recognition for positive efforts is crucial for productivity (Lambert, 2006). As reported on the AIS, recognition for adjuncts is significantly less available than it is deemed important. Considering the consequences of poor performance by adjuncts in the classroom on the development of competent human services professionals, it is imperative that colleges and universities implement a reward system for adjunct faculty of human services. Recognition can take many forms. Informally, as stated above, full-time faculty mentors can offer affirmations, as can program coordinators. More formally, program Chairs and Deans of departments can send letters of appreciation, certificates of appreciation can be awarded to adjuncts at faculty meetings, and recognition of positive contributions can be announced on program websites. Adjunct faculty could be invited to attend graduation ceremonies and march in with the full-time faculty, allowing them to be recognized publicly as respected instructors. Departments may even consider creating an official adjunct faculty award in which nominees are selected annually and awarded at the same function that full-time faculty are recognized for their efforts. An engraved plaque could be given, which again, costs very little.

In addition to recognition, in order to be productive, adjunct faculty reported the need for other supports. Under the category of *Library Resources and Services*, adjunct faculty feel that it is very important to have a variety of resources available (e.g., journals, books, databases), assistance in utilizing those resources for research and teaching, and access to services such as course reserves, interlibrary loan, and borrowing privileges, yet there was a significant difference in how important they deem these resources to be and their perception of the resources' availability. Again, each of these services that are not already available to adjuncts could be implemented at very little cost to the institution. Most institutions offer all of these resources and services to full-time faculty, so they would not need to be developed. As with the faculty development opportunities, all of the library services that are currently only offered to full-time faculty could be opened to adjuncts. However, making them available is not enough. Institutions and human services programs must also make the services known to the adjunct instructors.

It may well be that the majority of adjuncts are simply unaware

that these services and supports are actually available. Efforts should be made to advertise their availability. This may be accomplished through informational e-mails, an adjunct-specific web page on the university's site, descriptions of supports published in an adjunct manual, representatives of the various support services speaking at adjunct faculty meetings, full-time faculty mentors disseminating the information, and informational flyers and announcements placed in adjuncts' mailboxes. Multiple forms of advertisement may be needed to ensure that the information is received. Informed adjuncts are much more likely to utilize the resources. As a result, it is likely these adjuncts would feel more supported and thus perform better as instructors of human services trainees.

While many of the services and supports deemed important to human services adjuncts can be made available to them at little to no cost to the institution, others may require a greater expense, at least initially. For example, many participants reported that they feel it is important to have available an adjunct instructor's manual, office space, computer access, office supplies, adequate pay, and benefits.

Initially, the development of an adjunct instructor's manual would require sufficient effort on the part of the human services program coordinator or designee. For completion of this task, it may be necessary to advocate for this individual to receive remuneration, either financially or in the form of a course release. Since full time faculty handbooks address many factors that don't apply to adjunct faculty (e.g. the tenure and review process, retirement benefits, leave-taking), a manual for adjunct faculty addressing their specific circumstances (e.g. hiring procedures and continuance, evaluations, available benefits) has the potential to be an invaluable resource, particularly if it includes a description of the opportunities, resources, and services available to them. Importantly, it would be necessary for the manual to be kept current. Programs that already have a manual may need to consider updating it or revising it to include new and revised resources. Printing the manual may be expensive. However, putting it on the human services program web page or the institution's adjunct web page could minimize production costs.

It may also be expensive to provide adjunct faculty with office space, computer access, and office supplies, yet access to these resources is highly desired as indicated on the AIS. Many adjunct instructors struggle to find a place to meet with students, prepare for class, or conduct other tasks related to their role as instructors due to not having an office in which to perform these responsibilities. Likewise, many adjuncts have difficulty accessing course materials remotely if they don't have personal laptops. This can be problematic for an instructor who needs materials for class but doesn't have the time to drive home

to his or her own computer to obtain them. Having to purchase one's own office supplies needed for teaching is also undesirable. When possible, efforts should be made to provide adjuncts with access to office space stocked with a computer and supplies. For most institutions, it is not feasible to provide each adjunct with his or her own private office, however, even a large space designated just for adjunct instructors that is equipped with desks, several computers, telephones, ample supplies, and storage facilities to keep course materials would be better than what many currently have.

The most costly resource desired most by adjunct faculty is an increase in pay and the opportunity to receive benefits. Considering that adjunct instructors typically make 50% of what full-time faculty earn (Hoeller, 2008) for the very important job of preparing our future human services professionals, it is worth considering ways in which to increase their earnings and provide health insurance and benefits. Departments may consider creating an office of development whose task it is to solicit funds from alumnae and local contributors for increasing adjuncts' pay, among other things. For departments that already have a development office, full-time faculty of human services programs might advocate for a portion of donors' contributions to be funneled into increasing adjuncts' pay and providing them with benefits. The financial cost of increasing their pay may be substantial, but the potential long-term benefits are great. Higher remuneration is likely to draw better instructors, and better instructors are likely to draw more students. A higher number of students enrolled in the human services program means that more tuition is being paid, and thus the institution benefits.

Offering discounts to adjunct faculty is one way in which to balance their meager wages. This can be accomplished by charging reduced rates for university events and services. Additionally, adjunct faculty could be allowed discounted parking in faculty lots. Institutions may fear losing money by offering these discounts, but it is likely that adjuncts who typically do not participate in university events, utilize campus services, or purchase full-price parking passes would be more likely to if they were available at a reduced price, thus making up for the loss.

While it may not be feasible to implement every support deemed important in this study, institutions and human services programs should consider incorporating, at minimum, the supports deemed most important to respondents when ranking the items on the survey. Using the strategies described above, human services programs should attempt to advocate for adjuncts to receive higher pay and benefits, establish opportunities for mentoring with full-time faculty, provide access to work-

shops, seminars, and panel discussions on topics related to teaching, allow participation in program and department meetings, establish more comprehensive methods for evaluations of teaching, and consider ways in which adjunct faculty can acquire funds to attend conferences. By addressing the items deemed most important, it is likely that adjunct faculty of human services will feel better supported and equipped with the necessary tools for effective teaching, and thus more likely to perform at their highest level.

It is worth noting the several items on the survey in which no significant difference was found between what was deemed important and what is currently available. Respondents felt that it is very important to be able to utilize Blackboard in their classes, and they reported that it is readily available to them. Online tutorials assisting in the use of such things as Blackboard, web design, and PowerPoint were also rated as very important and very available. Likewise, annual orientation meetings were rated as very important and very available. These meetings offer an ideal opportunity to provide adjuncts with some of the information and supports described above. Finally, campus tours, informational e-mails about university events, and university-wide faculty resources such as women faculty support groups and service committees, were deemed important by respondents and available to them. In these areas, institutions are providing adjuncts with services they need to feel supported. Interestingly, participants responded that faculty e-mail is significantly more available to them than they need. Possibly because most adjuncts have other jobs and, likely, other e-mail accounts, they feel that an additional e-mail specific to the institution at which they teach is unnecessary.

Related to the demographics, a significant difference was found between respondents with a master's degree and those with a doctoral degree. Because there were only two participants with a bachelor's degree, their data was not included in this comparison. Both those with a master's and a doctorate agreed on the types of supports deemed important, however, doctoral-level respondents felt that the supports were significantly more available to them than did master's-level respondents. This may be due to doctoral-level adjunct instructors having more experience teaching at the college level and thus being more aware of the supports available to them. On the other hand, compared to adjunct faculty with master's degrees, when working in an environment comprised of doctoral-level full-time faculty, doctoral-level adjuncts may feel more like equals, and thus may be more comfortable asking for what they need in order to be supported in their roles. It may be necessary to recognize that master's-level adjunct instructors in particular may not

always ask for what they need, not because they don't need support, but because they may feel intimidated asking or lack the experience to know that supports may be available if needed. With this in mind, full-time faculty should make attempts to reach out to adjunct faculty to assist the adjuncts in utilizing existing resources and advocating for those not available, because the more supported adjunct faculty of human services feel, the better able they will be to meet human services trainees' needs.

Future Research

While the results from this study illuminate specific supports deemed important to adjunct faculty of human services and their perceptions of these supports' current availability at their colleges and universities, more information can be obtained through future research to assist in developing a broader understanding of the experiences of adjunct instructors. Future studies may consider using a larger sample for greater generalizability. Although this study employed a few qualitative components, future research could expand on the qualitative approach to allow for an enhanced understanding of the experience of human services adjuncts. Finally, a longitudinal study could examine the reactions of adjuncts to institutions that implement many of the supports described in this article. In addition, future research could examine the differences in experiences of adjunct faculty at community colleges versus four-year institutions, undergraduate programs versus graduate programs, and public versus private schools. While more research is warranted, the results of this study highlight the need to advocate for system changes within our human services programs and greater university communities in order to provide better supports to adjunct faculty so that they are able to perform their job at their highest ability and provide the best training possible to students of human services.

References

- Fagan-Wilen, R., Springer, D., Ambrosino, B., & White, B. (2006). The support of adjunct faculty: An academic imperative. *Social Work Education*, 25, 39-51.
- Garii, B., & Petersen, N. J. (2006). Noncore faculty members' roles: Expectations and system stress. *Educational Forum*, 70(3), 215-221.
- Greisler, D. (2002). Adjunct to what? A non-traditional perspective on teaching the social sciences [Electronic version]. *International Journal of Public Administration*, 1125-1142.
- Higherjobs.com (2003). *Part-time faculty hiring*. Retrieved October 5, 2003, from <http://www.higheredjobs.com>
- Hinkel, J. L. . (2007). Institutional support importance as identified by adjunct faculty and administrators in a community college setting (Doctoral dis-

- sertation, Northern Arizona University, 2007). *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 68, 815.
- Hoeller, K. (2008). *The future of the contingent faculty movement*. Retrieved March 19, 2008, from <http://insidehighered.com/views/2007/11/13/hoeller>
- Kilmer, J. J. (2004). The use and abuse of adjunct faculty in theology [Electronic version]. *Academic Exchange Quarterly*, 8, 284-289.
- Lambert, R. J. (2006). Productivity awareness at manufacturers Hanover Trust. *National Productivity Review*, 2(3), 298-306.
- Leslie, D. W. (1998). *Part-time, adjunct, and temporary faculty: the new majority?* Paper presented at the meeting of the Sloan Conference on Part-Time and Adjunct Faculty, Arlington, VA.
- National Education Association (October, 2006). Nontraditional faculty ranks grow faster than tenured positions. *Advocate Online—Special Issue: Status of the Academic Professions: 2003-04*. Retrieved March 9, 2008, from <http://www2nea.org/he/advo04/special/page5.html>
- Noble, Jr., J. H. (2000). ‘Cherchez l’argent: a contribution to the debate about class size, student–faculty rations, and use of adjunct faculty. *Journal of Social Work Education*, 36(1), 89–102.
- Quinn, S. S. (2005). *The organization-based self-esteem, institutional belongingness, and career development opportunities of adjunct faculty at a small northeastern college*. Retrieved March 7, 2008, from Dissertations and Theses database. (AAT 3161387)
- Smith, C. (2003). Working systematically to improve the conditions of part-time/adjunct faculty: A case study of the Washington Federation of Teachers’ public and legislative campaign. *WorkingUSA*, 6, 23-31. Retrieved March 9, 2008, from <http://www.blackwell-synergy.com/toc/wusa/6/4>
- Wisneski, R. (2003). Addressing collegiate adjunct faculty information needs [Electronic version]. *Academic Exchange Quarterly*, 7, 233-237.

Table 1

Demographics of Participants (N=58)

	Frequency	Percent
Gender (1 non-respondent)		
Male	20	34.5
Female	37	63.8
Unknown	1	1.7
Age (2 non-respondents)		
20-30	5	8.6
31-40	13	22.4
41-50	13	22.4
51-60	15	25.9
61-70	9	15.5
70+	1	1.7
Unknown	2	3.4
Ethnicity (3 non-respondents)		
African American	5	8.6

Asian	0	0.0
Caucasian	46	79.3
Latino/a	2	3.4
Biracial	1	1.7
Other	1	1.7
Unknown	3	5.2
Highest Degree (0 non-respondents)		
Bachelors	2	3.4
Masters	46	79.3
Doctorate	10	17.2
Degree Area (0 non-respondents)		
Counseling	16	27.6
Psychology	8	13.8
Social Work	18	31.0
Education	5	8.6
Other	11	19.0
Number of Years as an Adjunct (0 non-respondents)		
1 or less	8	13.8
1.1-5	30	51.7
5.1-10	11	19.0
10.1-15	5	8.6
15.1-20	2	3.4
20.1-30	2	3.4
30+	0	0.0

Table 2

Rating Results

Category and Item	Mean/SD Importance	Mean/SD Availability	paired-t	p
Faculty Development Opportunities				
Workshops, seminars, panel discussions on teaching-related topics	3.72/1.02	2.98/1.30	3.61	.001**
Opportunities to attend conferences	3.55/1.20	2.07/1.47	6.69	.000**
Mentoring opportunities with full time faculty	3.16/1.34	2.64/1.46	2.8	.007**
Participation in program & department meetings	3.21/1.19	2.58/1.43	3.91	.000**
Evaluations of teaching	3.86/1.03	3.43/1.33	2.30	.025*
Library Resources and Services				
Variety of resources available	4.09/.84	3.78/1.2	2.02	.049*
Assistance with research and instruction	3.74/1.04	3.23/1.41	2.87	.006**
Services (e.g., course reserves, interlibrary loan, borrowing privileges, etc.)	4.33/.80	3.81/1.10	3.59	.001**
Online Resources and Services				
Blackboard	4.02/1.24	4.07/1.41	-.32	.748

Faculty e-mail	4.02/1.24	4.48/.96	-2.50	.015*
Online tutorials	3.67/1.31	3.60/1.31	.314	.755
Material Resources				
Office space	3.45/1.39	2.43/1.45	4.93	.000**
Computer access	4.19/.99	3.42/1.41	3.92	.000**
Office supplies	4.03/1.03	3.24/1.37	3.76	.000**
Adjunct instructor's manual	3.98/1.10	3.48/1.37	2.62	.011*
Annual orientation meetings	3.74/1.10	3.69/1.29	.27	.786
Access to sample course syllabi	4.48/.73	4.12/.92	2.43	.018*
Adequate pay	2.81/.44	2.68/1.26	12.61	.000**
Recognition	3.61/1.24	2.58/1.64	4.18	.000**
Campus Resources and Services				
Campus tours	2.78/1.38	2.85/1.55	-.29	.777
Informational e-mails about university events	3.35/1.18	3.54/1.36	-.88	.382
University-wide faculty resources (e.g., women faculty support groups, faculty service committees, etc.)	3.24/1.19	3.10/1.52	.55	.584
Miscellaneous Resources and Services				
Parking services	4.26/1.05	3.24/1.41	5.78	.000**
Discounts (e.g., sporting events, dining services, etc.)	3.04/1.29	2.32/1.54	2.67	.010*
Benefits (e.g., health care, life insurance, tuition assistance, etc.)	3.71/1.52	2.11/1.59	5.97	.000**

* = $p < .05$; ** = $p < .01$

Table 3

Ranking Results: Frequency Table

Item	Frequency Selected In Top Three (%)	Frequency Selected As Most Important (%)
Workshops, seminars, panel discussions on teaching-related topics	27.6%	5.2%
Opportunities to attend conferences	17.2%	1.7%
Mentoring opportunities with full time faculty	17.2%	8.6%
Participation in program & department meetings	19.0%	6.9%
Evaluations of teaching	19.0%	1.7%
Variety of resources available	10.3%	6.9%
Assistance with research and instruction	1.7%	0.0%
Services (e.g., course reserves, interlibrary loan, borrowing privileges, etc.)	6.9%	1.7%
Blackboard	8.5%	1.7%
Faculty e-mail	8.5%	1.7%
Online tutorials	0.0%	0.0%
Office space	5.1%	0.0%
Computer access	15.5%	0.0%
Office supplies	6.9%	0.0%

Adjunct instructor's manual	8.5%	0.0%
Annual orientation meetings	6.9%	1.7%
Access to sample course syllabi	5.1%	1.7%
Adequate pay	63.7%	44.8%
Recognition	5.1%	0.0%
Campus tours	0.0%	0.0%
Informational e-mails about university events	0.0%	0.0%
University-wide faculty resources (e.g., women faculty support groups, faculty service committees, etc.)	6.9%	3.4%
Parking services	8.5%	0.0%
Discounts (e.g., sporting events, dining services, etc.)	0.0%	0.0%
Benefits (e.g., health care, life insurance, tuition assistance, etc.)	17.2%	6.9%

Cultural Competency Course Work, Personal Counseling or Both: What Influences Students' Ability to Work Effectively With Culturally Diverse Clients?

Jesse Brinson and Ramona Denby
University of Nevada Las Vegas

Abstract

Despite the fact that social work, human services and counseling education programs operate from accreditation standards and ethical principles requiring them to provide cultural competency skill building activities for their students, research suggests that many graduates may not be prepared to function proficiently with respect to cross-cultural intervention and service delivery. The generally accepted method for instilling cultural competence in practitioners is coursework. However, few studies have examined students' perceptions of what they feel they need in order to become more adept in cultural competence; thus, the purpose of this study. Two constructs, *personal counseling* and *coursework*, were studied among a sample of 512 graduate and undergraduate students. Support was found for the use of *personal counseling*, in addition to *coursework*, as a means to becoming more culturally competent. Additionally, a framework for understanding students' perceptions of the importance of coursework as it facilitates the exploration of ethnicity, culture and their personal ethnic and cultural experiences is explored. Admissions, curriculum and research implications are offered.

Introduction

As the demographic makeup of the United States continues to change and social workers, human services professionals and counselors are providing various services to clients from more culturally and ethnically diverse backgrounds, it has become more of an ethical imperative to increase the cultural competence of students to work with these groups. Likewise, the underutilization of counseling, human services and professional social work intervention by ethnic minorities and people of color really speaks to the need for professionals to develop their cultural competency skills so as to better engage diverse populations. In other words, the help-seeking patterns of people of color might be influenced toward the use of more formal services if clients felt that practitioners embraced their values, beliefs and worldview and could provide services that are not only professional, but that respect their

unique cultural background (Brinson & Kottler, 1995). Heppner (2006) asserts that the counseling profession can and must do much more to systematically train the next generation of professionals to be culturally competent. Similarly, via its Educational Policy and Accreditation Standards (EPAS), the Council on Social Work Education - CSWE (2008) states that social workers understand the influence of diversity on the human experience. Specifically, CSWE's Educational Policy 2.1.4 states that social workers recognize the impact of a culture's structures and values, they gain sufficient self-awareness so that their personal biases are eliminated in working with diverse groups, they recognize and communicate an understanding of the importance of difference, and they view themselves as learners whereby those with whom they work become the informants (CSWE, 2008).

In the field of human services, accreditation standards specify that students are encouraged to "recognize the worth and uniqueness of the individual including culture, ethnicity, gender, religion, abilities, sexual orientation, and other expressions of diversity" (Council for Standards in Human Service Education - CSHSE, 2005, p. 10). In fact, the CSHSE (2005) has set forth a curriculum standard pertaining to self-development, which requires education programs to "provide experiences and support to enable students to develop awareness of their own values, personalities, reaction patterns, interpersonal styles, and limitations" (p. 11).

While several dimensions to cultural competence are evident in the literature, it is generally accepted that social workers, human services professionals and counselors must have awareness, knowledge and skills in order to provide services that meet the needs of diverse ethnic groups, especially African Americans, Native Americans, Latino/Hispanic Americans and Asian Americans, who are impacted by racism, classism, poverty, discrimination and other forms of oppression (Schlesinger & Devore, 1995; Sadowsky, Taffe, Gutkin, & Wise 1994; Sue, 1981; Sue & Sue, 1990). Inherent within this broad construct of cultural competence is the goal of having students become aware of the latent attitudes and the perceptions they may hold toward culturally diverse individuals and groups. More specifically, the presence of subtle bias or more overt racist thinking must be brought into the conscious awareness and knowledge of students. According to most research, competence concerning race and culture is imperative in the training of helping professionals because each individual develops and forms a sense of self and others in the context of race and culture (Carter, 1995; 2003).

Although programs have received an imperative from their accrediting bodies regarding the training of students in cultural competence, the literature points out that cultural competence development

among social work, human services and counseling students may not be adequate to help them work with diverse client populations in schools and agencies (Aponte, 1995; Boyle & Springer, 2001; Schlesinger & Devore, 1995). Thus, the authors contend it is important to assess students in social work, human services and counseling programs regarding their perspectives on working with culturally diverse populations.

Purpose and Background

The purpose of the current study is to examine social work, human services and counseling students' perceptions of working with culturally diverse clients. This study is of particular importance in terms of how social work, human services and counselor educators train students to recognize their unconscious racism and the stereotypes they may hold of culturally diverse clients. In this study, researchers investigated students' perceptions of the importance of personal counseling as well as the importance of exploring ethnicity, culture, and their personal ethnic and cultural experiences, via coursework, to developing cultural competence.

The professions of social work, human services and counseling are claiming common ground with regard to having students from their respective disciplines move toward cultural competence. Whether we are discussing applied practices in educational, field or practice settings, there is professional agreement that training programs must place greater importance on cultural competence as it relates to their students' personal and professional development (Agesta, 2004; Boyle & Springer, 2001; Brinson, 1996; Krajewski-Jaime, 1993; p. 2003). For instance, the Council on Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP) has developed a set of cultural competency standards for the development and training of counselors (CACREP, 2009 Draft). With Section II/Professional Identity of the CACREP 2009 draft, programs are advised to maintain curricular experiences in the area of social and cultural diversity whereby students can: develop cultural self-awareness, promote cultural social justice and among other things, understand their role in the elimination of biases, prejudices and processes of intentional or unintentional discrimination.

As part of the process of building cultural competence in social work, human services and counseling students, education programs have initiated different training models (Abreu, Chung, & Atkinson, 2000). One social work program at a Midwestern university has utilized a seven-week faculty-supervised field placement model in a primary hospital in Mexico City. In this particular cultural context, the social work student is attempting to balance the differences between a tra-

ditional western culture and the host culture in providing culturally competent services. According to Krajewski-Jaime (1993), this model has strengthened the ability of faculty to integrate content on cultural sensitivity into the curriculum, making student education more responsive to the needs of the rapidly growing Mexican population in the U.S. A model for counselors introduced by Carter (1995), the Racial-Cultural Counseling Competence model (RCCC), aims to facilitate each student's awareness of the feelings, ideas, and behaviors that he or she has learned. The model also aims to make students conscious of what they have learned about race and culture as they assume the role of helper with culturally diverse groups.

The professions of social work, human services and counseling, charged with the mandate of mitigating the effects of oppression, racism and discrimination, are responding to the ever changing cultural-demographic population and the need to be more responsive to and inclusive of people of color and other minority groups in addressing their psychosocial and service needs. In the continuing search to become more culturally competent, researchers, educators and practitioners should continue to ask the question: "What are the best strategies to facilitate the development of cultural competence in future practitioners?"

Review of Literature and Empirical Background of the Study

Two constructs undergird the study discussed here: (1) *personal counseling* and (2) *coursework*. The authors posit that it has been a longstanding tradition within the fields of social work, human services and counseling to deliver diversity or multicultural coursework in an effort to graduate culturally competent professionals. However, little consideration has been given to the impact that personal counseling might have in undoing racist or biased thought processes, thereby opening up an avenue for social work, human services and counseling students to become more culturally competent. A review of the literature reveals a variety of training strategies used to integrate cultural competence within social workers, human services professionals and counselors, typically operationalized as curriculum and program objectives. However, it is the assertion of the authors that most educational programs do not build their coursework based on students' perceptions of their own cultural diversity learning needs. Instead, the driving force behind the development of cultural competency coursework is usually accrediting standards. This fact raises the question: If social work, human services and counseling programs structured cultural competency

training in line with students' perceptions, background and experiences, might there be some different conclusions about the best way to engage students into culturally competent practice? For example, could it be that "personal counseling," as opposed to or in conjunction with coursework, is an equally effective method for fostering cultural competence in social workers, human services professionals and counselors? In this study, research participants self-administered a survey that explored their opinions about the value of personal counseling in helping to foster their ability to become more culturally competent. The American Counseling Association's [ACA] (1997) definition of counseling was used in this study. The ACA (1997) defines the practice of counseling as: "the application of mental health, psychological, or human development principles, through cognitive, affective, behavioral or systematic intervention strategies, that address wellness, personal growth, or career development, as well as pathology" (p. 1). Students' perceptions of the value of personal counseling were assessed under a range of conditions and scenarios, including: (1) voluntary pursuit of counseling versus program requirement of counseling, (2) degree program-funded versus student-funded counseling, (3) private provider versus university provider of counseling, (4) completely confidential versus department faculty are not made aware of specifics but are notified that counseling services have been initiated and (5) time-limited versus undetermined counseling duration.

In the following literature review, the authors begin by defining cultural competence and discussing the challenges the practice and research fields have encountered in trying to devise confirmatory measures of the same. Next, the authors present the most salient models that have been used in social work, human services and counseling to teach cultural competence to budding professionals. The literature review concludes with a discussion of the need to consider the role of personal counseling in facilitating the development of cultural competence in human service professionals.

What is Cultural Competence?

The literature contains several definitions of cultural competence (Devore & Schlesinger, 1996; Lum, 1999; Sue, Arredondo, & McDavis, 1992; Van Den Bergh & Crisp, 2004). Therein is the challenge. As a community of scholars we have yet to agree on an operational definition of cultural competence. It stands to reason that if there is no one way of measuring cultural competence then how can we assume there is one route to developing the skill base associated with this proficiency? Is it reasonable to assume that cultural competence is as achievable through such alternatives as "personal counseling" as it is through coursework? As

a means of contextualizing the study described here, the authors adopted the comprehensive definition offered by Greene and Watkins (1998) which states that in order to engage in culturally competent practice:

“...practitioners must have sufficient knowledge that encompasses demographic, historical, and socioeconomic information about a diverse group; and skills that comprise interpersonal interactions, the gathering of information, the development of relationships, and the construction of effective interventions” (p. 30).

According to this definition of culturally competent practice, practitioners must possess: knowledge competencies, which involve a cognitive process of learning about cultural similarities and differences, family structures, celebrations, immigration experiences; affective competencies, which entail emotional responses to cultural similarities and differences; and skill-based competencies, which are techniques and styles that relate to the problem solving process and effectuating change within clients.

Preparation for Work with Culturally Diverse Clients

Cultural Competence Coursework and Preparation in Social Work. Within the field of social work, coursework is thought to have a significant impact on students’ development of racial identity and cultural competence (Spears, 2004). Several theories are taught in an effort to promote cultural competence, including dual perspective, biculturalism, sociological and minority group theories (Boyle & Springer, 2001). Moreover, several curriculum and classroom strategies and other teaching methods have been used in social work to instill cultural competence in students (Devore & Schlesinger, 1996; Greene, 1996; Krajewski-Jaime, 1993; Merchant & Haslett, 2000; Shepard, 2003). For example, Merchant and Haslett (2000) contend that there is great utility in using “collaborative groups” to teach cultural competence. Greene (1996) advanced the notion that a client’s ethnicity is important and can be validated through the use of a constructivist framework. Of course, field placement models (Krajewski-Jaime, 1993) that focus specifically on cultural competence and other out-of-classroom cultural immersion experiences (Shepard, 2003) are also used in social work to promote cross-cultural skill development. One final example of coursework strategies used to teach cultural competence is the technique known as “conscious use of self” (Devore & Schlesinger, 1996) whereby students are taught the importance of self-awareness and how, through alliance building, they are able to intervene on behalf of a client.

Cultural Competence Coursework and Preparation in Human Services

Curriculum standards set forth in the Council for Standards in Human Service Education specify the importance of self development for human services professionals. Programs are encouraged to provide experiences and support that will enable students to develop awareness of their values and cultural bias. In keeping with Standard Number 20, of the CSHSE National Standards, human services education programs must demonstrate how their curriculum positions students to become more aware of diversity (CSHSE, 2005).

Cultural Competence Coursework and Preparation in Counseling. According to Sue et al. (1982), cross-cultural counseling is “any counseling relationship in which two or more of the participants differ with respect to cultural background, values, and lifestyle” (p. 47). The general aims of cross-cultural coursework in counseling are to promote the awareness of cultural factors that can affect counseling practices, and knowledge about various cultural background and experiences.

Counseling programs use a multitude of strategies to increase students’ knowledge base of cultural differences and to inform them of how culture impacts the counseling relationship. The most typical strategy used to influence students’ cultural competence is coursework (Spears, 2004), and the literature contains some innovative and creative coursework strategies (Brinson, Brew & Denby, 2008). For example, Callaway, Ametrano, and Stickel (1999) report that reflective journaling enhances counseling students’ abilities toward culturally competent professional practice by helping them articulate their own cultural attitudes, values and biases, recognize the potential impact of their biases on cross-cultural counseling relationships, and identify needed areas of professional development as they relate to self-awareness, gaining cultural knowledge and developing counseling intervention skill. Abreu, Chung, and Atkinson (2000) provide a comprehensive review of several multicultural training and instructional techniques by citing Ridley, Mendoza, and Kanitz’s (1992, 1994) identification of models that range from traditional (i.e., no changes to existing training and curriculum) to integrated program models where multiculturalism teachings are integrated into the entire curriculum and program coursework. Still others believe that the initial step to instilling cultural competence within students first begins with assuring that programs themselves have the readiness and capacity to deliver the skill set. For example, a checklist of essential program components for the development of multicultural competence has been published (Ponterotto, 1997; Ponterotto, Alexander, & Grieger,

1995). Arredondo et al. (1996) advance a model of cultural competence that outlines a set of behavioral competencies and manifestations associated with awareness, knowledge and skills. Tomlinson-Clarke (2000) recommends a teaching approach for the development of cultural competence; namely, the use of didactic and cognitive instruction prior to the implementation of experiential or affective training.

The Need for Personal Counseling

Research has suggested that mental health professionals suffer from emotional damage at the same rate as the broader population (White & Franzoni, 1990). Yet D'Andrea and Daniels (1992) found little support among counseling department chairpersons for the use of personal counseling as a programmatic requirement. Moreover, the literature is bereft of offerings whereby educators have considered the value of having students receive personal counseling as a means of acquiring requisite cultural competency skills for future professional work. Within the field of counseling some consideration has been given to the use of personal counseling, but mainly for the expressed purpose of practitioners caring for their own mental well-being (Fouad, Hains, & Davis, 1990). Additionally, counseling programs have encouraged the use of personal counseling as a means of increasing the practitioner's empathy and knowledge of the counseling process from the perspective of the client (Corey, Corey, & Callanan, 1988; Post Kammer & Davis, 1986) or for personal growth (Downs, 2000). Within the fields of social work and human services, the literature pertaining to the use of personal counseling as a method of preparing for professional work is sparse and lacks articles and studies that investigate the use of personal counseling in acquiring cultural competence. Instead, like counseling, the literature focuses heavily on the use of "supervision" as a tool for addressing personal competency issues (Kadushin, 1976). Any mention of cultural issues is typically contextually based in discussions pertaining to cross-cultural supervision (Brown & Landrum-Brown, 1995; Solomon, 1983). Despite faculty and researchers' call for students to undergo personal counseling in connection with their degree programs, few studies have examined this issue from students' perspective. However, one study (Fouad, Hains, & Davis, 1990) found that graduate students do endorse the requirement of personal counseling for graduation from a counseling program. Still, the literature is replete of studies that have examined the use of personal counseling as a means to develop cultural competency in students.

The rationale for the study reported here is to explore whether there exists a belief among students in the fields of social work, human services

and counseling that, like cultural competency coursework, personal counseling has a role in promoting an effective skill base for cross-cultural work. Additionally, students' perceptions of the viability of coursework in helping to explore a variety of questions and scenarios associated with ethnicity, culture and their personal ethnic and cultural experiences was studied. Exploratory in nature, this study breaks new ground and operates on the assumption that, like the impact of mental health stressors, the role of racial and cultural bias also has an impact on professional development and therefore it must be considered and remedied.

Methodology

Research Design

Researchers received Social Behavioral Sciences Institutional Review Board (IRB) approval for this study. The overall design for this study was cross-sectional survey research. A self-administered survey was used to capture the perceptions and opinions of a sample of college students (graduate and undergraduate) who were majoring in either counseling or social work. It is important to note that at the university where this study was conducted, undergraduate counseling majors receive a baccalaureate degree in Human Services Counseling. Graduate counseling majors receive a master's degree in Counseling with an emphasis in either Marriage and Family Therapy or Community Mental Health Counseling. Data were collected concerning the students' opinions about the extent to which receiving personal counseling could facilitate their development of cultural competence. The students were also studied in order to understand what role, if any, the exploration of ethnicity, culture and their personal ethnic and cultural experiences, via coursework, could play in the development of effective cultural competency skills.

Sample

Five hundred and twelve students were recruited from a state-funded university located in the southwest United States. For the most part, students were degree-seeking but a small percent of the sample did comprise "graduate specialists" students (i.e., students awaiting formal admission to a program). The sample was recruited from accredited social work and counseling programs. A "convenience sample" of volunteer participants was sought. In order to accumulate a reasonable sample size, students were recruited over the course of several semesters.

Instrumentation and Data Collection

Development. A new 72-item instrument was developed for this study.

Item construction was based on two processes: (1) results of focus groups, and (2) an in-depth search of the literature. A series of four focus groups were held with juniors, graduating seniors and first and second-year graduate students. Two focus groups comprised undergraduates and two groups comprised graduates. Three groups contained ten (10) participants and one group contained only eight participants. The focus groups largely comprised female students (70%) and involved a near even representation of social work and counseling majors. More than half (55%) of the focus group participants self-identified as White/Caucasian/European American, 20% African American, 15% Latino/Hispanic and another 10% categorized themselves as “mixed heritage” or chose not to disclose their ethnicity. The mean age for the focus group participants was 28. The length of the groups averaged ninety minutes. The groups were conducted on campus and were co-facilitated by a university professor and a graduate student. Focus group participants voluntarily participated in the study by responding to announcements posted in various department student lounge areas. Prior to the start of the interview process, group facilitators read aloud an informed consent document. The focus groups were structured around one major open-ended question: “To what do you attribute the development of your cultural competency skills?” Through inductive analysis, the authors discovered themes that emerged from the four focus groups and then used those themes to define constructs that guided the development of the study’s instrument. Additional survey items were derived from the literature on multiculturalism. For example, questions were developed based on such emergent variables as: socio-demographic characteristics, self-determination, negative views, media bias, identification with oppression, race-based bias, privilege, trust, comfort, fear, and stereotyping.

The instrument comprised a series of Likert-scale items that asked respondents to register an opinion related to a stated premise. The instrument contained five sections. For the purposes of this article, three main sections were used in the analysis: Part I, The Value/Role of Personal Counseling in Developing Cultural Competency; Part II,

Importance of Coursework in Facilitating the Exploration of Ethnicity, Culture and Your Personal Ethnic and Cultural Experiences and Part III, Demographics.

Pilot test and the establishment of validity and reliability. Several iterations of the draft instrument that developed as a result of the focus groups and literature review were reviewed by a panel of multicultural education experts comprising five social work faculty, three counsel-

ing faculty and two students (one social work and one counseling). Construct validity was achieved by employing the use of the panel. The panel reviewed the instrument drafts independent of one another and was asked to evaluate the instrument based on the following: stated purpose/objectives of the study and relevance of the questions to the chosen conceptual framework. Additionally, a checklist of domains and constructs found in other instruments that measure student perception of cultural competency was developed and given to the panel so that they could examine the extent to which the developed instrument contained some of the same items. Although suggestions were made for revisions, the panel agreed that the subscales aligned with the constructs and domains contained in the checklist and would measure the constructs under study. The instrument's reliability was tested by administering it to a group of 53 voluntary students enrolled in the researchers' colleagues' courses. The time period between testing and re-testing was three weeks. The re-test reliability reached 0.71, an acceptable level for a new tool.

Administration. A graduate research assistant visited classes and distributed the instruments following a brief statement about the purpose and intent of the study and the participants' rights and protections. At the end of a designated time period, the instruments were retrieved by the graduate research assistant prior to the start of the class. The surveys were typically administered toward the end of the semester.

Statistical Analysis

First, descriptive statistics were generated for the socio-demographic variables. Second, descriptive analyses were run on two dependent variables, agreement with overall need for personal counseling and importance of coursework in exploring ethnicity, culture and ethnic and cultural experiences. These variables were re-coded from five levels into three. Multiple regression, using stepwise selection, was chosen to test the null hypothesis that the multiple R for variables measuring agreement with overall need for personal counseling and importance of coursework in exploring ethnicity, culture and personal ethnic and cultural experiences was equal to 0. All tests used a significance level of .05.

Results

The results are presented in four parts. In Part I, the characteristics of the total sample are presented. Part II describes the sample regarding agreement with overall need for personal counseling and importance coursework in exploring ethnicity, culture and personal ethnic and cultural experiences, followed by the results of two multiple regressions.

Part III contains variables that relate to the need for personal counseling. Finally, Part IV includes regression results concerning students' perceptions of the importance of coursework as it relates to the exploration of ethnicity, culture and personal ethnic and cultural experiences in developing cultural competence.

Part I - Socio-demographic Characteristics

Six of the most salient socio-demographic characteristics are used to describe the sample. The majority of the respondents in the study were single (76%) females (79%). Nineteen percent (19%) of the sample were married while five percent (5%) reported their marital status as divorced. The majority (56%) of the sample were undergraduate students. Forty-four percent (44%) of the sample included graduate students. In terms of degree programs, the participants are classified as follows: 30% Social Work - BSW students, 33% Social Work - MSW students, 4% Counseling - Marriage and Family Therapy students, 23% Counseling - Human Services students and 10% Counseling - Community Mental Health students. Sixty-one percent (61%) of the respondents described their ethnic background as White/Caucasian/European American. African Americans comprised eighteen percent (18%) of the sample, Latinos/Hispanics made up seven percent (7%), Asian Americans were five percent (5%), and American Indians were less than one percent (1%). The final category, described as "other," accounted for eight percent (8%) and included people of "mixed" or "non-disclosed" ethnicity (i.e., those who chose to not disclose their ethnic identity). Seventeen percent (17%) of the sample are Protestant. Twenty-eight percent (28%) are Catholic. Four percent (4%) are Spiritualist and less than 3%, in each category, are Muslim, Buddhist and Jewish. Almost half (47%) of the sample reported their religion as "other." In this category respondents wrote in the specific name of their religion, which included such examples as Evangelical and Baptist. The "other" category also contained respondents with no religious affiliation, atheists, and/or agnostics.

Part II - Personal Counseling and Ethnic Experiences – Descriptive Results

Research participants were asked whether they agreed that personal counseling could help them to develop cultural competency. The mean score for overall agreement with the need for personal counseling to help develop cultural competence was 2.45 – a high level of agreement (see Table 1). Only twenty-one percent (21%) of the sample disagreed with the need for personal counseling to facilitate their professional development relating to cultural competence. Table 2 displays the descriptive results concerning the question: "How important is

coursework that promotes the exploration of ethnicity, culture and personal ethnic and cultural experiences when it comes to developing cultural competency?” More than half (55%) of the sample indicated that coursework that facilitates the exploration of ethnicity, culture and their personal ethnic and cultural experiences is a very important factor in becoming culturally competent. Twenty-four percent (24%) expressed the opinion that coursework that facilitates the exploration of ethnicity, culture and their personal ethnic and cultural experiences is somewhat important in developing cultural competence. A minority, (21%) remarked that coursework that facilitates the exploration of ethnicity, culture and their personal ethnic and cultural experiences, is not important in facilitating cultural competence.

Table 1. Overall Need for Personal Counseling to Develop Cultural Competence

Level	Frequency	Percent
Low Agreement	108	21
Moderate Agreement	80	16
High Agreement	323	63
	Mean = 2.45	N = 511

Table 2. Importance of Coursework in the Exploration of Ethnicity, Culture and Personal Ethnic and Cultural Experiences

Level	Frequency	Percent
Not Important	107	21
Somewhat Important	122	24
Very Important	282	55
	Mean = 2.35	N = 511

Part III – Predicting the Value of Personal Counseling in Developing Cultural Competence

Table 1 indicates agreement with the premise that the development of cultural competence can be facilitated through a student’s involvement in personal counseling. Given this finding, it was of interest to the researchers to discover what factors influence this opinion among student respondents. Table 3 presents the results of the regression of

perceptions concerning the need for personal counseling, on multiple independent variables for the entire student sample. Eleven variables in the equation accounted for about sixty-two percent (62%) of the variance in the dependent variable.

Table 3. Regression of Students' Perception of the Need for Personal Counseling on Multiple Independent Variables (n = 502)

Variable	B	Beta	Sig. T.
Seeking personal counseling is a matter that should be decided by each prospective student.	-.092	-.109	.025
Earning good grades is the most important aspect of my professional development.	-.53	-.138	.000
Personal counseling as a program requirement is unethical.	-.109	-.159	.003
On the basis of my racial/ethnic background, I may harbor negative opinions about different racial and ethnic groups.	.150	.311	.000
Gender (male, female)*	.307	.801	.000
Students could best benefit from personal counseling with a person from their own race.	.137	.055	.007
An important aspect of personal counseling should be to help students become aware of personal issues or beliefs they may hold regarding racial diversity.	.112	.147	.019
I know several students in the program that have expressed negative views pertaining to people of color, minorities and/or gays/lesbians.	.084	.137	.000
I am in favor of personal counseling to increase my ability to work with diverse groups if the information I disclose is kept confidential and not released to faculty.	.010	.103	.000
Class rank (Graduate student)*	-.279	-.811	.027
Counseling student*	.301	.696	.004

R Squared = .618, Sig. F = .0000

*Social characteristic item.

The content of the statements and the direction of the scales provide a framework for understanding the conditions under which students may feel that personal counseling is warranted in developing

cultural competence. The framework consists of four categories: (1) self-determination and voluntary decision-making, (2) academic factors, (3) remarkable encounters with race and diversity, and (4) demographic factors. The results of the regression analysis are presented to highlight the direction of the items and the significant relationships.

Self-determination and decision-making ability. When students can be assured that the information they disclose during counseling sessions will not be released to school faculty or administration and when they feel they can select their own therapist (perhaps one that is of the same ethnic background as themselves), they are more likely to value the role of personal counseling in helping to facilitate their development of cultural competence. It is likewise important that personal counseling be a requirement of all students and individual students are not given the decision-making power to opt out of the personal counseling experience.

Academic factors. When students view earning good grades as the most important measure of their professional development, they are less likely to support a program requirement of personal counseling in becoming more culturally competent. Additionally, when students view the requirement of personal counseling as unethical, they are unlikely to support a policy that would encourage them to obtain personal counseling to help them develop cultural competence.

Remarkable encounters with race and diversity. When students report having had a background that created negative opinions about race and ethnicity, when they believe that personal counseling should be used to help students identify personal issues or beliefs that they hold regarding racial diversity and when they know several students in the program who they believe have expressed negative sentiments concerning people of color, minorities and/or gays/lesbians, they value the idea of personal counseling for all students.

Demographic factors. When students are counseling majors or female, they tend to agree more with the value of personal counseling for all students in an effort to facilitate cultural competence. Graduate students are less supportive of the value of personal counseling.

Part IV – Predicting the Perceptions of Ethnicity, Culture and Personal Ethnic/Cultural Experiences in Developing Cultural Competence

Table 4 contains the results of the regression analysis for variables that predict students' (n = 499) perceptions of the importance of course work in exploring ethnicity, culture and personal ethnic and cultural experiences toward developing cultural competence. This model, which contains 13 independent variables, accounted for 53% of the explained variance in the dependent variable. Again, the findings can be used as a

framework to understand students' perceptions about the potential influence that course work has in facilitating an exploration of ethnicity, culture and personal ethnic and cultural experiences toward their becoming more culturally competent. This particular framework consists of the following five sets of variables: (1) external socio-cultural sensitivity, (2) internal socio-cultural sensitivity, (3) insight-orientation, (4) interpersonal conditions, and (5) demographic factors.

Table 4. Regression of Students' Perception of the Importance of Coursework in the Exploration of Ethnicity, Culture and Personal Ethnic/Cultural Experiences on Multiple Independent Variables (n = 499)

Variable	B	Beta	Sig. T.
American culture has negatively influenced my thoughts and feelings about culturally diverse individuals and groups.	.096	.153	.000
During my childhood I received negative messages about culturally diverse individuals and groups.	.111	.141	.000
My conservative religious background may have an adverse impact on my ability to work effectively with culturally diverse individuals and groups.	.307	.472	.000
I can recognize when I am behaving in a culturally biased manner.	-.052	-.139	.003
I sense a lack of confidence in myself when working with culturally diverse individuals and groups.	.030	.092	.000
I believe the media has strongly influenced my perceptions about people from culturally diverse groups.	.112	.077	.000
My ethnicity/race determines how people perceive who and what I am.	.057	.114	.007
I believe people achieve in this society based on their own merits and that the notion of "privilege" is somewhat of a myth.	-.060	-.121	.007
A person's race is not important to me (i.e., I do not judge a person by their race).	.251	.307	.002
I can be close friends with a culturally diverse individual.	.003	.098	.050
Ethnicity*	.079	.121	.012
Class rank (Graduate student)*	-.108	-.161	.009
Counseling student*	.006	.078	.019

R Squared = .527, Sig. F = .0000

*Social characteristic item.

External socio-cultural sensitivity. When students are cognizant of the impact of certain external socio-cultural factors on their lives, they are more likely to concede the importance of the role of coursework in developing cultural competence. For example, when students believe that American culture may have negatively influenced their thoughts about culturally diverse individuals and when they recognize the influence of the media in shaping their perceptions of cultural diversity, they view coursework as very important in determining a person's ability to become culturally competent. Likewise, when students disagree with the premise that "privilege" does not exist and when they agree with the statement that people are judged based on ethnicity/race, they are inclined to understand how coursework becomes critical in predicting whether a helping professional can become culturally competent.

Internal socio-cultural sensitivity. When students concede that they had negative childhood experiences as related to diversity or that they are products of a conservative religious background, their ability to understand how important coursework is to exploring ethnicity, culture and personal ethnic and cultural experiences toward the development of cultural competence increases.

Insight orientation. Insight into one's behavior as it relates to cultural diversity, influenced students' perceptions about the importance of coursework in developing cultural competence. For example, students view their lack of confidence in working with culturally diverse individuals and groups as a signal that coursework does have a significant role in one's ability to become culturally competent. Since many students find they are not always able to determine when they are behaving in a culturally biased manner, they agree with the significance of exploring ethnicity, culture and personal ethnic and cultural experiences via coursework in determining their likelihood of developing cultural competence.

Interpersonal conditions. Students who are able to forge close relationships with culturally diverse individuals and students who do not use race as a way to judge others, believe that coursework is very important in one's ability to develop cultural competence.

Demographic factors. White students' views on the importance of coursework in exploring ethnicity, culture and personal ethnic and cultural experiences in facilitating cultural competence did not differ from those of students of color. However, when the student's major was counseling, his/her view on the importance of coursework in developing cultural competence, increased. Similarly, when the class rank was "undergraduate," the belief that coursework shapes one's ability to become culturally competent increased.

Discussion and Implications

For the most part, the independent variable relationships with the value of personal counseling were in the expected direction (see Part III). However, of note is the variable “class rank.” It was not expected that graduate students would be less inclined to value the use of personal counseling to acquire cultural competence. Also unexpected was the finding that such socio-demographic variables as ethnicity and religion do not influence perceptions about the role/value of personal counseling in facilitating cultural competence. With respect to class rank, perhaps graduate students do not favor the use of personal counseling as a means to achieving cultural competence because they view the activity as yet another requirement in an already full degree program. Graduate students may be busier than undergraduates because of the demands placed on them by family and work life. Another way of looking at this finding is to consider the fact that many graduate students financially support their own education and the requirement of personal counseling might lengthen the time they spend in school. Still, one more way of understanding the difference between graduates and undergraduates might be the idea that because graduate students tend to be older and more psychologically mature than undergraduates, they could be more self-aware and may be further along the continuum of acquiring cultural competence. In short, it might be reasonable to assume that like undergraduates, graduate students value the use of personal counseling to achieve cultural competence; but they do not want the additional program burden.

In terms of the socio-demographic variable “religion,” statistically significant differences may not have been discernable given the manner in which this instrument item was worded. The issue of instrument wording is further discussed in the Limitations section. In terms of the difference found in the variable degree program, perhaps there is a predisposition to respond in the affirmative for the use of personal counseling when a person is him/herself training to become a counselor.

Finally, the fact that there was no difference between students of color and white students regarding the use of personal counseling in becoming culturally competent, could be framed from a strengths perspective. Perhaps because both groups are majoring in a helping profession, they are more alike than different with respect to their values, beliefs and worldviews.

Like the Personal Counseling Model, the variables, which comprise the model for “exploration of ethnicity, culture and personal ethnic and cultural experiences via coursework”, are in the expected direction (see Part IV). However, once again the findings related to demographic

variables are not as easily understood. Like the “personal counseling” model, class rank and major play a role in predicting students’ perception of the importance of exploring ethnicity, culture and personal ethnic and cultural experiences, via coursework, in fostering cultural competence. Again, counseling students were more likely than social work students to concede the importance of coursework that permits the exploration of ethnicity, culture and personal ethnic and cultural experiences as an influence in developing cultural competence. Further, undergraduate status, once again, predicted opinions (favorable) about the importance of coursework in becoming culturally competent.

The finding related to class rank was surprising because it is counterintuitive. In other words, one would expect graduate students to be more academically sophisticated and as a result, more likely to value coursework as being relevant to the development of cultural competence. The authors are not sure why there is a difference between graduate and undergraduates in this category but one possible explanation might be because of the sequences of courses. Perhaps because undergraduates are in the midst of satisfying the Humanities requirement (e.g., culture, art, religion) they are more sensitive to topics related to diversity than graduate students who may just be enrolled in one required multicultural course. Also, at the university where this study took place, undergraduate students are required to complete several hours in multicultural or international coursework above and beyond the requirements of their degree program.

The fact that differences between counseling and social work majors were found warrants a bit more consideration. The authors believe that a possible reason for the difference between counseling and social work students with respect to their views on the importance of coursework might be influenced by professors in the respective departments. Because this is cross-sectional research, some of the findings could be explained from a situational standpoint. In other words, during the semesters of this particular study, could counseling students have been under the tutelage of instructors who had a greater influence on their opinions (favorably) than the social work students? Multiple explanations for this finding are possible.

Policy and Admission Implications

This study explored students’ perceptions of the importance of receiving personal counseling in an effort to become more culturally competent and their opinions about the need to examine their ethnicity, culture and personal ethnic and cultural experiences through coursework. Support for the need for both personal counseling and coursework

was found. Yet, social work, human services and counseling programs tend to focus exclusively on delivering coursework and give little consideration to requiring personal counseling. The findings related to personal counseling point to significant policy and admission considerations. These data focus attention on students' self-examinations, which reveal that they can benefit from counseling support in order to "undo" the negative socialization associated with race, culture and ethnicity they may have received.

Study results support a framework that includes four critical variables: (1) self-determination and decision-making ability, (2) academic factors, (3) encounters with race and diversity, and (4) demographic factors. Taken together, an interpretation of this framework suggests that programs may want to consider having students complete cultural self-assessment inventories upon admission. Such inventories would position the students to answer questions concerning encounters with race and diversity issues. These inventories can increase students' determination of whether they can benefit from personal counseling. All students could be offered this opportunity. Students could choose their own counseling experience and the results of the experience would not need to be reported to program officials. The completion of such inventories need not be a condition of admission; instead, they should be framed as an ethical responsibility of professionals who seek to enhance their level of professionalism. The inventories could be completed early in a student's matriculation, and depending upon the results, a student could participate in an advising session where he/she is informed that in addition to coursework, personal counseling is recommended as a means of acquiring skills in cultural competence. Again, such an approach should not be punitive and personal counseling should not be a requirement for graduation. Instead, personal counseling is yet one more tool that a student can use to increase his/her abilities with respect to cultural competence.

Another way of interjecting the use of personal counseling as a means to achieve cultural competence might be via supervision, which is a critical component of many social work, human services and counseling education programs (Leong & Wagner, 1994; Page, 2003; Utsey, Hammar, & Gernat, 2005). The supervisory relationship is often perceived by the student as safe; therefore, it is perceived as a venue for revealing those elements of him or herself that require some growth. The authors are not suggesting that the supervisory relationship be transformed into a therapeutic one; instead, what is suggested is that field supervisors could encourage the use of personal counseling as a means for acquiring proficiency in cultural competence.

Curriculum and Practice Implications

This study suggests that insight-oriented coursework still has a role in helping students realize the importance of culture, ethnicity and personal ethnic and cultural experiences in becoming more culturally competent. In addition, the study's findings may add to the arena of cultural competency measurement. New tools for measuring acquired cultural competency skills (Boyle & Springer, 2001; Kohli, 2004) have been advanced, yet the field continues to search for measures that can be used to determine a practitioner's level of cultural competence. Elements found in the regression model could potentially provide a direction for the development of instruments that attempt to measure the acquisition and demonstration of cultural competence. Certainly there is precedent within the field for the use of such instruments (Holcomb-McCoy, 2004). The absence of some of the internal and external socio-cultural sensitivities found in this study may suggest that a practitioner does not possess a minimal level of cultural competence. The respondents in this study expressed the belief that one has to have the ability to concede the influence of certain life circumstances on one's behavior as it relates to an understanding of racial bias and culture. Given this fact, it can be argued that the inability to do so might mean that a student is in the very early stage of skill development. This notion could be tested out against some of the "stage" (Manoleas, 1994) or "continuum" (Devore & Schlesinger, 1996) models present in the literature base. Finally, perhaps the field can disentangle the effects of personal counseling on cultural competence by comparing groups that receive combinations of personal counseling and coursework versus those that only receive coursework.

Limitations of the Study

The results of this study may not generalize to the broader population given the use of a convenience sample and the self reporting of data. However, the large sample size may offset some of these effects. The new tool used in this study yielded high test-retest reliability values and was developed from a rigorous multi-step inductive process. Still, the properties of the tool should be further established through additional testing. In future revisions to the tool there will be a need to restructure some of the wording, particularly in the demographic questions (e.g., "religion"). Given the large number of respondents who checked "other" as a religious category and wrote in such religions as Evangelical, the authors believe that the respondents may not have known that Protestant encompasses many of the categories that were written in under the heading of "other."

Summary and Conclusion

The study's findings suggest that from the perspective of future practitioners, the field may have missed an added method for increasing cultural competence in social work, human services and counseling professionals; namely, the use of personal counseling. However, further research is needed to determine if personal counseling does in fact increase practitioners' cultural competency skills. Recent research (Cuevas, 2004) joins the longstanding call for the field to determine whether educational strategies really increase cultural competence. In part, this study responds to that call and it also suggests that there is a need for future research to uncover tools that measure the development of cultural competence as a result of participation in personal counseling.

References

- Abreu, J. M., Chung, R. H. G., & Atkinson, D. R. (2000). Multicultural counseling training: Past, present, and future directions. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 28(5), 641-656.
- Agresta, J. (2004). Professional role perceptions of school social workers, psychologists, and counselors. *Children & Schools*, 26(3), 151-163.
- American Counseling Association. (1997). *Definition of Professional Counseling*. Retrieved July 18, 2008, from <http://www.counseling.org/Counselors/>
- Aponte, C. I. (1995). *Cultural diversity coursework model: Cultural competence for content and process*. *Arete*, 20(1), 46-55.
- Arredondo, P., Toporek, R., Brown, S. P., Jones, J., Locke, D. C., Sanchez, J., & Stadler, H. (1996). Operationalization of multicultural counseling competencies. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 24, 42-78.
- Boyle, D. P., & Springer, A. (2001). Toward a cultural competence measure for social work with specific populations. *Journal of Ethnic & Cultural Diversity in Social Work*, 9(3-4), 53-71.
- Brinson, J. A., Brew, L., & Denby, R. (2008). Real life scenarios and complimentary lectures: A classroom training approach to increase counselor awareness, knowledge, and skill. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 86, 11-17.
- Brinson, J. A., & Kottler, J. (1995). Minority students' underutilization of university counseling centers. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling*, 17(2), 371-386.
- Brinson, J. A. (1996). Cultural sensitivity: Our challenge for the 21st century. *Journal of Humanistic Education and Development*, 34, 89-97.
- Brown, M. T., & Landrum-Brown, J. (1995). Counselor supervision: Cross-cultural Perspectives. In J. Ponterotto, J. M. Casa, L. Suzuki & C. Alexander (Eds.), *Handbook of Multicultural Counseling* (pp. 263-286). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Callaway, Y., Ametrano, I. M., & Stickel, S. A. (1999, October). *Training culturally competent counselors: Can we meet the challenge*. Paper

presented at the National Conference of the Association for Counselor Education and Supervision, New Orleans, Louisiana.

- Carter, R. T. (1995). *The influence of race and racial identity in psychotherapy: Toward a racially inclusive model*. New York: Wiley.
- Carter, R. T. (2003). Becoming racially and culturally competent: The racial-cultural counseling laboratory. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling & Development*, 31(1), 20-30.
- Council on Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP). (2009 Draft). *CACREP Standards Revision*. Retrieved July 18, 2008, from <http://www.cacrep.org/StandardsRevisionText.html>
- Council on Social Work Education (CSWE). (2008). *Educational Policy and Accreditation Standards (EPAS)*. Retrieved July 21, 2008, from <http://www.cswe.org/CSWE/accreditation/>
- Council for Standards in Human Service Education (CSHSE). (2005). *National Standards*. Retrieved on July 18, 2008, from <http://www.cshse.org/>
- Corey, G., Corey, M. S., & Callanan, P. (1988). *Issues and ethics in the helping professions* (3rd ed.). Pacific Grove, CA: Brooks/Cole.
- Cuevas, M. C. (2004). Cultural competence, cultural awareness and attitudes of social work students. *Dissertation Abstracts International: The Humanities and Social Sciences*, 64(7), 2.
- D'Andrea, M., & Daniels, J. (1992). *Do the leaders of counselor education programs think graduate students should be required to participate in personal counseling: The results of a national survey*. (Retrieved from the ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 349 508).
- Devore, W., & Schlesinger, E. G. (1996). *Ethnic sensitive social work practice* (4th ed.). Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Downs, L. L. (2000). *A study of the outcomes of required counseling during counselor training at a CACREP accredited university*. (Retrieved from the ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. CG030227).
- Fouad, N. A., Hains, A., & Davis, J. L. (1990). Factors in students' endorsement of counseling as a requirement for graduation from a counseling program. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 29(4), 268-274.
- Greene, G. (1996). A constructivist perspective on clinical social work practice with ethnically diverse clients. *Social Work*, 41(2), 172-180.
- Greene, R. R., & Watkins, M. (Eds.). (1998). *Serving diverse constituencies: Applying the ecological perspective*. New York: Aldine De Gruyter.
- Heppner, P. P. (2006). The benefits and challenges of becoming cross-culturally competent counseling psychologists: Presidential address. *Counseling Psychologist*, 34(1), 147-172.
- Holcomb-McCoy, C. (2004). Assessing the multicultural competence of school counselors: A checklist. *Professional School Counseling*, 7(3), 178-183.
- Kadushin, A. (1976). *Supervision in Social Work*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Kohli, H. K. (2004). Building an assessment model to measure cultural competence in graduating social work students. *Dissertation Abstracts International: The Humanities and Social Sciences*, 65(1), 2.

- Krajewski-Jaime, E. R. (1993, March 31 – April 3). *Developing cultural competence in human service providers*. Paper presented at the Eastern Michigan University Conference on Languages and Communications for World Business and the Professions. Ypsilanti, Michigan. (ERIC Clearinghouse on Counseling and Student Services. Reproduction Service No. ED371262)
- Leong, F., & Wagner, N. S. (1994). Cross-cultural counseling supervision: What do we know? What do we need to know? *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 34(2), 117-131.
- Lum, D. (1999). *Culturally competent practice: A framework for growth and action*. Monterey, CA: Brooks/Cole.
- Manoleas, P. (1994). An outcome approach to assessing the cultural competence of M.S.W. students. *Journal of Multicultural Social Work*, 3(1), 43-57.
- Merchant, M., & Haslett, D. C. (2000). Educating for cultural competence via collaborative groups: A tale of two programs. *Journal of Baccalaureate Social Work*, 6(1), 95-107.
- Page, M. L. (2003). Race, culture, and the supervisory relationship. *Journal of Curriculum and Supervision*, 18(2), 161-174.
- Ponterotto, J. G. (1997). Multicultural counseling training: A competency model and national survey. In D. B. Pope-Davis & H. L. K. Coleman (Eds.), *Multicultural aspects of counseling series: Vol. 7 Multicultural counseling competencies: Assessments, education and training and supervision* (pp. 111-130). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Ponterotto, J. G., Alexander, C. M., & Grieger, I. (1995). A multicultural competency checklist for counseling training programs. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 23, 11-20.
- Post Kammer, P., & Davis, J. (1986). *Are we systematically addressing the personal development of counselor-in-training?* *Wisconsin Counselor*, 2, 7-10.
- Ridley, C. R., Mendoza, D. W., & Kanitz, B. E. (1992). Program designs for multicultural training. *Journal of Psychology and Christianity*, 11, 326-333.
- Ridley, C. R., Mendoza, D. W., & Kanitz, B. E. (1994). Multicultural training: Reexamination, operationalization, and integration. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 22, 227-289.
- Schlesinger, E. G., & Devore, W. (1995). Ethnic sensitive social work practice: The state of the art. *Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare*, 23(1), 29-58.
- Shepard, J. (2003). Learning from the experts: Teaching diversity content and political solidarity through a cultural immersion experience. *The Journal of Baccalaureate Social Work*, 9(1), 41-58.
- Sodowsky, G.R., Taffe, R.C., Gutkin, T., & Wise, S.L. (1994). Development and applications of the Multicultural Counseling Inventory. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 41, 137-148.
- Solomon, B. (1983). Power: The troublesome factor in cross-cultural supervision. *Smith College Studies in Social Work*, 10, 27-83.
- Spears, S. S. (2004). The impact of a cultural competency coursework on the racial identity of MSWs. *Smith College Studies in Social Work*, 74(2), 271-288.

- Sue, D. W. (1981). *Counseling the culturally different: Theory and practice*. New York: Wiley.
- Sue, D. W., Bernier, J. E., Durran, A., Feinberg, L., Pedersen, P., Smith, E. J., & Vasquez-Nuttal, E. (1982). Position paper: Cross-cultural counseling competencies. *The Counseling Psychology*, 109(2), 45-52.
- Sue, D. W., & Sue, D. (1990). *Counseling the culturally different: Theory and practice*, (2nd ed.). New York: Wiley.
- Sue, D., Arredondo, P., & McDavis, R. (1992). Multicultural counseling competencies and standards: A call to the profession. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 7, 477-486.
- Tomlinson-Clarke, S. (2000). Assessing outcomes in a cross-cultural training coursework: A qualitative study. *Counselling Psychology Quarterly*, 13(2), 221-231.
- Utsey, S. O., Hammar, L. M., & Gernat, C. A. (2005). Examining the reactions of White, Black, and Latino/a counseling psychologists to a study of racial issues in counseling and supervision dyads. *Counseling Psychologists*, 33(4), 565-573.
- Van Den Bergh, N., & Crisp, C. (2004). Defining culturally competent practice with sexual minorities: Implications for social work education and practice. *Journal of Social Work Education*, 40(2), 221-238.
- White, P. E., & Franzoni, J. B. (1990). A multidimensional analysis of the mental health of graduate counselors in training. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 29, 258-267.

The Advocacy Project

Linda Wark

Indiana University-Purdue University, Fort Wayne

Abstract

Advocacy has a pronounced presence in human service practice, and exposure to advocacy has an essential place in the education of human services students. The Advocacy Project, a classroom assignment on class advocacy is described here. Students assessed their involvement in The Advocacy Project on both the exposure to the process of class advocacy and collaborative group work in a brief survey. Their responses include evidence that a high number of the student respondents discovered value in class advocacy.

Introduction

A classroom project is presented wherein upper level bachelor's degree students are required to develop a plan and strategies to advocate for a realistic cause in human services. The cause must be for a collection of individuals with similar needs who will benefit apart from everyday casework. Students are assigned to project groups that make a presentation to the remainder of the class and submit a written report on the project. In addition, individual students complete an evaluation of their experience with the project.

Advocacy is a critical element of helping in the human service profession, and it propels the work that we do (Moxley & Thrasher, 1997). Practically speaking, human services professionals will encounter client problems that cannot be resolved with traditional helping skills (Erikson, 2002). Thus, advocacy and human services are intertwined, and undergraduate human service programs must prepare students for effective advocacy efforts (Homan, 2004). Underscoring this necessity is that advocacy is required of members of the National Organization for Human Services (National Organization for Human Services, 1996) (See Appendix A, Principles 13 and 16 in the Ethical Standards of Human Services Professionals) and is required as an important course topic by the accrediting body for human service degree programs (Council for Standards in Human Services Education, 2005). Finally, the national Community Support Skill Standards requires advocacy skills as a separate competency area (Harris, Maloney & Rother, 2004). Unfortunately, few guidelines and resources are available to human services educators to teach and provide socialization in the practice of advocacy.

While the study of advocacy is mandated, it can be difficult to determine how to best manage the requirement. First, time constraints in academic courses are a factor preventing a major investment in the study and practical implementation of advocacy, and it would be unusual to require an entire course on this topic at the undergraduate level. Second, advocacy is also a rich, layered and often lengthy endeavor and making skilled advocates of undergraduates in one course is not a realistic goal. Third, it is possible that faculty may not have enough knowledge of the topic to teach it. Finally, students would be overwhelmed by a full-fledged advocacy effort wherein final outcomes are expected. With regard to these issues, one faculty designed a course assignment that could be managed in one semester and educate students about advocacy. The purpose of this paper is to describe the project and report four semesters of students' experiences with The Advocacy Project as well as their work in student groups.

Advocacy

Advocacy is necessary to bring about change for populations served by human services workers. Despite this, there are minimal resources in the human services literature on advocacy (Eriksen, 2002). Among the multi-topic human services textbooks that were published since 2000, the majority provide only one to a few paragraphs on the topic which typically consists of a general definition of advocacy and the uses of advocacy (Neukrug, 2008; Hull & Mather, 2006; Woodside & McClam, 2006; Harris, Maloney & Rother, 2004; Mehr & Kanwischer, 2004; Brill & Levine, 2002). Kirst-Ashman & Hull (2006) dedicate one chapter to advocacy, and Ragg (2006) inserts twelve pages. One comprehensive non-textbook on advocacy directed toward human services professionals is *Advocacy in Human Services* (Ezell, 2001) and is used in conjunction with the course assignment described in this article. Another non-textbook, *Advocacy Skills* (Bateman, 1995), is a good adjunct resource. Articles in human service professional journals are also scarce. Among these journal articles, only one describes classroom activities that promote an understanding of advocacy and its implementation (Eriksen, 2002). This author details a seven-stage model for advocacy and offers classroom teaching strategies. The project described in the present article expands the options in teaching strategies for class advocacy.

Class Advocacy: A Sub-Type of Advocacy

General definitions of advocacy in the literature vary but only slightly. There are several common components of existing definitions. First, advocacy is with and/or on behalf of clients. Clients' perspectives

are considered and implemented in the advocacy effort (Brill & Levine, 2002). Second, there are client needs that cannot be met without assistance. Human service professionals are able to use resources such as education, time, money or contacts to obtain what clients need (Lieberman & Lester, 2004). Third, professionals make the needs known to community leaders and legislators. Using activities such as lobbying and policy-making, professionals create opportunities for larger change (Haynes & Mickelson, 2000).

There are sub-types of advocacy in the literature that vary widely, and some are associated with particular professions such as medicine or law (Bateman, 1995). In the human service profession, advocacy efforts have been categorized as legal, political, social or rights advocacy (Bateman, 1995), legislative, agency or community advocacy (Ezell, 2001), but there appears to be no profession-wide definitions. Class advocacy, is defined by Ezell (2001) as changing policies or practices on behalf of client groups who share the same problem or status. Cohorts of clients who need social action are more likely than not to be comprised of people with less power and fewer capacities (Moxley & Thrasher, 1997), and, thus, common to class advocacy is the drive to correct oppression and inequalities. In The Advocacy Project, students learn to distinguish between advocacy in case management with one family, individual, or small group of clients and class advocacy (Kirst-Ashman & Hull, 2006) for a class of clients, some or all with whom the advocate may not work personally (Ezell, 2001). Class advocacy was selected as the focus for The Advocacy Project because it involves front-line professionals and connects their everyday frustrations to broader change. Class advocacy provides a vehicle for the everyday practitioner to influence the unmet needs of their clients and the gaps and inconsistencies in service delivery systems. Finally, front-line practitioners are critical to broader change, having knowledge that administrators and policy makers do not (Ragg, 2006).

The Project

The learning goals of the Advocacy Project are the following: 1) to be exposed to class advocacy strategies through active learning; and 2) to gain experience in collaborative work. This paper describes the methods for the project and reports the evaluation of four semesters of student groups. Examples of topics, also called causes, of the advocacy projects are preventing abuse and neglect in foster families; physical access for persons with disabilities; improving state funded financial support for non-traditional age students; home health care for elders; and increasing community acceptance of persons with mental illness.

The assignment is embedded in a course with topics related to generalist methods for human services settings. The course is taken one time and is required for the bachelor's degree in human services, and this course is the first time that students are exposed, more than superficially, to advocacy. Coverage of the section on advocacy is approximately one-fourth of a semester length course. However, due to needed time to develop the presentation and report, the project extends across the semester with preparation occurring early, work continuing throughout the semester, and presentations and reports given late in the semester. At the beginning of the semester, the class of students, typically in their junior year, is randomly divided into groups of three to no more than six students. The size of the groups varies with the total course enrollment. Groups should be small enough to prevent dealing with the logistics of the group more than the project tasks (Grayson H. Walker Teaching Resource Center, 2006). Students also read from Ezell (2001), discuss sections of it on days when the groups do not meet, and use the book as one resource for the project. With ten chapters total, chapters one through three and eight through ten are assigned to the whole class for discussion and classroom activities. The information in these chapters cover topics such as: 1) motivation for advocacy; 2) a definition of advocacy; 3) ethical issues in advocacy; 4) preparing for advocacy; 5) coordinating the components of advocacy; and 6) personal qualities and skills that assist successful advocacy. Chapters four through seven describe four components of advocacy: agency advocacy, legislative advocacy, legal advocacy, and community advocacy. These four components of advocacy must be addressed in each group's advocacy project.

Student Work in Groups

Nearly all class advocacy efforts in human services involve more than one person due to the amount of work generated in the process (Gibelman & Kraft, 1996). Having several people on an advocacy team supports the cause through the unique assets of each member (Quinn, 1996). In addition, undergraduate students are still acquiring skills to work effectively in collaborative groups and are learning to manage problems in groups such as dealing with student members who don't work as much as the other members or distributing work equitably (McCorkle, Reardon, Alexander, Kling, Harris, & Vishwanathan Iyer, 1999). Finally, the hands-on learning approach on the project simulates a realistic work environment (Henke, 1985) and thereby prevents passive learning. For these reasons, a group project was assigned as the primary means to learn about advocacy. Students are given four full class meeting times (five hours) to work with their groups with addition-

al meetings outside of class scheduled by the groups as needed. When class time is provided to work on group projects, students have a more positive attitude toward them (Pfaff & Huddleston, 2003). Because the second goal of the advocacy project is to encourage collaboration, individual students negotiate with the others in the group to choose one advocacy cause and to share the work. The instructor provides possible causes, but each group can select any topic.

Most undergraduate students are inexperienced in making group work effective, and faculty oversight is indicated for a positive outcome (Barr, Dixon, & Gassenheimer, 2005). In The Advocacy Project, structure is provided in two ways. First, the instructor assigns specific tasks for each group meeting that is scheduled during class time (see Appendix B for an outline of the tasks for each group meeting). Second, the instructor checks in with groups as they work during the four class meetings, inquiring about progress and answering questions. During the faculty observation of the groups, students who dominate groups can be monitored, and faculty can support students who are not making verbal contributions (Barr, Dixon, & Gassenheimer, 2005).

All randomly assigned groups of students contain those who make dedicated contributions and others who do not (McCorkle, Reardon, Alexander, Kling, Harris & Vishwanathan Iyer, 1999). To encourage accountability among group members, a deadline is met to submit a contract to the instructor that is signed by each member (Barr, Dixon, & Gassenheimer, 2005). The instructor gives instructions on five types of content that must be included in the contract: a) the expectations of group members in all aspects of the project; b) how progress will be measured; c) what steps should be taken if a student is absent from a group meeting; d) how the work will be shared equitably; and e) how conflict will be handled. Students have control over any additional content and the format of the contract.

At the time of the group presentations, students submit a written report that includes the work each of them did for the project and their evaluation of each student in the group (Barr, Dixon, & Gassenheimer, 2005). Students are graded both on the group and individual contributions made. Sixty percent of the grade is allocated for individual contributions, and 40% is for the group effort. Evaluation of the process and outcome of the project is also expected in the report.

Student Assessment of The Advocacy Project: Methods and Analysis

Participants

Across four semesters of data collection, there were forty-four female and two male students, yielding a total of 46 students. One of these students was Latino; eight were African-American; one was of mixed racial heritage; and thirty-four were Caucasian. The total number of participants was small due to small class size in a new program.

Data Collection and Analysis

The two learning goals for the students were to be exposed to class advocacy strategies and to gain experience in collaborative work. To assess the accomplishment of the two goals, a questionnaire with four open-ended questions was administered at the end of the each of the four semesters. This questionnaire is not graded, and each student completed the questionnaire anonymously. The four questions follow: 1) What would you say were the two most important things that you learned by completing The Advocacy Project?; 2) How likely are you to get involved in advocacy in the future? Why?; 3) What did you do that made it easy to work with the group?; 4) What was the hardest thing about working with your group? Questions 1) and 2) were related to the first goal of the project and Questions 3) and 4) were related to the second goal of the project. The department secretary typed the anonymous, handwritten responses, and the author conducted the analysis.

A text analysis was used wherein the researcher's task is to determine key themes such that the values and opinions of the writer (i.e., students) are reflected in their experience (i.e., with The Advocacy Project) (Peräkylä, 2006). The author followed the hallmarks of qualitative research (Spencer, Ritchie, & O'Connor, 2003) in that the ideas of the researcher during analysis were grounded in the data; the analysis permitted within and between case searches; the data was sorted to create order; and the data was reduced to a synthesis of all of the texts without a loss of original meaning of the data. The data were the responses to the four questions. Each of the questions was analyzed separately, and all of the data was coded into the key themes.

Findings: Students' Evaluations to Exposure to Class Advocacy

Question One

In response to Question 1, "What would you say were the two most important things that you learned from doing The Advocacy Project?" the participants' responses were identified in six categories. In the first category, Teamwork, there were a small number of responses

wherein students reflected on the team experience. For example, one student noted that everyone on the advocacy team can be focused on the same problems but have many perspectives. A second student said that she learned a lot about teamwork.

In the second category, *The Value of Advocacy*, students projected a sense that advocacy is a worthwhile endeavor. For example, one student made note of how important it is. A second student expressed, “It is definitely a process that is not to be taken lightly or half-baked.” A third student noted, “I learned that even doing a small project can get advocacy going. After doing this project, I now receive information, calls, and emails about the cause which proved that small efforts can give birth to newer and larger ideas.” A fourth student learned how advocacy could affect her or someone that she knew. Her group’s project involved a plan to advocate with the state government for changes in financial aid term limits for university students. The group discovered that the older a non-traditional age student is, the less likely he/she is to receive financial aid. One student wrote, “The first most important thing that I learned from doing the advocacy project was just how much of an impact it had on us students personally. One of the students in our group was denied funding for school because of her age....”

The third category, *Specific Information Related to the Advocacy Cause*, was a grouping of topical information learned by the students. While this category may seem mundane, the Advocacy Project provided enthusiasm for topics that students might otherwise have to force themselves to learn as facts for an exam. For example, “Seeing the real effort that is behind getting a bill changed, having policies changed. It always looks so easy, now that I am more aware of the dedication that those people (grassroots lobbyists for legislative change) have. Another student said, “The legal steps that are involved with Medicare and Medicaid. I had no idea that the elderly populations will grow that fast.” A third student noted that lawyers are sometimes necessary to help advocacy causes.

The fourth category, *Preparation*, provided evidence that students were grasping the foundation necessary to effectively set up an advocacy effort. There was an awareness among the students that research is an essential part of preparation. Said one student, “Research/home-work/mapping strategies are critical. How much research is involved to thoroughly know your subject and which position to take.” Another student stated, “You have to spend time in research and time getting to know if there is a need for change. You have to know what steps need to be done to get change. It’s not the same for every type of project.” A third example is a student who asserted, “You really need to know your

topic and gather the knowledge necessary to do a good job.”

The fifth category, Professional Development, contained self-reflective statements. Students learned to take new perspectives. They discovered that they had a desire to assist a cause. “I’m more aware of myself now,” said one student. Another said, “Working on behalf of a population of children who have been caught in a sad situation was rewarding. I only wish it could have really impacted them somehow... maybe some day.” A third student related, “I learned to talk about legislation in a non-intimidating way. There are so many processes, that it may seem overwhelming at times, but now I am comfortable presenting on legislation.”

By far, the greatest number of responses was related to the sixth category, Commitment and Hard Work. Students concluded that patience, endurance and resolve are required to be successful. Advocacy is typically a lengthy process, and, in the end, you may not get the results for which you worked. Examples from four students are: “Advocacy is hard – challenging work and probably not for everyone, although there is a place in advocacy for everyone because of all the different levels of involvement;” “How complicated and long the process of advocacy can be and is;” “What a long process it is. You can’t skip steps if you want things done right;” and “Advocacy could take a long time, and you need to remember the small accomplishments.”

Question Two

In response to Question 2, “How likely are you to get involved in advocacy in the future? Why?”, were categorized according to likelihood of being involved with advocacy in the future. More than 90% of the responses were categorized as “High Likelihood.” The three responses here represent this category. “Very; because my belief is we all need a voice at times in our lives; if not for ourselves then for others,” said one student. Second, “Wow” I feel that what I’ve learned about advocacy is a culmination of all my interest, skills, and passions! And I’ve learned that I’ve been doing bits and pieces of this my whole life. Now I have the “book knowledge” to put it all together – provided I find the right job.” Third, “I am very likely, it is how our world can change positively, so if I do it, and teach my children how to do it then there would be three more advocates in the world, and we need all the advocates we can get.”

The remaining two responses reflected conditional future involvement. For example, involvement would be based on whether an employer provided time, if children of the students were older or if childcare was available. For example, one student wrote, “Likely, but it would

be later on since I don't have anybody for my little girls and don't have enough time as it is tight now. If I get involved, I want to be dedicated and have extra time to spend on my cause than to do things half way."

Findings: Students' Evaluations of Collaborative Group Work

Question Three

In response to Question 3: "What did you do that made it easy to work with a group?", five categories emerged. The first, Tried to Be Helpful, revealed a collaborative spirit in the responses. One student "listed and offered help in ways to research." Another student, "...tried to make myself available – we met once without (name of student) so I emailed her an outline of what we discussed and some of the changes we made and asked her opinion."

In the second category, several students viewed themselves as being Flexible. "I really tried to be flexible with the group because of our conflict in schedule. Flexibility is not very easy for me," said one student. Another student remarked, "Being flexible when it came to meeting as a group and doing whatever responsibility they gave me to do."

In the third category, Completed Specific Tasks, the focus was on practical tasks that made contributions to the project. One student made a PowerPoint and gave everyone a part of it for the presentation. Another student did a lot of research and distributed it among the group members "since we were all a team."

The fourth category, Collaborative and Cooperative, emphasized a spirit of both that is evident in these examples. First, "I allowed others to take some lead, instead of suggesting all options. All together we have many ideas that add to making a group project more effective." Also, "I asked what the group would like for me to do. I did what was expected of me. Finally, "I stayed in contact with my group members through email/phone for input on my part to see if they want more information. I attended all group meetings."

One student realized that Using Humor and Fun was helpful to the group process. "We used a sense of humor! It made the project fun and not seem like work."

Question Four

In response to Question 4, "What was the hardest thing about working with your group?" students provided honest and reflective answers. In the first category, Coordinating Information for the Classroom Presentation, some students needed help with the big picture of the presentation. As one student put it, "It is difficult to see the whole picture when doing one part of the presentation." Another student said, "Putting

together all of the overwhelming information that we obtained.”

In the second category, *Wanting Things My Own Way*, two honest students were able to understand what might get in the way of effective group processes. “Allowing others to lead! I just seem to be a born leader and in groups I somehow just gravitate to that! Many times now I back off and let others lead and sometimes they do – like in the case of our group, and sometimes I have to because no one else will,” said one student. Another expressed, “I have always worked with the elderly for many years in a variety of ways – it was hard for me to “see” other alternatives when information was given that I thought I was familiar with, and I truly don’t like working in groups where our focus is different.”

The third category, *Finding a Common Schedule to Meet with Group Members*, documented the common problems of coordinating schedules for group meetings outside of class. Students said, “Negotiating a time to meet and discuss things (and making sure that everyone showed up and remembered to be there!”; “Getting together – everyone’s schedules are so crazy!”; “the hardest part was that not all group members could always meet at the same time. We did a lot of compromising on times but we always worked it out.”

Finally, the fourth category, *The Group Process Was Difficult* was supported with comments by four students who indicated that working in a group was a challenge. These students said: “Lack of availability of one member, lack of flexibility of another!”; “Probably not having 100% effort put forth by all members, and having to do work for one of the members.”; “Not being able to truly voice my points.”; “Also, I’d say that we needed to be more collaborative instead of two people being collaborative and giving the leftover work to others. It was kind of hard without open communication.”

Discussion

It was surprising that the first learning goal of *The Advocacy Project* was met with such a positive response. Students were not typically pleased when they learned that the topic, advocacy, was one of the foci of the course. However, the data provides evidence that the author’s goals to instill a desire to engage in advocacy was achieved. This quality of the project inspired the author to continue using it.

The second learning goal, to increase experience in collaborative groups, was also met through the procedures of the assignment. However, student reactions to their work in groups contained both positive and negative responses. Based on year by year reactions of students, the author modified the assignment over time with a special emphasis on structuring the group process and adding student self and group evalu-

ations, providing more in-class time to meet, and a schedule of broad tasks to accomplish with deadlines. The author also used the feedback from students to underscore rewards for team efforts in the grading.

Of course, the study has limitations. Although all of students in each of the classes responded to the survey, the number of respondents is small. In many ways, the author considers this student assessment as a pilot study. Future assessment in this area might include questions related to detailed aspects of the assignment to understand where future improvements could be made. For, example, it would be helpful to know if The Advocacy Project used by other human services programs would develop students with a proclivity to advocate. In addition, it is not known whether the classroom learning will be applied in the students' future human services work positions. Finally, remains to be seen in the author's own community whether or not the skills that the students learned in The Advocacy Project will be embraced as useful by employers.

The Advocacy Project has implications for human service education besides meeting requirements of accreditation standards, codes of ethics, and skills standards. Learning about advocacy connects students to other areas of knowledge relevant to human services such as activism, lobbying, community organizing, and law. In addition, the findings provide impetus to incorporate the project presented here into existing courses. Students are enthused, and faculty educators are likely to be rewarded by the students' products. In addition, the project requires no more effort for busy faculty than most course assignments. Although other course content might have to be sacrificed, the project would not overwhelm most existing courses. Besides the acquisition of new knowledge and skills, a benefit of this particular project is that it provides hands-on learning, an alternative to lectures and tests. Another benefit of this project is to future clients. Skilled advocates can make deeper changes for clients than casework alone. Finally, promoting and implementing advocacy makes the human services profession strong. Human services professionals should be leaders among professions in advocacy efforts. Given the findings, it is unlikely that advocacy will be a peripheral issue for these students in their future work. It will be unfortunate if their future work settings do not permit time and support for their enthusiasm.

Appendix A

Principles 13 and 16 of the Ethical Standards of Human Services Professionals

STATEMENT 13: Human service professionals act as advocates in addressing unmet client and community needs. Human service pro-

professionals provide a mechanism for identifying unmet client needs, calling attention to these needs, and assisting in planning and mobilizing to advocate for those needs at the local community level.

STATEMENT 16: Human service professionals advocate for the rights of all members of society, particularly those who are members of minorities and groups at which discriminatory practices have historically been directed.

Appendix B

The Advocacy Project: Tasks to Complete in Class Meetings

Meeting One (During Week One of Course)

1. Make introductions of group members. Exchange contact information. Exchange any personal stories about advocacy (does not have to be associated with paid employment.)
2. Choose the advocacy cause for the project. Notify the instructor of your topic during week two (see due date in syllabus).
3. Discuss the values that each student has towards group work.
4. Establish the norms and expectations of the group members. Develop a draft of the contract that will be due during week two (see due date in syllabus).
5. Set goals for the next time that you meet (during week two).

Meeting Two (During Week Two of Course)

1. With your advocacy cause in mind, define the problem that requires change through advocacy.
2. Submit the contract with signatures of each group member.
3. Develop a plan of action to prepare for the assigned presentation. What tasks must be done to prepare for the presentation?
4. Set dates to meet outside of class. Set deadlines for tasks.

Class Meeting Three (During Week Eight of Course)

1. Complete mid-term survey on: 1) tasks completed by individual group members; and 2) group relations.
2. By this week, you should have established your advocacy strategies related to legislative, legal, agency and community advocacy. What remains to be completed?
3. Discuss how the focus of advocacy is related to the evolving project. Keep in mind that you are not only reporting information but you are also advancing advocacy.
4. Provide instructor with a list of media equipment needs for presentation.

5. Assign writing tasks for the report.
6. Discuss areas of disagreement and concern.
7. Review what remains to be done.

Class Meeting Four (During Week Thirteen of Course)

1. Provide instructor with written report as outlined in the instructions for the project.
2. Finalize preparations for presentation.

References

- Barr, T. F., Dixon, A. L., & Gassenheimer, J. B. (2005). Exploring the “Lone Wolf” phenomenon in students teams. *Journal of Marketing Education*, 27(1), 81-90.
- Bateman, N. (1995). *Advocacy skills: A handbook for human service professionals*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate.
- Brill, N., & Levine, J. (2002). *Working with people: The helping process*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Council for Standards in Human Services Education (2005). *CSHSE National Standards*. Retrieved on May 22, 2007, from <http://www.cshse.org>
- Erickson, K. (2002). Beyond case management and counseling: Teaching human service students to create change through advocacy. *Human Service Education: A Journal of the National Organization for Human Services*, 22, 47-63.
- Ezell, M. (2001). *Advocacy in the human services*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Brooks/Cole.
- Gibelman, M., & Kraft, S. (1996). Advocacy as a core agency program: Planning considerations for voluntary human service agencies. *Administration in Social Work*, 20, 43-59.
- Grayson H. Walker Teaching Resource Center (n.d.). Retrieved March 7, 2007, from <http://www.utc.edu/TRC>
- Harris, H. S., Maloney, D. C., & Rother, F. M. (2004). *Human services: Contemporary issues and trends*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Haynes, K. S., & Mickelson, J. S. (2000). *Affecting change: Social worker in the political arena*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Henke, J. (1985). Bringing reality to the introductory marketing students. *Journal of Marketing Education*, 7, 59-71.
- Homan, M.S. (2004). Giving voice: Advocacy in the human services. *The Link*, 25, 1, 7, and 9.
- Hull, G. H., & Mather, J. (2006). *Understanding generalist practice with families*. Belmont, CA: Brooks/Cole.
- Kirst-Ashman, K. K. & Hull, G. H. (2006). *Understanding generalist practice* (4th ed.). Pacific Grove, CA: Brooks Cole.
- Lieberman, A. & Lester, C. (2004). *Social work practice with a difference*. New York: McGraw Hill.

- McCorkle, D. E., Reardon, J., Alexander, J. F., Kling, N. D., Harris, R. C. & Vishwanathan Iyer, R. (1999). Undergraduate marketing students, group projects, and teamwork: The good, the bad, and the ugly? *Journal of Marketing Education*, 21, 106-117.
- Mehr, J. J. & Kanwisher, R. (2004). *Human services: concepts and intervention strategies*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Moxley, D. P. & Thrasher, S. P. (1997). *Advocacy and case management practice*. In Moxley, D.P. (Ed.), *Case management by design: Reflections on principles and practices*. Chicago: Nelson-Hall Publishers.
- National Organization for Human Services (1996). *Ethical Standards of Human Service Professionals*. Retrieved on May 22, 2007, from <http://www.cshse.org>
- Neukrug, E. (2008). *Theory, practice, and trends in human services: An introduction*. Belmont, CA: Thomson/Brooks Cole.
- Peräkylä, A. (2006). Analyzing talk and text. In N. K. Denzin, & Y. S. Lincoln, (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (3rd ed., pp. 869-886). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Pfaff, E. & Huddleston, P. (2003). Does it matter if I hate teamwork? What impacts student attitudes toward teamwork. *Journal of Marketing Education*, 25, 37-45.
- Quinn, W. H. (1996). Achieving harmony from tension: Contemporary patterns and pitfalls of family advocacy. *Journal of Family Social Work*, 1, 83-98.
- Ragg, D. M. (2006). *Building family practice skills: Methods, strategies and tools*. Belmont, CA: Thomson Brooks/Cole.
- Spencer, L., Ritchie, J., & O'Connor, W. (2003). Analysis: Practices, principles and processes. In J. Ritchie and J. Lewis (Eds.), *Qualitative research practice* (pp. 199-218). London: Sage Publications.
- Woodside, M. & McClam, T. (2006). *An introduction to human services*. Belmont, CA: Thomson and Brooks/Cole.

At-Risk Decisions in Professional-Client Relationships: A Classroom Exercise

Linda Wark

Indiana University-Purdue University, Fort Wayne

Abstract

There are many ways to inform student about expected ethical conduct in human services. In this article, a classroom exercise is presented designed to guide students to think critically about their decisions in professional-client relationships. Specifically, vignettes are used as a basis to examine professional boundaries and dual relationships. The exercise is provided with instructions and reflections on responses made by students.

Introduction

Protection of clients is a major purpose of the Ethical Standards of Human Service Professionals (NOHS, 2000). Accredited human service programs are obligated to instruct students in the ethical standards in hopes of encouraging adherence to it and preventing harm to clients (Council for Standards in Human Service Education, 2005, Goal 2, Objective a.). In the client-professional relationship, the client is the more vulnerable partner (Keith-Spiegel & Koocher, 1985), and it is the responsibility of the professional to be more competent than the client in the decisions related to their relationship. One means of protecting the client-professional relationship is guarding against dual relationships wherein the boundaries of that relationship are blurred, and the roles of professionals and clients become compromised. Statement 6 of the Ethical Standards of Human Service Professionals (2000) states:

“Human service professionals are aware that in their relationships with clients power and status are unequal. Therefore they recognize that dual or multiple relationships may increase the risk of harm to, or exploitation of, clients, and may impair their professional judgment. However, in some communities and situations it may not be feasible to avoid social or other nonprofessional contact with clients. Human service professionals support the trust implicit in the helping relationship by avoiding dual relationships that may impair professional judgment, increase the risk of harm to clients or lead to exploitation.”

When a human service professional engages in two different but simultaneous roles with clients, the seeds can be sown for undesirable consequences. The dual relationship that commonly receives attention is the romantic/sexual one, and the harmful effects have been widely discussed (Pope, 1991). Other dual relationships, however, are more subtle and common, making them more difficult to recognize (Gladding, Remley, & Huber, 2001), and the risk of harm may not be perceived until after the dual relationships is established (Butler & Gardner, 2001). At the beginning of undergraduate studies, most undergraduate students have no experience with client relationships. In addition, all students bring a personal sense of relationship ethics that may work well with their family and friends but are not acceptable in a professional setting. Teaching methods can be used to help students understand the risks of certain decisions and make informed choices to avoid difficult ethical dilemmas that can occur in dual relationships.

Dual Relationships

There is consensus in the literature that dual relationships are those in which the professionals have two roles with clients simultaneously (Herlihy & Corey, 1992). Every professional organization for therapy, counseling and human service has a code of ethics that prohibits dual relationships or alerts the professional to the possibility of harm in dual relationships (Gladding, Remley, & Huber, 2001). Dual relationships are thought to be complicated and have the potential to harm clients either by exploiting them through conflicts of interest and abuses of power or by compromising the ability of the professional to provide appropriate service to them. For example, professionals may be unable to carry out their roles if they fear undermining a friendship with a client. Relatedly, when professionals step outside of their role, clients can come to expect more of the professional than the role can offer. Thus, dual relationships can cause harm to both professionals and clients (Butler & Gardner, 2001). Unfortunately, there is a power differential in the professional-client relationship (Butler & Gardner, 2001; Lerman & Rigby, 1990). As Kagle & Giebelhausen (1994) state, "In any dual relationship, the practitioner's influence and the client's vulnerability carry over to the second relationship" (p. 215). The mere existence of dual relationships does not presuppose the absence of ethics (Youngren, 2002). Replete in the literature, however, is an acknowledgement that dual relationships create dilemmas and a potential for unethical outcomes (Gladding, Remley & Huber, 2001; Brock & Barnard, 1992; Pope, Keith-Spiegel, & Tabachnick, 1986).

Even so, the professional literature reflects divergent views on

dual relationships. Some authors assert that all dual relationships are to be avoided entirely (Baird, 2002). On the other hand, some believe that a rigid stance on all dual relationships diminishes the effectiveness of the professional (Brown, 1994; Lazarus, 1994). The feminist perspective on dual relationships reminds us that they exist in the context of the client's race, socioeconomic status, culture and their individual uniqueness (Brown, 1994). Other authors state that only some dual relationships are exploitive or harmful while other dual relationships do not carry negative implications (Gottlieb, 2002; Koocher & Keith-Spiegel, 1998; Ryder & Hepworth, 1990). Still others remind us that dual relationships are difficult to avoid in religious communities (Hill & Mamalakis, 2001) and rural communities (Gates & Speare, 1990; Hargrove, 1986; Zur, 2006) where previously existing relationships acquire a new dimension in a crisis that might need to be met by the helping professional who is the only resource in town.

The concept of interpersonal boundaries helps define dual relationships. In every healthy relationship, there is a place where one person ends and the other person begins (Peterson, 1992). In relationships with more than one role, however, it is more challenging to have boundary definition. Furthermore, there are no universal rules to define boundaries or boundary violations, and clients will respond variably even when the professional uses commonly accepted guidelines to set boundaries (Brown, 1994).

Management of Dual Relationships

The opportunity for dual relationships will present itself in many professional-client relationships. To manage these opportunities, Kitchener (1988) suggests that concerns such as the potential for exploitation and harm, misunderstandings and divided loyalties and loss of objectivity can be minimized if professionals will use three guidelines to distinguish between dual roles that have a high or a low probability of difficulty. Based on role theory, the first guideline is to examine how incompatible the two roles may be in their expectations. Second, recognize the reciprocity that is not typically found in the professional-client relationship. Finally, check for power and prestige imbalances between the professional and client. Epstein and Simon (1990) developed the Exploitation Index, an instrument to help therapists identify possible precedents to exploiting clients. Russell & Peterson (1998) suggest that to manage the opportunities for dual relationships, professionals must monitor the care of themselves. They provide an excellent list of questions for self- and other-care that can compel the professional to confront his/her personal life and the interface with the professional role.

The use of popular films to train professionals in issues of dual relationships has also been used (Bradley & Hendricks, 2004) with questions focusing on the ethical issues faced by the films' characters. Brock (1997) introduced the concept of "at risk" behavior that might, but not necessarily, lead to dual relationships. Brock, having served on the ethics complaint committee for the American Association for Marriage and Family Therapy, based a checklist for therapists on the case material of members who were accused of violating the ethics code (Brock, 1997). He proposed that avoiding at-risk behavior would help prevent problems with dual relationships. Risk management has been criticized for focusing on the therapist who is trying to avoid harm to his/her career (Zur, 2006), so an emphasis on how clients might be harmed by risky choices is essential.

The ethical codes of professional organizations also exist, in part, to prevent problems for clients. While intended to give standards for practice, they provide only broad guidelines for professionals to manage or avoid dual relationships (Bradley & Hendricks, 2004). The lack of details is problematic for two reasons. First, if a professional is accused of violating a code of ethics, an ethics complaint committee may interpret a particular principle in hindsight differently than the professional did in foresight (Younggren, 2002). Second, because they are broad, they are not always adequate for making practical decisions (Corey, Corey & Callanan, 2003), leaving therapists to fend for themselves. In fact, none of the professional codes of ethics assist professionals in evaluating their decisions (Lerman & Rigby, 1990). In addition, social interactions can arouse strong emotional responses before there is time to reflect on them (Baruth & Huber, 1987). Thus, knowing how one might feel or behave can assist in planning for management of those feelings. Thought-provoking teaching methods are needed to assist students in being prepared to manage challenging decisions in their professional work.

Classroom Methods

There appear to be several types of classroom methods that are used to educate students in ethical behavior in professional practice. The first type is the lecture or textbook that educates students on topics such as informed consent, confidentiality, and the responsibility to protect clients (Bradley & Hendricks, 2004). The second type is the use of case materials, which students examine for flaws in the behavior and/or thinking of the professionals, portrayed in the material (Brock & Barnard, 1994; Wark, 1995). A third type employs cognitive models to develop the decision-making ability of the student (Cottone & Tarvydas,

1998; Sweitzer & King, 2004; Younggren, 2002; Zygmund & Boorhem, 1989). In the fourth type, methods help educators consider how the developmental level of students intersects with their ability to make ethical decisions (Neukrug, 1996; Neukrug, Lovell, & Parker, 1996). A fifth and final type, used routinely in teaching, involves role-playing situations with classmates such as explaining confidentiality, duty to warn issues, and the mandated reporting of child abuse. This paper adds to the pool of teaching methods with a classroom exercise using vignettes with uncertain outcomes that prepares students to consider the consequences of their behavior.

Rationale

It is possible that many ethical violations are due to a lack of preparedness to either recognize or confront a potential problem. While decisions might be made by some professionals to deliberately skirt a code of ethics, most violations are believed to be unintentional (Lerman & Rigby, 1990), or a result of carelessness, or lack of planning (Baruth & Huber, 1987; Keith-Spiegel, 1977). For many new professionals, learning to implement ethical conduct is like studying for one's first driver's license exam. There is very little experience behind the concepts of the exam, and first-time drivers memorize the material without much understanding of the dynamics involved in driving situations. Even the driving portion of the exam doesn't prepare the new driver for the quick wittedness required to manage on-the-spot situations in traffic that are not learned by rote instruction in the rules of the road. Similarly, for several years, the newly graduated professional is likely to encounter many novel situations with clients until attaining status as a seasoned professional. No classroom teaching method can provide actual experience in challenging professional client situations. However, some methods may prevent naïve responses in those situations where no specific rules are available if trainees have had previous opportunities to develop critical thinking related to practice decisions.

Critical Thinking Skills

A critical thinker is one who can make reasoned judgments (Ennis, 1996). It is argued that critical thinking is a tool that supports many professional skills and is considered more important than specific knowledge for learning abilities (Gough, 1991). It is a valuable clinical skill because it assists the helping professional in evaluating how he/she practices, and it encourages the transfer of learning into the work arena (Deal, 2003). In thinking critically, one learns to evaluate problems from multiple perspectives and a variety of solutions (Paul, 1992).

The result of the critical thinking process is that an action is taken based on one's best judgment (Deal, 2003). In this article, critical thinking involves the ability to regulate judgment and action based on the examination of possible outcomes and solutions (Facione, 1990). Critical thinking, then, can help the human service professional use foresight and good judgment in situations with clients.

Reflexive thinking is a closely allied concept. Reflexive thinking permits the professional to develop congruence between stated beliefs and actions and to apply this congruence in future situations (Johns, 2004). One type of reflexive thinking, reflection-in-action, could be particularly useful in helping students become discerning about dual relationships (Schön, 1983, 1987). Reflection-in-action involves the ability to suspend action within a situation so that reflection will take the professional to the desired outcome. Reflection-in-action is different than looking back on an experience. To understand the process, imagine an internal dialogue where the self is responding to the self. Any alternate views are weighed prior to responding (Casement, 1985). Having alternative responses in one's "back pocket" is critical because in subtle dual relationships context cannot always be predicted. For example, a student may assert that he/she would never do anything for a client beyond what is expected in his/her professional role. However, in the real-life situation where a client asks for a favor such as helping her pick up a bed for her child, the student may not have anticipated how he/she would feel when the client says that there is no one else she can call on and that her child is sleeping on the floor.

Critical reflection, according to Schön (1983), involves the development of an awareness of the meaning of one's beliefs, values, and practices. Brown (1991) notes that as these are examined, we develop internal power to avoid boundary violations. This process involves confronting oneself about meanings that may underlie practice decisions. Possible distortions, contradictions and discrepancies are then to be uncovered and examined. Sweitzer & Jones (1990) also propose examining and thinking through value positions prior to on the job challenges in human service. Their model implies that self-understanding permits professionals to perceive risky behavior such as the possibility of exploitation, meeting personal needs through clients and the desire to feel powerful. To address the risk of missteps in dual relationships, a classroom exercise was created that requires students to examine behavioral decisions and potential consequences made in everyday professional situations. The goal of the exercise is to enhance the ability of students to think critically about their choices and whether or not these choices are risky.

The Exercise

To implement the exercise in the classroom, the instructor uses the handout in Appendix A. The vignettes on the handout are deliberately focused on a variety of situations, many not related strictly to human service work. Situations that are not related to human service work helped to eliminate rote responses based on previous learning in class lectures or discussions. Vignettes to teach ethical decision-making have been previously used with success (Dolgoff & Skolnik, 1996).

Instructions to complete the exercise are at the top of the handout and are provided verbally by the instructor. Students are informed that a discussion will follow the exercise, but are not told the focus of the discussion or that the specific focus of the exercise is dual relationships. The exercise can be used in any relevant course, early in the first semester and early in the human service degree program. It can be scheduled prior to any focus of course content on ethical behavior or the Ethical Standards to help ensure a spontaneous response. The students are told that their responses will not be graded.

The students are then given ten to fifteen minutes to write responses to the scenarios on the handout. Brief answers are acceptable, but students are not prevented from writing as much as they wish. Students finish writing, and the instructor leads a discussion that focuses on one vignette at a time. Students present ideas from their written responses in the class discussion, and other students respond with their own perspectives. The instructor acknowledges the variety of viewpoints in the discussion without rendering an opinion. Questions are used by the instructor to develop critical thinking (King, 1995; Brookfield, 1986), and several are offered here: 1) How did you make your decision?; 2) From what role are you looking at this vignette?; 3) If the person in the vignette accepted your response but came to a different perspective later, what are the possible perspectives that he/she might develop?; 4) How would a supervisor or boss evaluate your decision?; 5) What about your decision helps you? Helps the other person?; 6) Do you need additional information to make a decision?; 7) What are all of the possible outcomes?; 8) What are you assuming is true about the other person in this vignette?; 9) Is there a better or worse position that you could take and why?; 10) How might the relationship in this vignette apply to a different work situation?; 11) Do you agree or disagree with other students in this class?; 12) How would you compare this vignette to something that actually happened to you?; 13) What evidence do you have to support your point of view?; and 14) What personal values do you think you bring to your decision?

Student Responses to the Scenarios during Discussions

In this exercise, there is an emphasis on decisions that at first glance may seem harmless, even helpful. With the aid of the instructor and multiple perspectives of classmates, students typically become aware of the potential hidden risks of such decisions. The author has used the exercise for a number of years, and some typical student responses to each scenario are presented in Appendix B. In general, most of the student responses to the scenarios indicating risk appear to be motivated by wanting to be a good helper to clients or a nice person. Thus, each verbal reaction made by students should be given fair and sympathetic attention. Ethical action does not always feel good in the immediate situation, and some of the students will experience discomfort at the thought of handling situations in certain ways even to avoid risky relationships with clients. With attention to this discomfort, the instructor can balance the critical reflection necessary for change in former ways of assessing the vignettes with a safe environment and confidence-building. For example, the instructor can point out the courage that it took a student to participate in the discussion or the caring that the student wishes to provide to clients.

In general, students find the scenarios realistic. From the author's perspective, some come to understand that helping might harm even when you have the best intentions. Some admit that they like being depended on, and many students acknowledge that they want to trust people. Some wouldn't have thought twice about their choices but could, after the exercise, anticipate their vulnerabilities. Some said that they could not have imagined that their decisions could lead to such unwanted consequences. Finally, through participating in the exercise, some students seem to discover a need to separate personal feelings and friendship from professional behavior.

Debriefing the Exercise

After the discussion reaches its natural end, the instructor presents the following concepts: dual relationships; boundaries; and at-risk behavior. First, dual relationships are explained and related to the Ethical Standards of Human Service Professionals. Boundaries are closely related to many ethical decisions (Lazarus, 1994), and the client-professional boundary is explained vis-a-vis each scenario. The concept of at-risk choices (Brock, 1997) is presented and related to the potential negative consequences in each scenario as well. During the debriefing, students are still encouraged to participate with reactions to the material. As much as possible, the instructor should facilitate critical thinking

by giving students time to ask questions related to the long-term consequences of their choices. As mentioned earlier, a focus on the viewpoints of clients and consequences for clients should be emphasized. (See Appendix C for suggested ways to explain these concepts within the context of the exercise.) After debriefing, instructors can offer time to role-play the risky responses to scenarios given initially by students and then role play an alternative response or teach from new client-based vignettes. Questions can be asked to facilitate reflection on the role plays such as, “How does it feel to say what you thought would be best?” and “After using this alternate response to the vignette, what’s your reaction?” or “How can you say, “no,” and cope with the possibility that your client will be offended?” Keeping in mind that there are no prescriptions that can conquer all challenging situations, a wide variety of circumstances related to potential boundary violations such as self-disclosure, affectionate feelings for clients, contact within the community and the possibility of a professional being impaired can provide a bridge from the vignettes to the specific roles of the human service professional.

Conclusion

Any decision that could erode a relationship between clients and professionals is potentially related to a risk for that relationship. Human service workers may be vulnerable for violating the Ethical Standards of Human Service Professionals if they are not able to perceive the risks involved in particular decisions in their work. Russell and Peterson (1998) remind professionals that reactive polarization to dual relationship situations among professionals is unhelpful, and that boundary maintenance evolves from thoughtful reflection.

It is known that merely having a code of ethics or providing exposure to it does not prevent violations of it (Pope, 1991). Connections between undergraduate education and successful adherence to ethical conduct later are likely to remain unknown. Without mandated reporting, the only clear measure of effective education may be the rate of violations of the codes of ethics as known by ethics committees or the self-report of members of professional organizations regarding their own ethical violations. Realistically, the greatest learning outcome from exposure to a code of ethics may go no further than to make professionals conscious of accepted conduct. Thus, it is the responsibility of human service educators to take students beyond rote learning, and the exercise presented here provides one venue that students report is helpful in critically evaluating their decisions in dual relationships situations. Ultimately, students will have to make the decisions about functional or dysfunctional dual relationships and manage boundaries themselves

when they enter the professional work world.

The author has presented studied impressions of student responses to the exercise. Research on the exercise might include a study of the prevalence of at-risk responses among human service students. Such a study may reveal trends in at-risk decisions that can be given attention by classroom instructors. Process studies could also be done wherein the evolution of thinking of the student as they move from awareness of risky decisions to those that are more tempered can be observed. Finally, research might focus on an assessment of learning outcomes. For example, an instructor might administer the questionnaire portion of the exercise, provide information on boundaries and then conduct a re-test of the responses.

References

- Baird, B. N. (2002). *The internship, practicum, and field placement handbook: A guide for the helping professions*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Baruth, L. G., & Huber, C. H. (1987). *Ethical, legal, and professional issues in the practice of marriage and family therapy*. Columbus, OH: Merrill Publishing Company.
- Bradley, L. J. & Hendricks, C. B. (2004). *Ethical issues encountered by counselors: Some solutions*. Retrieved on June 23, 2008, from <http://www.aascb.org>
- Brock, G. W. (1997). Reducing vulnerability to ethics code violations: An at-risk test for marriage and family therapists. *Journal of Marital and Family Therapy*, 23(1), 87-89.
- Brock, G. W., & Barnard, C. P. (1992). *Procedures in Marriage and Family Therapy* (2nd ed.). Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Brookfield, S. (1986). *Understanding and facilitating adult learning*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Brown, L. (1994). *Boundaries in feminist therapy: A conceptual formulation*. *Women and Therapy*, 15, 29-38.
- Brown, L. (1991). Ethical issues in feminist therapy. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, 15, 323-336.
- Butler, M. H. & Gardner, B. C. (2001). *Ethics and the ideal helping relationship: Response to Hill and Mamalakis*. *Family Relations*, 50, 209-214.
- Casement, P. (1985). *On learning from the patient*. London: Tavistock.
- Corey, G., Corey, M., & Callanan, P. (2003). *Issues and ethics in the helping professions*. Pacific Grove, CA: Brooks/Cole-Thomson Learning.
- Council for Standards in Human Service Education* (2005). Retrieved on June 20, 2007, from: <http://www.cshse.org>
- Cottone, R. R. & Tarvydas, V. M. (1998). Ethical decision-making models: A review of the literature. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 78, 275-283.

- Deal, K. H. (2003). The relationships between critical thinking and interpersonal skills: Guidelines for clinical supervisors. *The Clinical Supervisor*, 22, 3-19.
- Dolgoff, R., & Skolnik, L. (1996). Ethical decision making in social work groups: An empirical study. *Social Work with Groups*, 19, 49-65.
- Ennis, R. H. (1996). *Critical thinking*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Epstein, R. S. & Simon, R. I. (1990). The Exploitation Index: An early warning indicator of boundary violations in psychotherapy. *Bulletin of the Menninger Clinic*, 54, 450-465.
- Facione, P. A. (1990). Critical thinking: A statement of expert consensus for purposes of educational assessment and instructions: Research findings and recommendations. *American Philosophical Association*, 1-112. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED315423)
- Gates, K. P., & Speare, K. H. (1990). *Overlapping relationships in rural communities*. In H. Lerman & N. Porter (Eds.), *Feminist ethics in psychotherapy*. New York: Springer Publishing Company.
- Gladding, S. T., Remley, T. P. & Huber, C. H. (2001). *Ethical, legal, and professional issues in the practice of marriage and family therapy* (3rd ed.). Columbus, OH: Merrill Prentice Hall.
- Gottlieb, M. (2002). Avoiding exploitive dual relationships: A decisions-making model. *Psychotherapy: theory, research, practice, training*, 30, 41-48.
- Gough, D. (1991). *Thinking about thinking*. Alexandria, VA: National Association of Elementary School Principals. Research Roundup, 7(2), 1-6. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED327980)
- Hargrove, D. S. (1986). Ethical issues in rural mental health practice. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 17, 20-23.
- Herlihy, B., & Corey, G. (1992). Dual relationships in counseling. Alexandria, VA: *American Counseling Association*.
- Hill, M. R. & Mamalakis, P. M. (2001). Family therapists and religious communities: Negotiating dual relationships. *Family Relations*, 50, 199-208.
- Johns, C. (2004). *Becoming a reflective practitioner*. Oxford, UK: Blackwell Publishing.
- Kagle, J. D. & Giebelhausen, P. N. (1994). Dual relationships and professional boundaries. *Journal of Progressive Human Services*, 15, 1 – 24.
- Keith-Spiegel, P. (1977). Violation of ethical principles due to ignorance or poor professional judgment versus willful disregard. *Professional Psychology*, 8, 288-296
- Keith-Spiegel, P. & Koocher, G. P. (1985). *Ethics in psychology*. New York: Random House.
- King, A. (1995). Inquiring minds really do want to know: Using questioning to teach critical thinking. *Teaching of Psychology*, 22, 13-17.
- Kitchener, K. S. (1984). Intuition, critical evaluation, and ethical principles: The foundation for ethical decisions in counseling psychology. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 12(3), 43-45.

- Kitchener, K. S. (1988). Dual role relationships. What makes them so problematic? *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 67, 217-221.
- Koocher, G. P. & Keith-Spiegel, P. (1998). *Ethics in psychology: Professional standards and cases* (2nd ed.). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Lazarus, A. A. (1994). How certain boundaries and ethics diminish therapeutic effectiveness. *Ethics & Behavior*, 4, 255-261.
- Lerman, H. & Rigby, D. N. (1990). Boundary violations: Misuse of the power of the therapist. In H. Lerman & N. Porter (Eds.), *Feminist ethics in psychotherapy*. New York: Springer Publishing Company.
- Neukrug, E. S. (1996). A developmental approach to the teaching of ethical decision making. *Human Service Education*, 16(1), 19-36.
- Neukrug, E., Lovell, C., & Parker, R. (1996). Employing ethical codes and decisions-making models: A developmental process. *Counseling and Values*, 40, 98-106.
- NOHS Ethical Standards for Human Service Professionals (2000). *Human Service Education*, 20, 61-68.
- Paul, R. W. (1992). *Critical thinking: What every person needs to survive in a rapidly changing world*. Santa Rose, CA: The Foundation for Critical Thinking.
- Peterson, M. R. (1992). *At personal risk: Boundary violations in professional-client relationships*. New York: W.W. Norton & Co.
- Pope, K. S. (1991). Dual relationships in psychotherapy. *Ethics & Behavior*, 1(1), 21-34.
- Pope, K. S., Keith-Spiegel, P., & Tabachnick, B.S. (1986). Sexual attraction to clients: The human therapist and the (sometimes) inhuman training system. *American Psychologist*, 41, 147-158.
- Russell, C. S., & Peterson, C. M. (1998). The management of personal and professional boundaries in marriage and family therapy training programs. *Contemporary Family Therapy*, 20, 457-470.
- Ryder, R., & Hepworth, J. (1990). AAMFT ethical code: "Dual relationships." *Journal of Marital and Family Therapy*, 16, 127-132.
- Schön, D. A. (1983). *The reflective practitioner: How professionals think in action*. New York: Basic Books.
- Schön, D. A. (1987). *Educating the reflective practitioner*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass .
- Sweitzer, H. F., & Jones, J. S. (1990). Self-understanding in human service education: Goals and methods. *Human Service Education*, 10, 39-52.
- Sweitzer, H. F., & King, M. A. (2004). *The successful internship: Transformation and empowerment in experiential learning*. Belmont, CA: Thomson Brooks/Cole.
- Wark, L. (1995). Unpublished course exercise. Northern Illinois University: DeKalb, IL.
- Younggren, J. (2002). *Ethical decision-making and dual relationships*. Retrieved on July 16, 2007, from: <http://www.kspope.com>
- Zur, O. (2006). Therapeutic boundaries and dual relationships in rural practice: Ethical, clinical and standard of care considerations. *Journal of*

Zygmond, M. J., & Boorhem, H. (1989). Ethical decision making in family therapy. *Family Process*, 28, 269-280.

Appendix A

Handout for Classroom Exercise

Instructions: We will have a discussion after you spend 10 – 15 minutes reading and responding to this pre-discussion exercise. Briefly write how you would respond in each situation below. Please write something in every space even if it is brief. You will not receive a grade for this pre-discussion exercise.

1. You have just conducted a parenting group for single parents, and, at the end of the group, one of the single parents asks you for a ride home. You know that his/her car has broken down.
2. You are a teacher or other worker in a childcare center. One of the parents (same sex as you) of a child in the center buys you a sweater from a popular store for a holiday gift.
3. One of your (same sex) therapy clients is terminating therapy with which the client is very satisfied. At the end of the last session, s/he asks you to go get a pizza with her at a local restaurant.
4. You work at a human service agency, and one of your co-workers asks you to counsel her. She/he is willing to pay you.
5. You are providing therapy to a client who is struggling through a divorce. You are also divorced, and you think it might be a good idea to self-disclose and share some of your experiences with the client.
6. You work for the welfare department providing public aid. A client comes in, and during your conversation with him/her, he/she brings up some concerns about his/her caseworker. This caseworker is a friend of yours, and you believe that your friend should be defended.
7. You work at a children's hospital. During one appointment the mother of a patient begins to cry because of grief and stress over her child's terminal illness. You feel like crying also because the situation is so sad.
8. You are training someone to be an assistant in your medical practice. This person will have a probationary period of three months to see if he/she will work out. One night after a training session, he/she invites you out for a drink or soda. You like this trainee.
9. Your (same sex) boss calls you into the office one day and says to you, "I really need a confidante here at work. Out of all of the people who work here, I was hoping that you would be a confidante."

Appendix B

Samples of At-Risk Responses

1. You have just conducted a parenting group for single parents, and, at the end of the group, one of the single parents asks you for a ride home. You know that his/her car has broken down.
Student response: Students feel sorry for the parent. “I’m not nice if I don’t help.”
2. You are a teacher or other worker in a childcare center. One of the parents (same sex as you) of a child in the center buys you a sweater from a popular store for a holiday gift.
Student response: Students feel that it’s rude to reject a gift. Besides, it’s a holiday and people give gifts at holidays.
3. One of your (same sex) therapy clients is terminating therapy with which the client is very satisfied. At the end of the last session, s/he asks you to go get a pizza with her at a local restaurant.
Student response: It’s just a pizza, and the therapist could pay his/her own way.
4. You work at a human service agency, and one of your co-workers asks you to counsel her. She/he is willing to pay you.
Student response: Don’t take pay, but do it as a favor. That would be acceptable.
5. You are providing therapy to a client who is struggling through a divorce. You are also divorced, and you think it might be a good idea to self-disclose and share some of your experiences with the client.
Student response: Many clients appreciate self-disclosure. It makes them feel more comfortable to know that you are a human being also.
6. You work for the welfare department providing public aid. A client comes in, and during your conversation with him/her, he/she brings up some concerns about his/her caseworker. This caseworker is a friend of yours, and you believe that your friend should be defended.
Student response: If you believe that your friend has done nothing wrong, why not defend him/her?
7. You work at a children’s hospital. During one appointment the mother of a patient begins to cry because of grief and stress over her child’s terminal illness. You feel like crying also because the situation is so sad.
Student Response: The mother will appreciate your empathy if you cry a little.
8. You are training someone to be an assistant in your medical practice. This person will have a probationary period of three months to see if he/she will work out. One night after a training session, he/she in-

vites you out for a drink or soda. You like this trainee and going out would be fun.

Student Response: It's normal for people who work together to go out for drinks or other socializing after work. OR Don't have alcohol, but it would be fine to have a snack or meal or non-alcoholic beverages.

9. Your (same sex) boss calls you into the office one day and says to you, "I really need a confidante here at work. Out of all of the people who work here, I was hoping that you would be a confidante." You are very flattered.

Student Response: This might be a good way to impress a supervisor who will see more of your skills and talent in the workplace than otherwise.

Appendix C

Examples of Risky Decisions and Alternative Action

1. You have just conducted a parenting group for single parents, and, at the end of the group, one of the single parents asks you for a ride home. You know that his/her car has broken down.
Risk: The gesture of giving a ride home breaks down barriers related to a client-professional relationship. Client may feel more special than other group members. Conversation might become too personal when not in the confines of group discussions.
Alternative Action: Allow client to use phone to call a taxi. Create a loan of money out of agency funds for such purposes. Client could use the phone to call a friend or family member. Finally, some buses run at night.
2. You are a teacher or other worker in a childcare center. One of the parents (same sex as you) of a child in the center buys you a sweater from a popular store for a holiday gift.
Risk: Parents may feel more inclined to ask for favors in the future because reciprocity is often expected with gift-giving.
Alternative Action: Tell the parents that you cannot accept gifts of that magnitude. However, some of the parents bring cards and you would be happy to have a holiday greeting from them.
3. One of your (same sex) therapy clients is terminating therapy with which the client is very satisfied. At the end of the last session, s/he asks you to go get a pizza with her at a local restaurant.
Risk: Client decides to return for more therapy six months later, but now your role as the therapist has been compromised.
Alternative Action: Bring celebratory food to the last session, avoid-

ing expensive or luxury foods.

4. You work at a human service agency, and one of your co-workers asks you to counsel her. She/he is willing to pay you.

Risk: How might the relationship at work change. Will it be for the better or worse?

Alternative Action: Tell the co-worker that you would be happy to listen to her troubles over coffee later that day or week. You will not be able to give a perspective from your therapist training, but you would be happy to use your knowledge of the professional community give her several names of therapists that she might choose from.

5. You are providing therapy to a client who is struggling through a divorce. You are also divorced, and you think it might be a good idea to self-disclose and share some of your experiences with the client.

Risk: Tell the client about the matters related to your divorce.

Alternative Action: Ask yourself, is it necessary to disclose matters from your personal life to help the client?

6. You work for the welfare department providing public aid. A client comes in, and during your conversation with him/her, he/she brings up some concerns about his/her caseworker. This caseworker is a friend of yours, and you believe that your friend should be defended.

Risk: Getting involved in your co-worker's cases could make things worse. If you defend your friend, you are likely to alienate the clients.

Alternative Action: Listen for about 30 seconds and then encourage the client to talk to his/her caseworker.

7. You work at a children's hospital. During one appointment the mother of a patient begins to cry because of the grief and stress over her child's terminal illness. You feel like crying also because the situation is so sad.

Risk: A boundary must be drawn between showing empathy to the mother and expressing your personal deep emotions in the presence of the mother. The mother might react by trying to take care of you.

Alternative Action: Excuse yourself if you must and then return to express your concern for the mother.

8. You are training someone to be an assistant in your medical practice. This person will have a probationary period of three months to see if he/she will work out. One night after a training session, he/she invites you out for a drink or soda. You like this trainee and going out would be fun.

Risk: socializing can indicate that a second type of relationship is developing. The second type can interfere with the first. If the supervisor likes the trainee at work but not personally, what could happen.

Alternative Action: You could tell your boss that you would like to

sit down for coffee some day and chat but that you have a policy that you don't socialize with co-workers.

9. Your (same sex) boss calls you into the office one day and says to you, "I really need a confidante here at work. Out of all of the people who work here, I was hoping that you would be a confidante." You are very flattered.

Risk: Will the boss always favor you? If not, how will you feel? What might happen to your employment status? Will your relationship with other employees be affected?

Alternative Action: You might tell the boss that you are flattered, but you wonder if you could be helpful in another way.

The Human Service Internship Portfolio: Benefits for Student Interns and Supervising Faculty

Jane D. Lanigan

Washington State University Vancouver

Abstract

Portfolios are well suited for internship and field experiences in human services because they capture the multidimensional nature of a student's performance and achievement within the context of a particular site placement. A well executed portfolio requirement serves a dual purpose: learning enhancement and assessment. The strengths based approach aligns well with the philosophy of human services. This article examines the internship portfolio from the perspective of student interns and supervising faculty. The benefits and challenges of implementing a portfolio assessment are discussed and recommendations offered.

Introduction

Portfolios are well suited for internship and field experiences in human services because they capture the multidimensional nature of a student's performance and achievement within the context of a particular site placement. The National Organization for Human Services (NOHS) website lists occupational titles for human service professionals that exemplify the wide variety of populations, age groups, settings, and responsibilities that a human services internship might encompass (2006). The diversity of internship placements poses a challenge for the faculty internship supervisor to create relevant assignments and formulate an assessment that captures the nuances of each intern's experience. One potential solution that has been adopted by a number of disciplines is the internship or professional portfolio (Ballard & Carroll, 2005; Benson et al., 2006; Good & Weaver, 2003; Heinricher, Miller, Schachterle, & Kildahl, 2002; Swigonski, Ward, Mama, Rodgers & Belicose, 2006).

The internship portfolio can be structured to yield both process and outcome assessment data about the individual student. A selective portfolio requires students to assemble artifacts that demonstrate learning attainment and skill development (Swigonski et al., 2006). This strengths-based approach is consistent with the philosophy of human services. Student portfolios can also provide valuable program assessment data. Examining internship portfolios, or specific assignments within the portfolio, helps programs assess the effectiveness of student

preparation for field placement. A professional portfolio expands its scope beyond the internship experience to include samples of the student's best work throughout their program of studies. This approach generates additional program evaluation possibilities (Benson et al., 2006; Heinricher et al., 2002; Swigonski et al., 2006).

This article discusses the benefits and challenges of the internship portfolio from the perspective of student interns and supervising faculty. A review of the literature and the experience of the author serve as the basis for recommendations to establish and maximize the potential of a human services internship portfolio requirement.

Definition of Terms

Ballard and Carroll (2005) found tremendous variation in how Family Science, Human Development and Human Service programs label, conceptualize, and evaluate internship. Student involvement in community-based learning experiences was designated internship, practicum, or field experience. The course could stand alone or be offered with a corresponding seminar, be a requirement or an elective, and differ in credits as well as expectations. This illustrates both the flexibility and the challenges related to this unique learning opportunity. This article will use the term internship to refer to student learning that takes place primarily outside the classroom at a university approved placement that is supervised jointly by personnel from the placement site and university faculty.

A portfolio is an organized collection of evidence that documents a student's accomplishments during the internship experience. The portfolio accomplishes a dual purpose: instruction and assessment of learning (Bowers, 2005). Students create or select artifacts that describe the context of their learning and illustrate their skills, knowledge, competencies, and achievement. The process of creating the portfolio promotes student learning by requiring students to reflect on their experiences, abilities, professional growth, and the placement site (Brown, 2002; Cournoyer & Stanley, 2001; Xu, 2004). Assignments that require interns to explain artifact selection and provide evidence related to particular learning outcomes and professional competencies throughout their internship placement contribute process and outcome assessments of student achievement (Gulbahar & Tinmaz, 2006; Jorgensen & Hansen, 2004; Waishwell, Morrow, Micke, & Keyser, 1996).

The Benefits and Challenges of Implementing an Internship Portfolio

Intern Perspective

Benefits. While the internship portfolio may be perceived initially as an assignment to fulfill course requirements, students discover that the portfolio is integral to their learning process, and that its usefulness extends beyond the classroom (Urish, 2005). Research suggests that portfolios enhance learning and deepen the internship experience (Brown, 2002; Schwartz & Rolheiser, 2001; Wickersham & Chambers, 2006). Assembling a portfolio directs the student's focus. In order to identify artifacts that illustrate strengths and abilities, students must engage in self reflection and critical analysis of the requirements of their internship placement (Brown; Wickersham & Chambers). For example, students frequently interact with colleagues and other professionals during their internship experience. However, an assignment that requires students to collect contact information and describe how their placement has facilitated professional networking, elevates those informal interactions by bringing the networking process into consciousness. Similarly, identifying a visual representation and explication of competencies encourages students to reflect on the skills needed to successfully complete internship tasks (Brown). A routine "intake interview" is dissected into its component parts, highlighting the interpersonal, technical, and organizational skills necessary for the process to yield useful information.

In addition, the portfolio may serve as a vehicle for helping students connect classroom learning and theory to professional practice (Conderman, 2003; Waishwell et al, 1996; Xu, 2004). An agency overview assignment might require the application of ecological theory. A reflection assignment could ask students to discuss how specific classroom knowledge was used during the internship. Wickersham and Chambers (2006) interviewed students who used an ePortfolio to document their development as a "Master Teacher". Approximately half of the students reported that the reflective process lead to an increase in self-knowledge and transfer of specific professional knowledge. Internship offers the potential to be not just a capstone experience, but a bridge between formal education and professional practice. The portfolio helps students traverse that bridge.

The internship portfolio often proves to be equally valuable to students once their formal education has been completed. As portfolios have gained acceptance and recognition across various disciplines and fields; employers, scholarship committees, and graduate schools are receptive to incorporating the professional or internship portfolio into their evaluation processes (Gallo, 2005; Salend, 2001). When a portfolio

isn't required, the inclusion of a tangible, well executed, visual representation of student ability and experience offers a potential advantage in a competitive selection process (Satterthwaite & D'Orsi, 2003). Students report using their internship portfolio to document experience needed to gain a professional foothold in the competitive job market (Swigonski et al., 2006).

Challenges. Constructing a portfolio is an unfamiliar process for many students. Unlike traditional classroom assignments where criteria are standardized, the portfolio gives students tremendous latitude to design, organize, and select artifacts. A framework, particular components, and assessment criteria may be specified; but the form those artifacts take, selection of the most appropriate exemplars, and presentation format are often left to the intern's judgment. This freedom can be intimidating, the number of decisions overwhelming, and the lack of detailed guidelines, a well-articulated evaluative criteria, and quality examples frustrating (Schaffer, Nelson, & Litt, 2005; Urish, 2005). Interns' understanding of the internship portfolio's value evolves over time which may limit initial tolerance of the ambiguities and challenges associated with portfolio development (Urish).

The timing of internship late in a student's program of studies creates additional barriers. Few students who have completed internship remain on campus to serve as peer mentors for new interns. Unique stressors occur during the final semester as students prepare for their post graduation future. These competing life demands can hinder portfolio construction and prevent students from obtaining maximum learning benefits (Urish, 2005).

Internship Faculty Perspective

Benefits. The portfolio provides the means for authentic assessment of the multidimensional learning, performance, and achievement that occurs within the internship context (Keino, 2006; Schaffer et al., 2005; Willis & Davies, 2002). As such, the portfolio provides a more accurate picture of student abilities and potential for success in the human service profession. The portfolio can be a pedagogical tool that sparks creativity while facilitating communication, the scaffolding of learning, and student self-reflection (Jorgensen & Hansen, 2004; King, 2000; Schwartz & Rolheiser, 2001). The author has found that the portfolio also reflects the learning experience and opportunities at a particular placement site. This allows the instructor to monitor the effectiveness of each internship site and note potential areas of concern to address with site personnel, or those areas where the site excelled in order to express appreciation.

Challenges. Initiating the internship portfolio is a time intensive process that requires thoughtful consideration regarding the purpose, goals, and type of portfolio to be implemented (Cournoyer & Stanley, 2001; Swigonski et al., 2006). Faculty must establish a process that offers guidance, monitoring, feedback, and support for students assembling a portfolio. That process must be clearly articulated in a written format, and systems created to respond to student questions. A framework and templates must be developed that provide structure, but are flexible enough to accommodate a variety of internship experiences, and the wide array of potential items that might be appropriate for portfolio inclusion (Bowers, 2005).

Another consideration is the physical footprint portfolios leave. Large binders are cumbersome to transport, maintain in a small office and return to students. As interns typically keep their portfolios, faculty must identify which artifacts need to be copied for the student's permanent internship file, programmatic evaluation, and accreditation visits as well as institute procedures for doing so. The ePortfolio offers a solution for the issue of physical footprint and record maintenance with the added benefit of increased motivation for technologically comfortable students and a user friendly interface for faculty (Driessen, Muijtjens, van Tartwijk, & van der Vleuten, 2007; Keino, 2006). ePortfolios, however, can pose technological barriers to some students, lack the physical immediacy and portability of a binder, and can impose a structure that limits creativity (Driessen et al.; Wickersham & Chambers, 2006). Instructors must weigh the comparative advantages and implementation costs of each delivery format.

Familiarity with portfolios and developmental stage will influence students' ability to work independently. Some students will require a higher degree of support to be successful (Swigonski et al., 2006). Providing individual support and responding to questions is time intensive. Some internship programs pair a seminar with the internship experience which provides a forum for communication, presenting the portfolio framework, monitoring portfolio progress, student portfolio exchange, and peer critiquing. Given the complexity of scheduling internship hours, a concurrent seminar is not always possible. Ballard and Carroll (2005) found that only 58% of Family Studies programs offered a course in conjunction with internship. An online course overcomes the scheduling challenge, but requires a substantial investment of time to create and poses challenges for fostering student engagement and an interactive learning environment.

Evaluation of internship portfolios provides a unique challenge as there is tremendous variation between the types of artifacts students in-

clude (Keino, 2006). The portfolio can be the final product of an internship experience that spans one or more academic terms and sometimes multiple sites. Instructors need to conduct both process and outcome assessments in order to capture growth and change, offer timely feedback, and allow students the opportunity to improve on early efforts (Xu, 2004). If more than one faculty supervises interns, consensus must be reached regarding which aspects of the portfolio to grade and standards or rubrics to guide that grading. The grading criteria and evaluation process must be clearly articulated and consistently administered (Bowers, 2005; Van sickle, Bogan, Kamen, Baird & Butcher, 2005).

Recommendations

This review of the literature and documentation of benefits and challenges leads to recommendations regarding: communication and time management, organizational framework and gradual implementation.

Communication and Time Management.

Effective strategies for communicating internship portfolio framework, templates, evaluation criteria, artifact selection and relevance are critical (Bowers, 2005; Urish, 2005). Internship programs that use multiple modalities to deliver information and respond to student questions are more likely to accommodate the developmental level and learning preferences of students. Interns who understand the relevance of portfolio assembly to learning, future employment, and graduate studies early in their experience will achieve maximum benefits from the portfolio requirement (Conderman, 2003; Urish, 2005). The author posts testimonials from qualitative surveys of former interns about how the portfolio enhanced their internship learning or how their portfolio helped obtain employment, scholarships, and admittance into graduate programs.

When a concurrent seminar is not feasible, placing content in an online forum is a good alternative. The author has developed a series of self-paced online learning modules. The modules allow asynchronous, relevant instruction as students typically access a module when it is needed for a particular stage of their portfolio development. The modules suggest a framework, structure, and offer photographs and examples of previous student portfolios. Topics include artifact selection and description, portfolio organization, effective presentation, portfolio evaluation standards and the portfolio as a marketing tool. Establishing the learning modules is time-intensive, but ultimately time efficient as expectations are clearly communicated and readily accessible. Two additional online tools are Frequently Asked Questions (FAQs) and a discussion board. FAQs provide answers to common student questions.

The discussion board allows interns to share portfolio ideas or challenges and can be used to encourage portfolio exchange and feedback. Success hinges on active student engagement which is built into the internship course requirements.

For students needing face-to-face interaction, the author used brown bag lunches to bring interns together and facilitate informal opportunities for students to ask questions, exchange ideas and share experiences. Former interns attended one of the lunches and shared their portfolio and experiences. Printed internship portfolio information packets are available at the department office. Individual assistance remains available during office hours, by appointment and via email. These options have been used much less frequently since the online information venues and brown bag lunches have been developed.

Organizational Framework

Teacher portfolios which have been used, refined and developed over the past several decades serve as a good model for the human services internship portfolio (Campbell, Cignetti, Melenzyer, Nettles, & Wyman, 2001; Morgan, Hertzog, & Gibbs, 2002; Van Sickle et al., 2005). The portfolio framework specifies learning outcomes derived from state identified teacher competencies. Student teachers demonstrate achievement of the outcomes through their artifact selections and accompanying narrative explanation. The narrative captures the context and evolution of the learning throughout the experience. The Generic Human Service Worker Competencies proposed by NOHS (2006) or the Community Support Skills Standards (Human Services Research Institute, nd.) developed by a national coalition of human service organizations might be modified to serve as a framework for human services internship portfolios.

Schwartz and Rolheiser (2001) describe two useful organizational frameworks. The first outlines decisions related to portfolio planning and implementation around topics such as: purpose, audience, time frame, learning outcomes, artifact selection, evaluation and grading, organization, and storage. The second is a process that encourages reflective practice, the 3 Rs framework of retelling, relating and reflecting. Their systematic discussion is especially useful for programs initiating an internship portfolio.

Gradual Implementation

Given the complexity, multiple decision points, and need for faculty and student buy-in; gradual implementation of an internship portfolio and broader program assessment using the portfolio should be con-

sidered (Bowers, 2005; Swigonski et al., 2006). Templates, assignments, communication mechanisms, procedures and evaluation matrices should be pilot tested, and revised. When too many variables are introduced simultaneously it becomes difficult to interpret formative assessment data and refine the internship portfolio requirements (Bowers, 2005). Instructors might consider transitioning students and faculty to a portfolio assessment by incorporating select elements and gradually incorporating additional modules and requirements. This approach proved successful for the author.

Human service programs that are contemplating the addition of a programmatic portfolio assessment can use the internship portfolio as the basis for future efforts. Implementing the portfolio in a single class allows students and faculty to familiarize themselves with the benefits and challenges of portfolio assessment and refine procedures before expanding the portfolio assessment across the entire program (Gulbahar & Tinmaz, 2006).

Conclusion

The decision to implement an internship portfolio should not be taken lightly. In order for the portfolio to become a successful pedagogical tool; a conceptual framework needs to be in place that addresses issues related to component selection, assessment criteria, student and site support, communication, standards, procedures and logistics. Programs need to consider whether the complexity and challenges associated with the internship portfolio are offset by the many benefits portfolios offer to students, the internship instructor and the human services program.

References

- Ballard, S. M., & Carroll, E. B. (2005). Internship practices in family studies programs. *Journal of Family and Consumer Sciences*, 97(4), 11-17.
- Benson, M. J., Allen, K. R., Few, A. L., Roberto, K. A., Blieszner, R., Meszaro, P. S. & Henderson, T. L. (2006). Transforming the master's degree in human development and family science. *Family Relations*, 55, 44-55.
- Bowers, S. P. (2005). The portfolio process: Questions for implementation and practice. *College Student Journal*, 39(4), 754-758.
- Brown, J. O. (2002). Know thyself: The impact of portfolio development on adult learning. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 52(3), 228-245.
- Campbell, D., Cignetti, P., Melenyzer, B., Nettles, D., & Wyman, R. (2001). *How to develop a professional portfolio: A manual for teachers* (2nd ed.). Needham, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Conderman, G. (2003). Using portfolios in undergraduate special education teacher education programs. *Preventing School Failure*, 47(3), 106-115.
- Cournoyer, B. R. & Stanley, M. J. (2001). *The Social Work Portfolio, Planning*,

Assessing, and Documenting Lifelong Learning in a Dynamic Profession. Wadsworth Publishing, Pacific Grove, CA.

- Driessen, E. W., Muijtjens, M. A., van Tartwijk, J., & van der Vleuten, C. P. (2007). Web or paper-based portfolios: Is there a difference? *Medical Education*, 41(11), 1067-1073.
- Gallo, A. M. (2005). *Developing an A+ professional portfolio.* *Strategies*, 18(5), 30-33.
- Good, J. M., & Weaver, A. (2003). Evaluation of preservice teachers' internships: A model to encourage career continuity and program reform. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 17(3), 263-275.
- Gulbahar, Y., & Tinmaz, H. (2006). Implementing project-based learning and E-portfolio assessment in an undergraduate course. *Journal of Research on Technology in Education*, 38(3), 309-327.
- Heinricher, A. C., Miller, J. E., Schachterle, L. & Kildahl, N. K. (2002). Undergraduate learning portfolios for institutional assessment. *Journal of Engineering Education*, 91(2), 249-254.
- Human Services Research Institute (nd). *Provider capacity and capabilities.* Retrieved on July 2, 2008, from <http://www.hsri.org/quality/>
- Jorgensen, L. M., & Hansen, S. (2004). *Assessing reflection through portfolios.* *Thinking Classroom*, 5(4), 5-11.
- Keino, L. C. (2006). Electronic learning portfolios: Evaluating artifacts in an international FCS program. *Journal of Family and Consumer Sciences*, 98(4), 44-46.
- King, R. (2000). Portfolio development: Using authentic learning assignments in psychology courses. *North American Journal of Psychology*, 2(1), 151-166.
- Morgan, P. L., Hertzog, C. J., & Gibbs, A. (2002). *Educational leadership: Performance standards, portfolio assessment and the internship.* Latham, MD: ScarecrowEducation.
- National Organization for Human Services [NOHS] (2006). Examples of occupational titles of human services workers. Retrieved on July 1, 2008. from <http://www.nationalhumanservices.org/?q=the-human-service-worker#workers>
- National Organization for Human Services [NOHS] (2006). Generic human service worker competencies. Retrieved on July 1, 2008, from <http://www.nationalhumanservices.org/?q=the-human-service-worker#workers>
- Salend, S. J. (2001). Creating your own professional portfolio. *Intervention in School and Clinic*. 36(4), 195-202.
- Satterthwaite, F., & D'Orsi, G. (2003). *The career portfolio workbook: Using the newest tool in your job-hunting arsenal to impress employers and land a great job.* New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Schaffer, M. A., Nelson, P., & Litt, E. (2005). Using portfolios to evaluate achievement of population-based public health nursing competencies in baccalaureate nursing students. *Nursing Education Perspectives*, 26(2), 104-113.

- Schwartz, S. & Rolheiser, C. (2001). Pre-service portfolios: A base for professional growth *Canadian Journal of Education*, 26(3).
- Swigonski, M., Ward, K., Mama, R. S., Rodgers, J. & Belicose, R. (2006). An agenda for the future: Student portfolios in social work education. *Social Work Education*, 25(8), 812-823.
- Urish, C. K. (2005). *Meaning ascribed to learning portfolios of graduate level rehabilitation counseling students*. DAI, 67(01B), 226.
- Van Sickle, M., Bogan, M. B., Kamen, M., Baird, W., & Butcher, C. (2005). Dilemmas faced establishing portfolio assessment of pre-service teachers in the southeastern United States. *College Student Journal*, 39(3), 497-509.
- Waishwell, L., Morrow, M. J., Micke, M. M. & Keyser, B. B. (1996) 'Utilization of the student portfolio to link professional preparation to the responsibilities and competencies of the entry level health educator'. *Journal of Health Education*, vol. 27, no. 1, pp. 4-9.
- Wickersham, L. E., Chambers, S. M. (2006). ePortfolios: Using technology to enhance and assess student learning. *Education*, 126(4), 738-747.
- Willis, E., & Davies, M. (2002). Promise and practice of professional portfolios. *Action in Teacher Education*, 23(4), 18-27.
- Xu, Y. (2004). Teacher portfolios: An effective way to assess teacher performance and enhance learning. *Childhood Education*, 80(4), 198-202.

Latino Women's Perception of Gender Equity in Household Labor and its Relation to Marital Satisfaction

Beth Warner
Elon University

Cara Leidy
Higher Achievement Program, Washington DC

Abstract

This study examines the gender ideology, perception of gender equity in the division of household labor, and overall marital satisfaction of recent Latina immigrants to determine whether their original cultural beliefs have been influenced by the dominant United States culture. A community-based, empowerment research design was used to encourage ESL students to respond to questions about gender ideology and equity in their marriage. The findings point to a developing biculturality, blending their culture of origin with their new culture. This research suggests that as our national debate concerning immigration continues, strengths-based, supportive programming for Latinas, that gives attention to cultural differences may be especially useful to promote individual empowerment as well as integration into the community and greater society.

Introduction

Latinos were almost half of the national population growth between July 2005 and July 2006 (US Census Bureau, 2007). The median age of this group was 27.5 and about one third of the Latino population was under 18 years old. Latino immigrants and their children are finding their way in a new culture at a time when public opinion concerning the presence of Latino immigrants is often hostile and antagonistic. Several studies have determined that there are mental and physical effects associated with acculturation (Cuellar, Arnold, & Maldonado, 1995; Dion & Dion, 2001; Elder, Broyles, Brennan, de Nuncio, & Nader, 2005; Lopez & Contreras, 2005; Page, 2006; Rodriguez, Mira, Paez, & Myers, 2007). Immigrant women, in particular, have been found to experience higher levels of negative effects during acculturation (Dion & Dion, 2001; Elder, et al., 2005). However, strong attachment to Latino cultural identity, positive family functioning, and willingness to adapt to the new culture have been found to contribute to more positive acculturation (Lopez & Contreras, 2005; Page, 2006; Rodriguez, et al., 2007). In ad-

dition, retaining one's own culture and language while also adopting the new culture and language, is related to positive psychological adjustment (Cuellar, et al., 1995; Lopez & Contreras, 2005; Page, 2006).

Bridging cultures may be more difficult when households in the United States, due to economic strain, need to commit more time to paid work (Jacobs & Gerson, 2004). Although women in the United States are entering the paid workforce in increasing numbers, research has generally concluded that women are still doing more housework than men and that the types of tasks being performed continue to be largely gender specific (Coltrane, 2000; Coltrane, Parke & Adams, 2004; de Ruijter, Treas & Cohen, 2005; Greenstein, 1996a; Greenstein, 1996b; Levey, 2005; Renk, et al., 2003; Saginak & Saginak, 2005; Sayer, 2005).

Conclusions about changes in household labor have been drawn mostly from middle-class, white families and limit understanding of the experiences of culturally diverse populations in the United States (Edin & Kefalas, 2005; Hansen, 2005; Lareau, 2003; Piña & Bengston, 1993; Saginak & Saginak, 2005). Familialistic cultures, such as Latinos, reportedly maintain their patriarchal family arrangements (Hansen, 2005). This raises the question of whether cultural changes in the dominant population affect the family culture and structure of groups like Latinos living in the United States.

This study examined whether changes in household labor in the United States have affected the divisions of labor in Latino households by exploring how 35 Latinas view their division of household labor, gender ideology, and marital satisfaction. Using the values and methods of empowerment research (Rappaport, 1990) and the analysis of data through the strengths-based perspective (Saleebey, 1997), contributed to empowerment through education and building community among these women. Insight into how these Latino families are bridging cultures and the affect of living with these changes is an important consideration for human service practitioners.

Community and Family Values

La familia, or the family, in Latino culture serves as the primary social structure and main source of support for individuals (Dana, 1998; Gutiérrez, Yeakley, & Ortega, 2000). The family can encompass not only the nuclear family, but also distant relatives and friends not related by blood. Latinos develop their identity in terms of membership to groups and their commitment to the collective (Gutiérrez et al., 2000). Isolation from extended family and other community members and the emphasis on individualism in the United States may contribute to conflict and distress during the acculturation process.

The value, known as familismo, emphasizes the inviolable bonds of the family, obligation to relatives, duty to help in times of need, and the responsibility to not bring verguenza, or shame, to the family name (Zayas & Halleja, 1988). These values serve to preserve family traditions and social and emotional balances. Other important family values include Machismo, male supremacy and Marianismo, a gender role based on the example of the Virgin Mary. Marianismo defines women roles within a male dominated culture to produce children, care for the household, and be both deferent to her husband and self-sacrificing for her family (Coles, 2006). Latino marital bonds have been historically strong and families are reported to have a highly patriarchal structure (Kane, 2000; Lichter & Landale, 1995). The machismo value may influence Latino men to fulfill the traditionally patriarchal role, but strong marital bonds may also be the result of the Marianismo value of Latinas towards fulfilling their traditional role as mothers.

Division of Household Labor

Research suggests that the division of household labor is influenced by gender attitudes, time availability, work status, income, and the education level of each partner (Coltrane, 2000; Coltrane, et al., 2004; Greenstein, 1996b; Kroska, 2003; Saginak & Saginak, 2005). Research on Latinos' division of household labor has been contradictory, some stating that more sharing between sexes is present in Latino families than in non-Latino white families, some arguing the opposite (Coltrane 2000; Coltrane, et al., 2004). Latino culture also more closely links work to family, seeing work as a means to family well-being, so that men participating in paid work are seen as contributing to the home (Aryee, Fields & Luk, 1999). The concept of gender appropriate household labor divides tasks into categories of "men's work" and "women's work". Women's work refers to tasks in the home traditionally performed by females: grocery shopping, meal preparation, washing dishes, house cleaning and laundry (Coltrane 2000; Greenstein, 1996b; Kroska, 2003). Those identified as male household tasks are auto maintenance and yard work (Greenstein, 1996b; Kroska, 2003).

Coltrane et al. (2004) found that newer immigrant Mexican men were more likely to participate in feminine-typed interactions with children (shopping, cooking, reading, and indoor games) especially when their wives had to work outside the home. Mexican American men who had lived in the United States longer were less involved in housework than the newer immigrants were. Kane (2000) suggested that the number of years or generations in the United States and the language spoken at home plays a large role in forming Latinos gender ideologies.

Perceptions of Equity and Marital Satisfaction

Inequalities of household division of labor are viewed through the lens of wife's gender ideology (Coltrane, 2000; Greenstein, 1996a; Piña & Bengston, 1993; Saginak & Saginak, 2005). But, gender ideology is affected by both cultural beliefs and socioeconomic status (Joplin, Shaffer, Francesco, & Lau, 2003; Kane, 2000; Korabik, Lero, & Ayman, 2003). Coltrane (2000) claims that both Latino women and men are less likely to perceive the division of labor as unfair to themselves or their spouse.

Research suggests a positive relationship between the division of labor and marital satisfaction. If one is satisfied with the division of household labor, he or she will also be satisfied with the marriage (Coltrane, 2000; Saginak & Saginak, 2005). Wives that are more egalitarian will place more importance on husbands' involvement in household work, will be more likely to make comparisons that will produce dissatisfaction, and will be less willing to accept traditional justification for minimal male contributions to housework (Coltrane, 2000; Coltrane, et al., 2004).

Methods

The participants of this study included 35 Latinas participating in ESL classes. All but two of these women were recent Mexican immigrants. The objective was to empower women by giving them a forum to discuss their lives, build community in order to reduce isolation, and to improve their English language skills in order to maximize their potential in the community. The experiences generated from this study were also intended to aid the social service agency in developing effective programming for the participants.

The research design was community based and combined the approaches and values of empowerment research and feminist research. Empowerment research views the participants from the strengths perspective creating research questions that allow them to discover and utilize their strengths and abilities to improve their lives. Rappaport (1990) explained that people who are isolated or outsiders can gain a voice in influencing their own lives, their families, and communities through empowerment research. Feminist research values emancipating women from structures that have ignored or undervalued their lives and contributions to society (Allen & Baber, 1992).

A questionnaire was developed and used as a teaching session in the ESL classes. It was intended to create a cultural exchange between the researchers and the ESL students. The questions were based on work by Saginak and Saginak (2005) who identified six ways to categorize equity among spouses: shared house-work, mutual and active involvement in childcare, joint decision making, equal access to and

influence over finances, value placed on both partners' work and life goals, and shared emotion work. Lists of tasks associated with maintaining the household were chosen from those identified in the literature as "men's work" and "women's work" (Coltrane, 2000; Greenstein, 1996b; Kroska, 2003; Spitze & Loscocco, 2000). These included tasks such as grocery shopping, meal preparation, washing dishes, house cleaning and laundry for women, and auto maintenance and yard work for men. Additional questions asked about the value they placed on various items such as family of origin, friends, marriage, children, community, and employment. The Latinas were asked to rate their experiences and their marital satisfaction on Likert-type scales. Follow up questions, used in a discussion format, asked the women to talk about their family culture, compare it to the United States, tell us whether they thought their values had changed since relocating, what they liked about being a woman, and their hopes for their children's values.

The questions were written in both Spanish and in English to facilitate bilingual education, cited as a factor that contributes to positive psychological adjustment (Cuellar, et al., 1995; Lopez & Contreras, 2005; Page, 2006). The Spanish translations were critically examined and verified by fluent Spanish speakers to be culturally appropriate and correctly translated.

During one of the class periods the students were taught new English vocabulary regarding marriage, family, and the home. Related concepts were discussed and the meanings were clarified within the group. Each student marked her answers on her own copy of the questionnaire but group interaction was encouraged. Afterwards, a discussion of follow up questions meant to clarify their cultural views was conducted and an audio recording was made. In a usually more structured classroom, this open environment created an opportunity for the students to talk to each other about their lives.

The 35 surveys were analyzed using descriptive statistics, frequencies and cross-tabulation. The audio recordings were transcribed and reviewed independently by both researchers to identify themes. A fluent, native Spanish-language speaker, unassociated with the research, was asked to listen to the recordings, read the transcript to check for accuracy, and interpretation of cultural attitudes and themes. The findings were compared to the relevant theoretical explanations from the literature and analyzed in response to the original research questions.

Results

The results from the questionnaires showed that all 35 of the women were doing the majority of household work. In fact, 32 (91%) of

the women reported doing “more than their share” of household chores, implying that they did not perceive this to be equitable. The household tasks the women reported doing were generally associated with “women’s work” and the men’s tasks were associated with “men’s work” (Coltrane, 2000; Greenstein, 1996b; Kroska, 2003; Spitze & Loscocco, 2000). In lists of women’s work they identified, laundry, washing dishes, making appointments, shopping for groceries, caring for children, preparing meals and cleaning the house as work associated with women. In lists of tasks associated with men they identified auto maintenance, home repair, and outdoor or yard work for men. They also identified tasks associated with both men and women including, driving the family car and driving family members to appointments, shopping for household needs other than groceries, paying bills, and planning trips. The exceptions to these were minimal: One husband did the laundry and one shopped for groceries, one wife was responsible for auto maintenance, one for household repairs, and five women listed outdoor tasks as their responsibility.

Despite the inequality in household work, many of the women still reported seeing various aspects of their situation as fair and said they were “very satisfied” with their marriages. For example, 33 (91%) of the women surveyed reported being “satisfied to very satisfied” in their marriages while 23 (65%) of the women reported that doing more than their share of household chores was fair to both spouses. When asked in the follow-up discussion, “do you think the division of household labor is fair?”, the women continued to describe it as fair but added that they wished the men would contribute more. In spite of doing more housework, and seeing it as fair, 22 (62%) of the women believed they should also be working outside the home to contribute to the family finances. These 22 women also said that men and women should both have the opportunity to pursue a career. Only five of them worked outside the home for pay.

Caring for children was cited by 28 (80%) of the participants as a task their culture of origin typically associated specifically with women. Although, 33 (91%) of the women reported that they were primary caregivers to their children (two of the women did not have children), when asked whether they believed women should be solely responsible for caring for their children, 33 (91%) women disagreed or strongly disagreed. During the follow-up discussion, when asked, “if you could change one thing about the division of labor in your home, what would it be?” those with children said they wished their husbands would contribute more to caring for and educating children. All the women reported that the father was very important to raising children.

When the women were asked how much they thought they con-

tributed to childcare in comparison with their husbands' contribution, 30 (85%) reported feeling that they did more than their share of the childcare. Yet, of these, 24 rated this arrangement as fair to both spouses. When this was compared to their marital satisfaction, of the 24 who rated the arrangement as fair, 14 believed that they did much more than their share but still reported being very satisfied with their marriage.

When the follow-up questions were discussed with the women, in addition to discussion about childcare, fatherhood and housework, three other themes recurred in the discussion that seemed to carry importance for them. When asked, "do you think your values have changed since moving to the US?", every woman answered without hesitation and with conviction, "No." The women told us they were proud of this fact and discussed their hopes that their children would be grounded in the same values. The women were asked to rate the importance of having a job, their friends, their family of origin, their marriage, and children. All 35 of the women rated children as an important aspect of their lives. Children were rated as the most important by 31(88%). Family of origin and marriage were the next most important aspects of their lives.

Another important theme in the discussion was that the women viewed themselves as different from women in the United States. One explained that women in the United States have more freedom and choice. Several of the others chimed in with examples such as education, work, whether or not to have children, taking children to daycare, the amount of housework they have to do, and the freedom to spend money. Although they recognized the cultural differences in women's rights and roles, they did not perceive themselves as having those same rights. The women said although they wanted to maintain their cultural values, they also desired the freedom and choices women had in the United States.

The third theme was in response to a question asking, "What do you like about being a woman?" The women enjoyed talking about the question, laughing at whether the researcher was referring to what their husbands liked about women or what they liked. It seemed that they all enjoyed being women and expressed great pride in their uniquely female characteristics. Their list of positive female characteristics included the ability to have children, being open, sensitive, strong, loving, humble, understanding, loyal and hard working. Motherhood was especially cherished by the participants both in their answers on the questionnaire and in the follow-up discussion. The answers the women gave were complex and sometimes seemed contradictory, but the descriptions of why they liked being women demonstrated the value they placed on their gender role.

Discussion

Although the majority claim that both women and men should care for children, be able to pursue a career, and contribute to household chores, the majority are still the sole caregivers of their children, do not have a career, and believe they are managing a large percentage of housework. They perceive that they are doing “more than their share” of both housework and childcare and still, they see their situation as not only being fair, but also wishing they could also be employed in order to contribute to the household finances. Since we did not ask about their financial need to work, it is difficult to know if this response is related to an inadequate family income. However, Latino culture more closely links work to family, seeing work as a means to family well-being (Aryee, et al., 1999). In addition, some research shows that division of labor in Latino households is more equitable if both partners are working (Coltrane 2000; Coltrane, et al., 2004; Kroska, 2003). Participating in paid work may be another way to contribute to the well-being of the family or to mediate the amount of housework for which they were responsible. The confusing messages from the women may be the result of the intersection of their original cultural beliefs, their socioeconomic status, and the influence of their new culture.

The fact that these women report agreeing with gender equalizing statements, such as sharing of household work, childcare, and pursuit of careers for both, seems to point to a change in their traditional values. However, when asked if their values have changed, all answered no. They were clearly aware of American cultural roles for women, and described them in positive ways using word such as “freedom” and “choice”, but did not believe that they had those freedoms and choices. The women said they valued womanhood and were not unhappy about the gendered role they were expected to fulfill. Their lists of female characteristics, including words like “strong” and “hard-working”, suggested that they believed their gender roles important in society.

During the discussion, when one woman reported that she was dissatisfied with her marriage, a few of the other women publicly chastised her for saying so, arguing that if she was still married she must be satisfied. This exchange, clearly disapproving of the woman’s disclosure, led the researchers to wonder whether reports of marital satisfaction were also culturally conditioned. The Latino cultural values of machismo, male supremacy; and Marianismo, the wife’s role of not only producing children but being submissive to her husband; familismo, emphasizing the inviolable bonds of the family, and the responsibility to not bring verguenza, or shame, to the family name may have all come into play during this exchange. The two women without children gener-

ally rated satisfaction with aspects of their marriage more negatively. The negative answers may be related to their perception of their inability to fulfill the Marianismo value. This value may also contribute to the women's ability to both agree with gender equity statements and to be satisfied with their marital arrangements when they have children.

For Latinas, especially those who may be undocumented immigrants having limited interactions with those outside their family, and experiencing discrimination in the larger community, social isolation can contribute to social, developmental, and health problems such as depression and anxiety (Dion & Dion, 2001; Elder, et al., 2005). Preserving family traditions, social, and emotional balances in Latino culture may help them function more easily within their bicultural context (Coles, 2006; Dana, 1998; Gutiérrez et al., 2000; Mayo-Quñones & Helfgot, 2003). The collective nature of the Latino culture points to the importance of providing opportunities for recent immigrants, in the absence of large family groups, to interact with others who, at least, share their culture and values. Strengths-based programming that builds on the values of community and family is likely to aid in the acculturation process by limiting isolation and stress and promoting positive family functioning. Growth in their bicultural and bilingual knowledge will help them participate more easily in the dominant culture.

While there are limitations to this research and our ability to generalize the findings, including the language differences, the group setting used for data collection, and the small number of participants all from one local agency, the outcome of the study contributed to the empowerment of the women. The methods used helped to build community among them. During the lively discussion of their lives, the women were able to process their concerns and experiences and give advice and support to each other. They improved their English language skills, found words to describe their observations and feelings, and were proud of their new abilities. Additionally, the findings of this study provide data that maybe useful as a benchmark for Latinas experiences shortly after immigration. Follow-up studies may be helpful as various phases of the acculturation process develop. Using this method with a larger sample in a larger geographic region would contribute to understanding the experiences of this population.

Conclusion

This research suggests that as our national debate concerning immigration continues, supportive programming for Latinas, that gives attention to cultural differences may be especially useful to promote individual empowerment as well as integration into the community and

greater society. Understanding the needs of new Latino families given the growing population is important for professionals concerned about Latino families. Empowerment research strategies, with their practical implications for giving a voice to those who may be isolated, emancipating women, and giving them the tools to build on their strengths and abilities to improve their own lives, should be considered as study of Latino families continues.

References

- Allen, K. R., & Baber, K. M. (1992). Ethical and epistemological tension in applying a postmodern perspective to feminist research. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, 16, 1-15.
- Aryee, S., Fields, D., & Luk, V. (1999). A cross-cultural test of a model of the work-family interface. *Journal of Management*, 25, 491-511.
- Coles, R. (2006). *Race & family: A structural approach*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Coltrane, S. (2000). Research on household labor: Modeling and measuring the social embeddedness of routine family work. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 62, 1208-1233.
- Coltrane, S., Parke, R. D., & Adams, M. (2004). Complexity of father involvement in low-income Mexican-American families. *Family Relations*, 53, 179-189.
- Cuellar, I., Arnold, B., & Maldonado, R. (1995). Acculturation rating scale for Mexican Americans—II: A revision of the original ARSMA scale. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Science*, 17(3), 275-304.
- Dana, R. H. (1998). Projective assessment of Latinos in the United States: Current realities, problems, and prospects. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology*, 4, 165-184.
- De Ruijter, E., Treas, J. K., & Cohen, P. N. (2005). Outsourcing the gender factory: living arrangements and service expenditures on female and male tasks. *Social Forces*, 84, 1, 305-328.
- Dion, K. K., & Dion, K. L. (2001). Gender and cultural adaptation in immigrant families. *The Journal of Social Issues*, 57(3), 511-522.
- Edin, K., & Kefalas, M. (2005). *Promises I Can Keep: Why Poor Women Put Motherhood Before Marriage*. California: University of California Press.
- Elder, J. P., Broyles, S. L., Brennan, J. J., de Nuncio, M. L. Z., Nader, P. R. (2005). Acculturation, parent-child acculturation, differential, and chronic disease risk factors in a Mexican-American population. *Journal of Immigrant Health*, 7(1), 1-9.
- Greenstein, T. N. (1996a). Gender ideology and perceptions of the fairness of the division of household labor: Effects on marital quality. *Social Forces*, 74, 1029-1042.
- Greenstein, T. N. (1996b). Husbands' participation in domestic labor: Interactive effects of wives' and husbands' gender ideologies. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 58, 585-595.
- Gutiérrez, L., Yeakley, A., & Ortega, R. (2000). Educating students for social

- work with Latinos: Issues for the new millennium. *Journal of Social Work Education*, 36, 541-557.
- Hansen, K. V. (2005). *Not-So-Nuclear Families: Class, Gender, and Networks of Care*. New Jersey: Rutgers University Press.
- Jacobs, J. A. & Gerson, K. (2004). *The Time Divide: Work, Family, and Gender Inequality*. Cambridge, Harvard University Press.
- Joplin, J. R. W., Shaffer, M. A., Francesco, A. M., & Lau, T. (2003). The macro-environment and work-family conflict: Development of a cross-cultural comparative framework. *International Journal of Cross Cultural Management*, 3, 305-328.
- Kane, E. W. (2000). Racial and ethnic variations in gender-related attitudes. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 26, 419-439.
- Korabik, K., Lero, D. S., & Ayman, R. (2003). A multi-level approach to cross-cultural work-family research. *International Journal of Cross Cultural Management*, 3, 289-303.
- Kroska, A. (2003). Investigating gender differences in the meaning of household chores and child care. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 65(2), 456-473.
- Lareau, A. (2003). *Unequal childhoods: Class, race, and family life*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Levey, A. (2005). Liberalism, adaptive preferences, and gender equality. *Hypatia*, 20, i4, 127-144.
- Lichter, D. T., & Landale, N. S. (1995). Parental work, family structure, and poverty among Latino children. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 57, 346-354.
- Lopez, I. R., & Contreras, J. M. (2005). The best of both worlds: Bicultural-ity, acculturation, and adjustment among young mainland Puerto Rican mothers. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 36(2), 192.
- Mayo-Quinones, Y., & Helfgot, R. P. R. (2003). Immigrant Latino populations in the United States: Developing a cross-cultural perspective for social work education. *Social Work Forum*, 36, 35-57.
- Page, R. L. (2006). Acculturation in Mexican immigrants: A concept analysis. *Journal of Holistic Nursing*, 24(4), 270-278.
- Piña, D. L., & Bengston, V. L. (1993). The division of household labor and wives' happiness: Ideology, employment, and perceptions of support. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 55, 901-912.
- Rappaport, J. (1990). Research methods and the empowerment social agenda. In P. Tolan, C. Keys, F. Chertock, & L. Jason (Eds.), *Researching community psychology: Issues of theory and methods*, 51-63. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.
- Renk, K., Roberts, R., Roddenberry, A., Luick, M., Hillhouse, S., Meehan, C., Oliveros, A., Phares, V. (2003). Mothers, fathers, gender role, and time parents spend with their children. *Sex Roles*, 48(7/8), 305-315.
- Rodriguez, N., Mira, C. B., Paez, N. D., Myers, H. F. (2007). Exploring the complexities of familism and acculturation: Central constructs for people of Mexican origin. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 39(1/2), 61-77.

- Saginak, K. A., & Saginak, M. A. (2005). Balancing work and family: Equity, gender, and marital satisfaction. *The Family Journal: Counseling and Therapy for Couples and Families*, 13, 162-166.
- Saleebey, D. (1997). *The strength perspective in social work practice*. New York: Longman.
- Sayer, L. C. (2005). Gender, time and inequality: trends in women's and men's paid work, unpaid work and free time. *Social Forces*, 84, il, 285-304.
- Spitze, G. & Loscocco, K. A. (2000). The labor of Sisyphus? Women's and men's reactions to housework. *Social Science Quarterly*, 81, 1087-1101.
- US Census Bureau (2007). *Minority population tops 100 million*. Retrieved December 13, 2007, from www.census.gov/press-release/www/releases/archives/population/010048.html
- Zayas, L. H., & Palreja, J. (1988). *Puerto Rican familism: Considerations for family therapy*. *Family Relations*, 37, 260-264.

Students' Lived Experiences of Practice Courses Presented Through the Research Poem

*Rich Furman,
University of Washington, Tacoma*

*D. Bruce Taylor and Meredith Badinelli
University of North Carolina at Charlotte*

Abstract

This article explores the use of the research poem in presenting the lived experience of students in human service practice courses. This innovative method of qualitative research allows for the presentation of data in a compressed yet emotionally evocative manner. The article briefly explores the uses of the research poem, and presents a methodology that is positioned on the boundaries of the humanities and social research. Two research poems are presented as an illustration of the method.

Activities to Enhance the Cultural Competence of Human Services Students

Introduction

When human service educators explore the impact of their teaching, too often they neglect the perspective of their students. Standardized and quantitative measures may at times assess what educators believe students should learn, yet may miss other important aspects of learning, such as how students construct their educational experience. This is particularly true of standard university course evaluations, which are normally too vague and global to tune into more psychosocial aspects of student learning. Since human service courses often focus on the need for students to develop emotional insight and practice wisdom, evaluative methods are needed that are able to more fully account for affective realms not assessed in standard course evaluations.

Qualitative methods allow for contextual and expanded data that explore people's perceptions, feelings and motivations (Denzin, 1997). Qualitative data may also capture more fully the "lived experience" of people in complex social situations (Barone & Eisner, 1997), such as being a student in a practice-oriented class. Qualitative data can help

teachers form new insights about their own teaching and students' learning (Creswell, 2003). One of the challenges researchers face is to present this data in a way that effectively preserves the meaning of the data (Cole & Knowles, 2001). Traditionally, various qualitative methods have been used to meet this challenge. Often, qualitative data are presented with a minimum of data reduction, as thick descriptions and narrative passages. The advantage of these texts is that they present the complete experiences of research participants as they are described by participants, with all their complexity and nuances preserved. However, these thick descriptions may not allow consumers of research to identify overall themes, and therefore may not increase their overall insight about the phenomenon being observed. Additionally, the most important insights, such as feelings or core beliefs, may be hidden by the presentation of too much information. To resolve this concern, new methods of data representation have been developed that present people's experiences in an evocative and condensed manner. Qualitative researchers have used various artistic medium as a means of presenting the lived experiences of their research participants (Eisner, 1981; Finley & Knowles, 1995). Expressive arts, including music, poetry and dance, are vehicles that can be used to adequately and powerfully present qualitative data while fully engaging the consumer of research. Such methods may help researchers preserve the best of qualitative (preserving the lived experience) and quantitative research (data reduction and parsimony).

This article presents a sampling of the results of an exploratory study of students' lived experiences in two experientially-based practice courses. The main research question that the study sought to answer was: 1) what did students perceive to be the most important lessons that they learned about themselves during their practice courses? Data is presented through the "Research poem" a recent innovation in qualitative methodology that is the focus on this article (Furman, 2003/2004; Willis, 2002). The research poems allows for the presentation of complex data in a relatively condensed form. It helps to preserve the "fullness" of data while allowing it to be consumable. As Savishinsky (2006) notes, "every story of a life is a condensation" (p. 5). In using poetry in research, post-modern researchers seek to use the condensed nature of a poem as a container for presenting the affective truths of people's stories.

In the next section of this article, the authors will discuss the nature of the research poem. This will be followed by a discussion of the specific methodology of this study. Next, research poems will be presented as examples of data into students lived experiences of their practice courses. Lastly, limitations, implications and concluding thoughts are presented.

The Research Poem

Expressive and post-modern researchers have searched for evocative ways of contending with what has been referred to as a “crisis of representation” (Atkinson, Coffey & Delamont, 2003). These researchers have advocated for methods that allow researchers not to cool off and boil down data, as is done through traditional data reduction methods, but to find ways of expanding and enlivening their findings. According to Willis (2002), such research seeks not to analyze or constrain meaning, but to elaborate and enhance it.

Various authors have utilized the research poem in their research towards this end. Research poems can be defined as the use of poetic forms, structures, styles and method for data representation and analysis in qualitative research. Willis (2002) prefers the term “poetized reflections” to draw a distinction between poetry as a literary form, and that which is used for research purposes. Regardless of the term used, qualitative researchers who use the research poem view it as one aspect of a research process; poetry is a device to help researchers in the process of analyzing and presenting data. This differs from the poet’s creation of literary works, in which the creation of an aesthetically pleasing poem is an end in itself. In creating research poems, aesthetic devices are tools to be used in the presentation of data, and are viewed as secondary to honestly and truthfully presenting the data.

One of the earlier uses of the research poem comes from Richardson (1992), who took interview data of women’s experiences of family life and transformed them into lyrical poems. These poems vividly and accurately depicted the way research participants understood their family lives, and how they coped with the day to day struggles of existence.. The poems were formed using the exact words of the participants, but were rearranged based-upon the researcher’s sense of the data. The poems are therefore empirically grounded in the data, yet also represent the researcher’s own interpretations and insights (as expressed by her position of words and lines). Poindexter (1997, 2002) has also used the research poem for presentation of qualitative data gathered through traditional methods on HIV-affected caregivers. Data taken from ethnographic interviews was condensed into research poems using methods borrowed from linguistics, highlighting the speech patterns of the participants.

Furman and other authors have applied the research poem to the study of diverse research subjects such as social development in Latin America (Furman, 2004a), a son’s experience of his father’s cancer (Furman, 2004b), a bicultural Native women’s experience (Langer & Furman, 2004), and an emergency room visit from a patient’s perspective (Furman, 2006). These studies highlight the importance of the poet-

ic structures and forms that are used in data representation. The authors demonstrated how representation is not merely an inconsequential afterthought in the research endeavor, but is highly implicated in the way in which data is received. Some forms of poetic representation can accentuate emotion, while others can help provide a sense of increased clarity or focus. Furman (2006) found that the poem used in this present study, the pantoum, powerfully accentuates and highlights affect through the repetition of lines throughout the poem.

It is important to note that the purpose of research such as this is not generalizable. Post-modern qualitative methods seek to present the textures of multiple voices, of multiple truths (Ellis & Flaherty, 1992). The traditionally, positivist concepts of reliability and validity are not appropriate guides by which to judge this type of research (Aguinaldo, 2003; Lincoln & Guba; 1985; Patton, 1990). The data can be considered valuable if it helps the reader develop new insights into the problem or experience being studied. Swingewood, (1991) notes that research has value to the degree that it helps investigators develop an increased understanding of the processes and experiences by which people construct complex social realities. These insights are often idiosyncratic to a given event or situation at a given time. Further, the methods used in this study may not only be used for the purposes of inquiry, but as a tool to help instructors develop increased empathy towards their students. Langer & Furman (2005) demonstrate how these methods can help instructors and students alike understand the complex experiences of learners in regard to their professional development. Richardson (2001) suggests five potential criteria to assess a monograph: Substantive contribution, aesthetic merit, reflexivity, impact, and expression of reality. The authors encourage the reader to assess the merits of the sample data presented by these criteria.

Methods

Data was collected in two sections of two graduate courses, individual and group practice. The first author taught these courses utilizing an experiential method he learned while teaching in a human services program at a community college. This method relies upon having students engage in the actual process of helping in the context of the course. In the course on individual practice, students were assigned to helping triads in which they adopted the role of helper, helpee, and consultant. Students were informed that they are not to role-play in their triads, but were to actually bring real issues to the relationship. Students were told not to bring unresolved conflicts to the sessions (should any exist), but instead to explore issues about which many individuals

could benefit from sharing: their current levels of stress, the demands of having multiple roles, current relationships, career aspirations, etc. The group work course was taught in a similar manner. The students were assigned to groups (of approximately eight students each), in which they were members. The group was conceptualized as a growth and support group. Each week, one student took their turn being the leader of the group, only to “shake off” their leader role and become a group member the following week. The instructor worked at helping students set boundaries in order to make the course a safe and ethical experience, and was ultimately responsible for the students’ well-being. If students brought up issues that needed professional intervention, the student was referred to the University’s counseling office. While it is not the role of the human service educator to provide therapy to students, psychosocial stressors frequently arise in the context of human service education, be it classroom or field experiences. In some ways, it is preferable that student issues surface with other students or with their teachers during their education, than with vulnerable and needy clients. The authors of this article recognize this is a controversial point, and one that should be discussed by faculty prior to the initiation of evocative, experiential methods.

Reflective writing exercises that stimulate narrative reflection have become a valuable tool in qualitative research (Ellis & Bochner, 2000). These methods stimulate student introspection and thought, and often can generate insights that cannot be procured by more traditional methods. This generative quality is due to the nature of automatic writing exercises, which encourage less censored and edited written reflections. Since one of the main goals of human service professional education is to develop practitioners capable of self reflection (Furman, 2003/2004; Schon, 1983), this process not only can be valuable in terms of collecting data, but may also be used to encourage student growth and development. It creates conditions that foreground the “inside-out and the outside-in movements of knowledge” that are part of the dual nature of learning (Shulman, 1999). This form also acknowledges the discursive and multivoiced nature of learning described by Bakhtin (1982). Meaning does not reside in either the speaker or listener but is created at the point of contact between speaker and listener (in this case within and across the triad). Meaning and understanding from this perspective is polysemous, a product not only of the speaker but also of the interaction between speaker and listener.

Data was collected over four semesters, from a total of four classes, two sections of individual therapy and two sections of group. The total attendance for these courses was 52 students, 39 elected to turn in their responses. Students were given two free-writing/reflective exercis-

es from the following stem: In this class I learned about myself _____. Students were asked to write for ten to fifteen minutes on this topic. The exercise was conducted after students were told of their final grade. Students were informed that the exercises would not be read until after final grades were posted in the university computer system. Additionally, students were asked not to put their name on the paper. The exercises were collected by a student and placed into a sealed envelope.

The data was analyzed using traditional content analysis methods (Krippendorff, 1980; Mayring, 2000), using a five-stage model previously used by the first author (Furman, Langer, Sanchez & Negi, 2007). In the first stage, data was read without explicitly looking for themes or patterns in order for the researcher to familiarize him/herself with the data. During the second stage, general ideas were noted in the margins. At the third stage, the data was coded on a line-by-line basis. In the fourth round of coding, broader themes and patterns were induced from the more specific codes. Finally, two weeks after the fourth round, the researcher used the same coding method in an attempt to discern additional themes or negative examples. Once themes were identified, the data was then re-represented into research poems. For this study, the researchers have chosen to present the poems in the form of the Pantoum. The Pantoum, a French/Malaysian form characterized by an ordered pattern of repeating lines, is excellent for conveying affect in highly personal data (Furman, 2006). Introduced to the West by Victor Hugo, the repetition of lines can have a haunting effect. The juxtapositioning of lines in new orders forces researchers to carefully consider the connoted meanings implied by such positioning, and allow for the possibility of rich and new insights.

Data Presentation

The selections that are presented were chosen for several reasons. First, each is representative of themes and issues explored by the students. Each was also selected for its evocative, emotional quality. It should be noted that the data is not meant to be representative, but to demonstrate how the research poem can evocatively present data around students' lived classroom experiences.

The first poem presents findings typical of students who learn that while they have very real limitations, they are also far more competent than they first believed. As students become more secure, they are able to more humbly assess their real strengths and areas of need.

Pantoum #1

I have a ways to go before I know
who I am or what I want to do,
this unknowing, however, is no longer filled with anxiety.
I learned that I am braver than I thought.

who I am or what I want to do,
I need to actively practice compassion,
I learned that I am braver than I thought.
There is a sense of promise.

I need to actively practice compassion,
to keep it fresh in my everyday work.
There is a sense of promise.
I am good with people, but I will become more.

To keep it fresh in my everyday work.
this unknowing, however, is no longer filled with anxiety.
I am good with people, but I will become more.
I have a ways to go before I know

The following passage is fairly typical of a number of students who struggle with the process and pace of helping. Many find themselves wanting to give clients answers that they might not be ready to receive, or that might not fit the context of their lives. Learning to live in the process and to be patient is an important lesson identified nearly by one quarter of the students. Notice how the Pantoum allows for the expression of conflicting feelings by the way different lines are juxtaposed.

Pantoum #2

I want to have the right answers
I want to lead my client though their processing
I've learned that it does not work that way.
I want to be perfect in my responses-to rescue them,

I want to lead my client though their processing
I have to wait and listen and let the client lead
I want to be perfect in my responses-to rescue them
They just need to feel supported as they figure it out

I have to wait and listen and let the client lead

The biggest thing is to just relax.
They just need to feel supported as they figure it out
Most important is the relationship.

I have to wait and listen and let the client lead
I've learned that it does not work that way.
Most important is the relationship.
I want to have the right answers

Conclusion

As mentioned, data such as this should not be viewed as being generalizable, but as a phenomenological method to study the lived experience of human service students, or even clients in human services agencies. Understanding how individuals experience their education or human service is a valuable reason for engaging in research (Goldstein, 1999; Kidd & Tusaie, 2004). It may also become part of an overall strategy of evaluating the educational experience in human service education courses. Expressive methods such as this may be used along with other data, such as peer-assessment, quantitative surveys, and even focus groups as a means of curriculum development. In order to understand how our courses impact students, methods must be used that present their experiences in all its emotional richness. While course evaluations are useful, qualitative methods that preserve the affective quality of students' voices may provide useful data to educators. We see the research poem as a tool that can invite collaboration with students and allow for a more discursive approach to evaluation. The research poem, and other methods associated with the 7th Movement of Qualitative Research (Denzin & Lincoln, 2003) are becoming increasingly valuable tools for qualitative human services researchers and others in higher education. By engaging in data analysis and the creating research poems, the instructor/researcher may become more familiar with their data; the actual lived experiences of their students. By becoming increasingly immersed in the perceptions of students, instructors can evaluate their courses from a more empirically-grounded perspective.

This article presents one example of how these methods can be used. Researchers are encouraged to experiment with different methods of data presentation as a means of giving life to their research participants' experiences. The arts are becoming an increasingly important tool for researchers who have realized that the best of our insights may be lost when they are not presented in an engaging and evocative manner (Eisner, 1991). By sharing these poems with their students, faculty and researchers can engage in dialogue with them about the nature educa-

tion, thereby modeling the reflective processes that effective practitioners need to develop.

References

- Aguinaldo, J. P. (2003). Rethinking validity in qualitative research from a social constructionist perspective: From "Is this valid research?" to "What is this research valid for?". *The Qualitative Report*, 9(1), 127-135. Retrieved August 1, 2004, from <http://www.nova.edu/ssss/OR/OR9-1/aguinaldo.pdf>
- Atkinson, P., Coffey, A., & Delamont, S. (2003). *Key themes in qualitative research*. Walnut Creek, CA: Alta Mira Press.
- Barone, T., & Eisner, E. (1997). *Arts-based educational research*. In R. M. Jaeger (Ed.), *Contemporary methods for research in education*. Washington, DC: American Education Research Association.
- Bakhtin, M. M. (1982). *The dialogic imagination: Four essays* (Reprint Ed.). Austin, TX University of Texas Press.
- Creswell, J. W. (2003). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Cole, A. L., & Knowles, G. (2001). *Lives in context: The art of life history research*. Walnut Creek, CA: Altamira Press.
- Denzin, N. K. (1997). *Interpretive ethnography: Ethnographic practices in the 21st Century*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (Eds.). (2003). *The landscape of qualitative research: Theories and issues* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Ellis, C., & Bochner, A. P. (2000). Autoethnography, personal narrative, reflexivity: researcher as subject. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.) *Handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Ellis, C., & Flaherty, M. (1992). *Investigating subjectivity: Research on lived experience*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Eisner, E. W. (1981). On the differences between scientific and artistic approaches to qualitative research. *Educational Researcher*, 10(4), 5-9.
- Eisner, E. W. (1991). *The enlightened eye. Qualitative inquiry and the enhancement of educational practice*. New York: Macmillan.
- Finley, S., & Knowles, J. G. (1995). Researcher as artist/artist as researcher. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 1(1), 110-142.
- Furman, R. (2003/2004). Poetry as a tool for self reflection in social work education. *Arête*, 27(2), 65-70.
- Furman, R. (2004a). Poetry as qualitative data for exploring social development and human experience in Latin America. *Journal of Latino-Latin American Studies*, 1(3), 81-103.
- Furman, R. (2004b). Using poetry and narrative as qualitative data: Exploring a father's cancer through poetry. *Family, Systems & Health*, 22(2), 162-170.
- Furman, R. (2006). Poetic forms and structures in qualitative health research. *Qualitative Health Research*, 16(4), 560-566.
- Furman, R., Langer, C. L., Sanchez, T. W., & Negi, N. J. (2007). A qualitative

- study of immigration policy and practice dilemmas for social work students. *Journal of Social Work Education*, 43(1), 133-146.
- Goldstein, H. (1999). The limits and art of understanding in social work practice. *Families in Society*, 80(4), 385-395.
- Kidd, L. A., & Tusaie, K. R. (2004). Disconfirming beliefs: The use of poetry to know the lived experience of student nurses in mental health clinics. *Issues in Mental Health Nursing*, 25(4), 403-414.
- Krippendorff, K. (1980). *Content analysis. An Introduction to its Methodology*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Langer, C. L. , & Furman, R. (2004). Exploring identity and assimilation. Research and interpretative poems. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 5(2). Retrieved August 15, 2007, from <http://www.qualitative-research.net/fqs-texte/2-04/2-04langerfurman-e.htm>
- Langer, C., & Furman, R. (2005). Beyond the ethnographic interview: The research poem as a tool for teaching culturally sensitive social work with Natives. *Arête*, 28(2), 93-99.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Mayring, P. (2000). Qualitative content analysis. *Forum: Qualitative Research Forum*, 1(2). Retrieved January 18, 2007, from <http://www.qualitative-research.net/fqs-texte/2-00/2-00mayring-e.htm>
- Patton, M. Q. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods* (2nd ed.). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Poindexter, C. C. (1997). Poetry as data analysis: Listening to the narratives of older minority HIV-affected caretakers. *Reflections: Narratives of Professional Helping*, 4(3), 22-25.
- Poindexter, C. C. (2002). Meaning from methods: Re-presenting narratives of an HIV-affected caregiver. *Qualitative Social Work*, 1(1), 59-78.
- Richardson, L. (1992). *The consequences of poetic representation*. In C. Ellis & M. G. Flaherty (Eds.), *Investigating subjectivity: Research on lived experience* (pp. 125-173). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Richardson, L. (2000). *Writing: A Method of Inquiry*. In Norman K. Denzin and Yvonna S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (2nd ed., pp. 923-949). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Savishinsky, J. S. (2006). First impressions and last words: Condensing elderly lives into three line haiku. *Anthropology & Aging Quarterly*, 27(4), 5-8.
- Schon, D. A. (1983). *The reflective practitioner: How professionals think in action*. New York: Basic Books.
- Swingewood, A. (1991). *A short history of sociological thought*. New York: St. Martin's.
- Shulman, L. S. (1999). Taking learning seriously. *Change*, 31(4), 10-17.
- Willis, P. (2002). Poetry and poetics in phenomenological research. *Indo-Pacific Journal of Phenomenology*, 3(1), 1-19

Working with Self-Injury: Ten Guidelines for Human Service Professionals

Laurie M. Craigen, PhD, LPC

Abstract

Self-injury, specifically cutting, is an increasing phenomenon among the adolescent and young adult population. Human service professionals in a variety of different arenas are likely to encounter an individual who self-injures or have already worked with such clients. Thus, it is imperative that human service professionals gain a holistic understanding of working with clients who self-injure. This manuscript includes ten guidelines for human service professionals to consider when working with this population.

Introduction

The topic of self-injury, specifically cutting, has gained increased attention in professional journals as well as in the media through blockbuster movie hits such as *Girl Interrupted*, *Thirteen*, and *The Secretary*. Despite this recent resurgence, self-injury is not a new phenomenon to human service professionals. Up until the late eighties, self-injury was viewed as another form of suicidal behavior (Favazza, 2006; Stone & Sias, 2003) or a behavior associated exclusively with Borderline Personality Disorder (McAllister, 2003). In the past two decades, researchers have begun to adopt a broader conceptualization of self-injury, considering the biological, psychological, sociological, and cultural factors that may contribute to acts of self-injury. Further, behaviors including self-cutting, self-burning, self-hitting, interference with wound healing, hair pulling, and eating disorders are beginning to be categorized as distinct types of self-injury (Trepal & Wester, 2005).

Incidences of self-injury appear to be escalating dramatically, especially among the adolescent and young adult population (Nock & Prinstein, 2005). As rates of self-injury increase, human service professionals in a variety of different settings will likely encounter individuals who self-injure, or have already worked with such clients (Nock & Prinstein, 2005). In many cases, human service professionals serve as the first line of defense for individuals who self-injure. That is, they are often the case workers, residential staff, intake interviewers, intake coordinators, or child advocates that initially gather information and respond to an individual who is harming himself or herself.

Despite the increased rates and rise in public interest of self-injury, many human service professionals report being overwhelmed and feel unprepared to work with clients who harm themselves (Austin & Kortum, 2004). Additionally, human service professionals may feel uncomfortable working with clients who self-injure and may feel that they are unable to make an impact on the behavior (Kiselica & Zila, 2001). Further, working with clients who self-injure presents particular challenges to human service professionals since there are no universal treatment guidelines for helping professionals (Muehkenkamp, 2006; Trepal & Wester, 2007). Thus, human service professionals will benefit from a greater understanding of self-injury to insure that those who engage in the behavior can receive effective care.

This manuscript aims to increase knowledge and understanding of self-injury by providing human service professionals with strategies for working effectively with individuals who self-injure. The following ten strategies are informed by a review of the research and scholarly writings on the topic of self-injury.

10 Strategies for Working with Clients Who Self-Injure

Strategy #1: Educate yourself

Prior to working with clients who self-injure, human services professionals have an ethical obligation to attain adequate training and knowledge on the topic of self-injury (Trepal & Wester, 2007). In order to increase knowledge and awareness, human service professionals are encouraged to immerse themselves in the literature and attend workshops or conferences specific to self-injury. Additionally, agencies should distribute handouts or brochures on the topic of self-injury and should hold regular in-service trainings on the topic of self-injury. First and foremost, trainings can aim to eliminate the negative stigma, misunderstanding, and discomfort associated with self-injury.

In early trainings, the following questions could be asked to human service workers:

1. What are your feelings about individuals who self-injure?
2. What words come to your mind when you think of an individual who harms themselves?
3. Why do you think people harm themselves?
4. What stereotypes can you identify regarding individuals who self-injure?

The aforementioned questions are designed to help participants explore values, assumptions, and biases and can serve as a catalyst for group discussion. Further, an open dialogue can help human service professionals develop empathy and create new and different ways of

conceptualizing self-injury (White, Trepal & Nolan, 2002).

In addition to trainings, human service education programs should introduce the topic of self-injury to students. Pre-service instruction on self-injury is imperative (Craigien & Foster, 2008). Thus, information and knowledge about self-injury should be infused into the required internship as well as additional core classes. Additionally, human service programs could conduct workshops on the topic of self-injury and make these workshops readily available to students.

Strategy #2: Include self-injury on agency intake forms

As mentioned previously, human service professionals often serve as intake coordinators or intake interviewers. The purpose of an intake interview is to collect information that will help human service professionals assess client needs. Generally, intake forms utilized in helping interviews are designed to compile information relevant to client demographics, presenting problems, history of similar problems, and suicidal ideation, etc. (Kanel, 2008). Questions related to self-injury are oftentimes omitted from intake documentation. However, human service agencies are encouraged to consider including criteria that would appropriately assess for self-injurious behaviors in clients. The inclusion of these questions will provide human service professionals with a more comprehensive understanding of their clients (Walsh, 2006). The following questions could be included on an intake form:

1. Have you ever caused physical harm to yourself?
2. Have you ever thought about causing physical harm to yourself?
3. Have you ever cut or burned yourself?
4. Do you have a history of self-injury?
5. Have you ever received treatment for causing physical harm to yourself?

The aforementioned questions are simply a starting point, not an exhaustive list of questions to include on an agency intake form.

Strategy #3: Make Appropriate Referrals

Once self-injury is discovered, either through an intake interview or through other means, human service professionals must recognize the limits and scope of their interventions with self-injury. It is recommended that only licensed mental health professionals with training in the area of self-injury should provide long-term counseling or psychotherapy for individuals who self-injure (Revolutionhealth, 2008.). Thus, human service professionals will play other critical roles with clients who self-injure. For example, many human service professionals will serve as a broker, making referrals and helping clients find and use

the resources they need (Halley, Kopp & Austin, 1998).

The process of making referrals based on level of expertise is an ethical responsibility for human service professionals. The National Organization of Human Services' Ethical Standard 26 states the following: "Human service professionals know the limit and scope of their professional knowledge and offer services only within their knowledge and skill base" (NOHS, 2008). Human service professionals also make referrals when the client has specific needs that the agency does not provide (Halley, Kopp & Austin, 1998). For example, a referral is necessary if the human service agency does not have the resources to work with clients who self-injure.

In order to strengthen the referral process, human service workers are encouraged to create a list of agencies or mental health professionals that have both training and experience in dealing with self-injury as well as access to supervision (Orygen, n.d.). This list should be available to all agency staff members. Additionally, human service professionals are encouraged to talk with helping professionals to find out (a) their experience with self-injury, (b) their treatment philosophy, and (c) how the client can use any of their services offered (Halley, Kopp & Austin, 1998). Most importantly, when making a referral to an outside source it is important that the client does not feel untreatable or undeserving of help. Thus, the human service professional should explain the boundaries of the helping relationship and communicate the benefits of receiving services from a professional who is more extensively trained in the area of self-injury (Orygen, n.d.; White, Trepal & Nolan, 2002).

Strategy #4: Always conduct a suicide risk assessment

While it is important to recognize the limits and scope of their interventions with self-injury, it is just as important for human service professionals to feel confident, comfortable, and knowledgeable about conducting a suicide risk assessment (WhiteKress & Drouhard, 2004). This is an essential step in working with clients that self-injure. In order to conduct a suicide risk assessment, it is critical for human service professionals to understand the similarities and differences between self-injury and a suicide attempt.

Human service professionals should not necessarily assume that every act of self-injury is a suicide attempt nor should the professional immediately rule out suicidality without appropriate assessment. For individuals who self-injure, the intent may be to release tension and many individuals report a sense of relief after the act of self-injury (Klonsky, 2007). Conversely, the goal for one who attempts suicide is to end one's life. In this instance, feelings of hopelessness and despair

are the salient issues (Favazza, 1998; Fawcett et al., 1987). Despite the differences in intent, parallels exist between the two and self-injury can coexist with suicidality (Vivekananda, 2000). Research demonstrates that approximately 55%-85% of individuals who self-injure have made at least one suicide attempt (Favazza & Conterio, 1989; Stanley, Gameroff, Michalsen, Mann, 2001). Additionally, the individual who self-injures is 18 times more likely than the rest of the population to eventually commit suicide (Ryan, Clemmets, & Snelson, 1997).

These findings have direct implications for human service professionals. When working with individuals who self-injure, it is important to assess and be aware of the intent behind each self-injuring act (Stanley et. al, 2001). One way to do this is by administering a suicidality assessment after the client discloses he/she has harmed himself/herself. Undoubtedly, it can be dangerous to assume that all acts of self-injury are separate and distinct from suicide. Therefore, human service professionals should be adequately trained in conducting thorough suicidality assessments when working with clients who self-injure (Walsh, 2006).

Strategy #5: Emphasize Confidentiality

The majority of human service professionals will not provide long-term counseling. Instead, they may be the case worker or intake interviewer, as described previously. Nonetheless, it is still vital for human service workers to know the scope and limits of confidentiality when working with clients who self-injure. First and foremost, human service professionals must weigh the legal responsibilities regarding ethical decision-making when working with individuals who self-injure (Froeschle & Meyer, 2004). The National Organization of Human Services (NOHS) ethical standard four, states the following:

If it is suspected that danger or harm may occur to the client or to others as a result of a client's behavior, the human service professional acts in an appropriate and professional manner to protect the safety of those individuals. This may involve seeking consultation, supervision, and/or breaking the confidentiality of the relationship (NOHS, 2008).

While this ethical standard is logical and written clearly, human service professionals are often unclear about when self-injury becomes dangerous, warranting the helper to breach confidentiality. In other words, what specific risk factors make a client more dangerous than another? For example, if the client's wounds are superficial and he/she reveals that the act of self-injury serves as an emotional release, should one report it? Or, if the repetitive nature of the self-injury has increased, the wounds are deeper, and if the client demonstrates elements of suicidality, should this be reported? Unfortunately, there is no clear-cut

answer to these questions, making it difficult for human service professionals to navigate issues of confidentiality and self-injury.

There are many challenges to managing confidentiality with clients who self-injure (Whitekress & Drouhard, 2004). Nonetheless, human service professionals should become aware of their agency, clinic, or school's policy on reporting incidences of self-injury. If there is not a clear policy, it may benefit the human service professional to advocate for one. Most importantly, it is imperative for human service professionals to know their stance on confidentiality and to immediately communicate this stance to their clients (Whitekress & Drouhard, 2004).

Strategy #6: Develop a self-injury protocol

As previously noted, human service professionals are encouraged to remain aware of their employee's stance on reporting incidences of self-injury. Further, human service professionals are in an ideal position to encourage their employee to develop and institute a self-injury protocol or written policy to guide them in working with self-injury (Wester & Trepal, 2005). A primary goal in the development of a self-injury protocol/written policy is to ensure that all staff members are on the same page and therefore approach and conduct interventions in a similar manner. Self-injury protocols and/or written policies may include but is not limited to the following information. The agency's stance on...

1. Recognizing warning signs related to self-injury.
2. How staff distinguishes between an act of self-injury and a suicidal act.
3. Evaluating past incidences of self-injury.
4. Reporting incidences of self-injury (The confidentiality agreement).
Who should be contacted?
5. Making appropriate psychological, psychiatric or medical referrals for self-injury.
6. Appropriate steps to follow when an individual requires immediate attention.

Once a self-injury protocol is created, it should only be implemented with both adequate and advance training of all staff members (Walsh, 2006).

Strategy #7: Recognize warning signs

Human service professionals should be trained in recognizing the warning signs associated with self-injury. Due to the privacy, secrecy, and shame associated with self-injury (Favazza, 2006), warning signs are subtle and oftentimes difficult to detect. Many individuals who harm themselves go to great lengths to hide their wounds from others.

Thus, in order to provide effective care, human service professionals should be aware of the following warning signs:

1. Unexplained cuts, scratches, or scars.
2. Mood changes including increases in depression, anxiety, aggression.
3. Wearing long sleeves, long pants in warm weather.
4. The appearance of razors, lighters or sharp objects that one would not expect among a person's belongings.
5. The client becomes defensive when asked about the topic of self-injury.
6. Increase in isolative behaviors.

In response to the above warning signs, human service professionals must learn how to acquire training and strategies for broaching the issue of self-injury with clients in a manner that is respectful and supportive.

Strategy #8: Respond without judgment

Mental health professionals have a history of providing inadequate and even harmful interventions to clients who self-injure. Further, many human service professionals lack a clear understanding of self-injury, which may inappropriately lead them to pathologize the behavior (Favazza & Rosenthal, 1993). Oftentimes, professionals erroneously categorize self-injury as a criterion of Borderline Personality Disorder, misidentify the behavior as a suicide attempt, or refuse to work with individuals who self-injure, labeling them as manipulative and difficult to work with (Favazza, 1998). In emergency room settings, individuals who self-injure have reported unethical treatment. For example, women seeking treatment have been sutured without anesthesia, scrubbed with wool surgical sponges on open wounds, and refused medical treatment because their injuries are self-inflicted. These approaches have long-lasting effects upon individuals, resulting in both negative views of the self and helping professionals (Craig & Foster, 2008; Shaw, 2002).

Contrary to these destructive interventions, human service professionals can make a powerful and positive impact on self-injuring clients. Their initial reactions and early communication with a client who self-injures can play an instrumental role in their client requesting and receiving adequate care. Additionally, their responses, no matter how time limited they are, have a definite influence on clients (Craig & Foster, 2008). Thus, human service professionals are encouraged to focus on relationship building with clients who self-injure.

Evidence suggests that the therapeutic relationship, not the specific therapeutic approach, is a significant determinant of beneficial

outcomes for clients (Bachelor & Horvath, 1999; Carkhuff & Benson, 1967). Further, studies indicate that relationship factors account for approximately 30% of client improvement (Lambert, 1992). These results can be directly applied to clients who self-injure. Empathy, understanding, support, and care, are all critical skills for human service professionals to adopt when working with clients who self-injure (Craigén & Foster, 2008; Moyer & Nelson, 2007).

When making an initial contact with a client who self-injures, human service professionals should begin by making non-judgmental responses and empathic statements that demonstrate a willingness to learn about who the client is, beyond their self-injuring behaviors (Moyer & Nelson, 2007). The following is a list of possible questions and statements that human service professionals can make when they discover their client is deliberately harming themselves.

1. "I see your wounds and I can tell that you are in a great deal of pain."
2. "You must really be hurting and I want to help you."
3. "I see you have having a difficult time and I am sorry you feel like you need to hurt yourself in order to feel better".

These empathic responses convey unconditional positive regard for the client and allow the therapist to foster a strong client-helper relationship.

Strategy #9: Advocate for clients who self-injure

In addition to playing a direct helping role with clients who self-injure, human service professionals can also advocate for clients. Advocating for clients is one of the macro skills of a human service professional (Halley, Kopp, & Austin, 1998). Further, it is the ethical obligation of human service professionals to advocate for clients. House and Martin (1998) define advocating as fighting injustices through actions that lead toward improving conditions for both individuals and groups. In regards to providing services to clients who self-injure, this may mean creating a voice for clients so that they can gain access to services that will address and meet the needs of their self-injurious behaviors. It may also mean advocating for new services in communities that do not adequately serve the needs of clients who self-injure. Further, it many mean sharing accurate knowledge with other professionals, colleagues, and the community and debunking myths and inaccurate information about self-injury.

Advocating and working with clients who self-injure in general, takes a great deal of patience and requires a great deal of energy. Thus, efforts should be made towards one's own self-care and self-awareness. Working with clients who self-injure is an intense experience. Thus, it is

important to pay attention to personal emotions, wants, and needs (Deiter & Pearlman, 2000; White Kress, 2003).

Strategy #10: Seek Supervision

The above mentioned guidelines can help human service professionals to structure their stance and philosophy on working with clients who self-injure. However, when working with self-injury, it is important for human service professionals to never work in isolation. There remains a great deal of complexity, confusion, and grey areas surrounding interventions related to self-injury (Deiter & Pearlman, 2000; Levenkron, 1998). Additionally, when working with self-injury, regular supervision sessions should be scheduled to consult with colleagues and supervisors (Craigien & Foster, 2008; Wester & Trepal, 2007).

Summary

Human service professionals are oftentimes the first point of contact for an individual who self-injures. Thus, it is important that they have adequate knowledge, awareness, and skills related to the topic of self-injury. Self-injury is a complex phenomenon and the aforementioned guidelines serve as a framework for human service professionals to reference when working with current or future clients.

References

- Austin, L., & Kortum, J. (2004). Self-injury: The secret language of pain for teenagers. *Education*, 124, 517-527.
- Bachelor, A. & Horvath, A. (1999). The therapeutic relationship. In M.A. Hubble, B.L. Duncan & S.D. Miller (Eds.), *The heart and soul of change: What works in therapy* (pp.133-178). Boston, MA: Allyn and Bacon.
- Carkhuff, R. R., & Benson, B. G. (1967). *Beyond Counseling and Therapy*. New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston.
- Conterio, K., Lader, W., & Bloom, J. (1998). *Bodily Harm: The breakthrough healing program for self-injurers*. New York: Hyperion.
- Craigien, L. & Foster, V. (2008). *A qualitative investigation of the counseling experiences of adolescent women with a history of self-injurious behavior*. Manuscript submitted for publication.
- Deiter, P., Nichols, S., & Pearlman, L. (2000). Self-injury and self capacities: Assisting an individual in crisis. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 56(9), 1173-1191.
- Favazza, A.R., & Conterio, K. (1989). Female habitual self-mutilation. *Acta Psychiatria Scandinavica*, 79, 283-289.
- Favazza, A.R. (1996). *Bodies under siege: Self-mutilation and body modification in culture and psychiatry* (2nd ed.). Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press.

- Favazza, A.R. (1998). The coming age of self-mutilation. *Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease*, 186(5), 259-268.
- Favazza, A.R. (2006). Self-Injurious behavior in college students, *Pediatrics*, 117(6), 2282-2283.
- Favazza, A.R. & Rosenthal, R. J. (1993). *Diagnostic issues in self-mutilation. Hospital and Community Psychiatry*, 44, 134-140.
- Fawcett, J., Scheftner, W., Clark, D., Hedeker, D., Gibbons, R., & Coryell, W. (1987). Clinical predictors of suicide in patients with major affective disorders; a controlled prospective study. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, 144, 35-40.
- Froeschle, J. & Moyer, M. (2004). Just cut it out: Legal and ethical challenges in counseling students who self-mutilate. *Professional School Counseling*, 7(4), 231-235.
- Gratz, K. (2001). Measurement of deliberate self-harm: Preliminary data on the deliberate self-harm inventory. *Journal of Psychopathology and Behavioral Assessment*, 23(4), 253-263.
- Halley, A., Kopp, J., & Austin, M. (1998). *Delivering human services: A learning approach to practice* (4th ed.). New York: Longman.
- House, R. & Martin, P. (1998). Advocating for better futures for all students: a new vision for school counselors. *Education*, 119, 284-291.
- Kanel, K. (2008). *An Overview of the Human Services*. Boston: Lahaska Press.
- Kiselica, M. and Zila, L. (2001). Understanding and counselling self-mutilation in female adolescents and young adults, *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 79(1), 46-52.
- Klonsky, D.E. The functions of deliberate self-injury: A review of the evidence, *Clinical Psychology Review*, 27, 226-239.
- Lambert, M. (1992). Implications for outcome research for psychotherapy integration. In J. C. Norcross & M. R. Goldstein (Eds.), *Handbook of psychotherapy integration* (pp. 94-129). New York: Basic Books.
- Levenkron, S (1998). *Understanding and Overcoming Self-Mutilation*. New York: W.W. Norton and Company.
- McAllister, M. (2003). Multiple meanings of self-harm: A critical review. *International Journal of Mental Health Nursing*, 12, 175-185.
- Miller, D. (1994). *Women who hurt themselves: A book of hope and understanding*. Cambridge, MA: Basic Books.
- Moyer, M. & Nelson, K. (2007). Investigating and understanding self-mutilation: The student voice. *Professional School Counseling*, 11(1), 42-48.
- Muehlenkamp, J. (2006). Empirically supported treatment and general therapy guidelines for non-suicidal self-injury. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling*, 28(2), 166-185.
- Nock, M. K. & Prinstein, M. J. (2005). Contextual features and behavioral functions of self- mutilation among adolescents. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology*, 114, 140-146.
- NOHS (National Organization of Human Services). (2008). *Ethical standards of practice*. Retrieved May 20, 2008 from www.nationalhumanservices.org.

- Oxygen Youth Health (n.d.). *Self-harm and young people*. Retrieved May 20, 2008 from http://www.eppic.org.au/docs/fact_selfharm.pdf.
- Revolutionhealth (2008) Self-Injury. Retrieved July 20, 2008 from <http://www.revolutionhealth.com/articles/self-injury/3797>
- Ryan, J., Clemmett, S. & Snelson, A. (1997). Role of a psychiatric liaison nurse in an A & E department. *Accident and Emergency Nursing*, 5, 152-155.
- Shaw, N. (2002). *Shifting conversations on girls' and women's self-injury: An analysis of the clinical literature in historical context*. *Feminism and Psychology*, 12(2), 191-219.
- Stanley, B., Gameroff, M., Venezia, M., and Mann, J. (2001). Are Suicide attempters who self-mutilate a unique population? *American Journal of Psychiatry*, 158, 427-432.
- Stone, J. & Sias, S. (2003). Self-injurious behavior: A bi-modal treatment approach to working with adolescent females. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling*, 112-114.
- Teen Issues (n.d.). *Warning Signs of Self-Harming*. Retrieved July 22, 2008 from www.teenissues.co.uk.
- Trepal, H. & Wester, K. (2007). Self-injurious behaviors, diagnoses, and treatment methods: What mental health professionals are reporting. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling*, 29(4), 363-375,
- Trepal, H. & Wester, K. (2005, September 5). School counselors and self-injurious behaviors: Assessing perceptions, prevalence, and training issues. *Journal of School Counseling*, 4(18). Retrieved, February 3, 2008 from <http://www.jsc.montana.edu/articles/v4n18.pdf>.
- Vivekananda, K (2000). Integrating models for understanding self-injury. *Psychotherapy in Australia*, 7, 18-25.
- Walsh, B.W. (2006). *Treating self-injury*. New York: Guilford Press.
- Wester, K. & Trepal, H. (2005). Working with clients who self-injure: Providing alternatives. *Journal of College Counseling*, 8, 180-189.
- White, V., Trepal, H., Nolan, J. (2002). College students and self-injury: Intervention strategies for counselors. *Journal of College Counseling*, 5, 105-113.
- Whitekress, V. & Drouhard, N. (2004). Students who self-injure: School counselor ethical and legal considerations. *Professional School Counseling*, 10(2), 203-209.

Review of Human Behavior in the Social Environment from an African-American Perspective, Second Edition by Letha A. Lee

Myron R. Anderson

Metropolitan State College of Denver

In *Human Behavior in the Social Environment from an African-American Perspective*, Letha A. Lee attempts to shed light on complex human behavior issues encountered by African Americans through the lens of African Americans. Discussing the African American perspective was further challenging because Lee first recognized and displayed established conceptualization theories, and then integrated current research and knowledge of the Black experience, thus providing the reader with an “intellectual toolbox” to consider new theories that include the African American perspective within social environments. This book is unique because Lee serves as the editor and a contributor that also includes chapter contributions from forty-eight scholars and practitioners throughout the book. The culmination of this research, experience, and expertise provides both qualitative and quantitative findings leading to many thought provoking points of view. It is evident that the author has done extensive research in the area of human behavior as well as research in the African American community to present the Black experience as it intersects with established human behavior theories as well as the disconnects that are apparent as a result of in-depth research.

Throughout the book, Lee presented many of the social environments that impact the African American community. Some of the environments discussed were the Black family, Black children from their formative years to old age, and medical and psychological interventions in the Black community. Furthermore, the author organized the 735-page, 32 Chapter book to align with seven overarching “Parts”, providing the reader with the ability to review a wide analysis of African American behavior, within the text, in a non-linear way. This organization is very user friendly to the reader and allows the reader to review the social environments that are a priority to them and move independently throughout the book as they encounter different social environments in the present and into the future.

Part I focuses on fundamental theories of human behavior as well as the basis for researching the African American perspective. More specifically, in chapter one, Lee discusses how past research by “sociologists, educators, psychologists, psychiatrists, and anthropologists have provided a number of elaborate theories, paradigms, studies,

epistemologies, and perspectives for assigning causation to the behavior of African Americans and other cultural and ethnic groups” (p. 3). However, this research also suggests that negative behavior and/or a person’s failure to achieve is a result of inferior genetic characteristics and inconsistencies in intellectual capacity. In addition, “structural variables” need not be considered when considering societal achievement.

Lee does an excellent job in this chapter to recognize past research, by human behavior scientists, and to bring to the discussion additional research performed in the African American community by African American scholars. This presents a new perspective to the literature that challenges past findings. Lee brings together research that dates back over thirty years and has a track record of established theories as well as bringing an objective lens to the research that challenges existing theories established by past social and behavior scientists. This chapter establishes a foundation for the reader to understand the past and draw conclusions leading to the “why”, as well as providing an understanding and perspective for the past and present research performed by African American scholars supporting the development of new theories in human behavior in social environments from an African American perspective.

Part II focuses on understanding the Black families. More specifically, Black families in the 21st Century. This section provides a historical perspective of the decline of married couples heading African American households, which has a direct affect on African American families. This section further indicates that since 15 years after slavery the number of African American couples heading households went from 80 to 39 percent according to the 1993 consensus (U.S. Bureau of the Census, 1993). This has resulted in a paradigm shift in the influence of the 21st Century Black family and has placed the Church as the leading action system in the Black family. This is further illustrated via diagram (figure 3.1) pointing out how family relates to community in the African American experience (p. 59). This diagram notes that the Church is the most influential action system in the 21st Century Black family and states that other influences that follow were law enforcement, recreation centers, shopping centers, family, schools, health centers, the work place, informal associations, society, village, African American community, and global communities.

Understanding this paradigm shift is paramount to performing research yielding accurate data when looking at behavior in the African American community. Moreover, this discovery further sets the stage to compare and contrast 21st Century research with historical studies bringing to the front support for the addition of new human behavior

theories when looking at social environments from an African American perspective.

Part III through VI of the book begins with the “Formative Years of Black Children”, then to the “Teen Years”, transitioning to “Young African American Adults”, and ending with “Behaviors During the Middle Years and Old Age”. Organizing the text in this way proved positive in three ways. One, the research was focused in these life areas allowing issues to be communicated that are specific and unique to young, middle age, and older people. This is exemplified in Part III, Chapter 8, where the discussion of the psychological effects of skin color on African American’s self-esteem considering a past study, entitled “The Doll Study”, in relation to this issue. “The Doll Study” conducted by Kenneth and Mamie Clark in 1939, indicated that when Black children were presented with a Black doll and a White doll and asked the question, What doll do you want to be like? Black children choose the White doll the majority of the time.

This was a groundbreaking study that provided insight to the psychological effects and influence received by African American youth in regards to the acceptance of skin color. Second, the reader has the ability to use an age group as a guide to review newly developed theories linked more closely to their population of interest. This is evident in Part IV, Chapter 11, focusing on the “Regendering of Social Work Practice with African American Girls” and Chapter 14, The Prevalence and Incidence of Black-on-Black Crime Among Youth”. These are just two of many chapters, within this “Part” that are designated to human behavior issues related to the teenage years of African Americans.

Third, the organization of this book provides an element to the reader allowing it to serve as a quick reference and/or guide that may be reviewed out of sequence. For example, within Parts III – VI, there are multiple chapters that discuss self-esteem, the psychological effects of skin color, the empowerment of young African American males, substance abuse, violence in the prison system, African American Women with HIV/Aids, stressors experienced by the African American community, and educational resilience among African American college students who have experienced long-term foster care. These wide range of topics subdivided within sections allow the reader to go right to an issue of interest and review information that might be of assistance.

The last section, Part VII, is entitled “Useful Medical and Psychological Intervention”. This section focuses on the role of medicine, useful modality for serving African American and Latino patients, aged African Americans and Hispanics and Latinos, and postmodern perspectives on Black suicides in the United States. There has been much

research suggesting that the path to medical and psychological intervention is different in relation to the White majority. There are many factors that affect this path, i.e. culture, society, and economic influences to name a few. Lee clearly presents issues that are related to the African American and Latino and Latina communities that influence this path.

More specifically, in reviewing Part VII, Chapter 29, entitled “The Role of the Medical Dosemetrist in Treating African American Cancer Patients” and Chapter 31, “Dying a Good Death, the Desire to Die, and Rational-Emotive Behavior Therapy: Focused on Aged African Americans and Hispanic/Latinos”. These chapters present national research in reference to the health issues facing the African American and Latino and Latina communities today as well as communicating through additional research the perspective of these communities as it relates to physical and psychological health. This section of the book begins to bring insight to the question, Why African Americans and Latino and Latina’s may take a different path in regards to health care?

It is very evident that a great deal of research, both qualitatively and quantitatively, was apparent throughout this book. Moreover, the incorporation of forty-eight additional scholars and practitioners, coupled with their research and expertise added value and perspective that proved to be multilayer when bringing to light the African American perspective. The target audience is broad and inclusive in the field of human services: workers, students, educators, policy analysts, administrators, and practitioners. In addition, the book is organized in a way that is very reader friendly with current and relative topics that resonates strongly with the general public. This makes the book an inviting read for people who may have an interest in human behavior, as well as, social issues affecting our communities today.

Finally, the book was current and informative and did an excellent job of connecting past research and theories to current research related to the Black experience. The African American perspective was covered in-depth throughout the book adding validity and reliability to the theoretical discussions in regards to human behavior. The text provided support and evidence for the understanding and future development of new theories on human behavior in social environments as it relates to the African American community. In conclusion, *Human Behavior in the Social Environment from an African-American Perspective, Second Edition* is an excellent read, user friendly, and is organized in a way that is appealing to both human service professionals and the general public. This book is positioned to be an excellent resource for all persons in the field of human services for many years.

Review of the Successful Internship: Personal, Professional, and Civic Development, Third Edition **by H. Frederick Sweitzer and Mary A. King**

Susan A. Andresen
Darton College

The third edition of Sweitzer and King's textbook refines, enhances and expands the central themes of the first edition (1999) and reflects the authors' own developmental journey in their understanding of the power of the internship experience in the lives of its students. This is a new and improved version of an already excellent textbook, with changes and improvements in the format, which make it more readable. Intended as an inclusive, comprehensive, and flexible guide for students in a wide range of disciplines, as they navigate required experiences in the field, it is a rich resource at many levels for both students and their faculty.

There are four central themes, three of which are carried over from previous editions. First, the developmental frame used to describe and normalize the student's experience of an internship as a movement through five predictable stages; i.e., Anticipation, Disillusionment, Confrontation, Competence, and Culmination (Chapters 1, 5, 10, 11, 12, 14). Second, the concept of the internship as a phenomenological or lived experience by the student, rather than only an intellectual exercise. This theme is grounded in the principles of experiential education and more specifically in the value of and need for critical reflection. Third, the explicit emphasis on self-understanding and, in the case of the helping professions such as human services, the therapeutic use of self. The fourth new and, from this reviewer's perspective, exciting theme, is that of the internship as a vehicle for the civic development of the student. The student not only learns how to be a professional in his or her chosen profession, he or she also becomes a civic professional. That is, the student understands "the public relevance" of the profession and its connection to a "larger social purpose" (p. 7). In the words of the authors, "every profession has a social obligation and its work has public relevance" (p. 159). Six of the textbook's chapters include a component that develops this concept, each from a different perspective (Chapters 1, 5, 7, 8, 10 and 12).

The value of this textbook for students undertaking one or more internships is enormous. In general, the book both demystifies the experience and empowers students who read it. All aspects of the internship, developmental, instrumental, and emotional, are addressed in detail to create a practical and supportive "safety net" for the student immersed in that

journey. It is addressed directly to the student; the tone is invitational and encourages her/him to consider the points being made; and the effect is the engagement of the student as an active partner and collaborator in the learning process (a central philosophical tenet of human services). Liberal use is made of “student reflections” -- actual excerpts from student journals. There is extensive promotion of student reflection and critical thinking through the use of boxes inserted throughout each chapter, entitled “Think About It,” “In Their Own Words,” “Focus on Theory,” “Focus on Skills,” etc. (new in this edition), and in the end of chapter exercises titled “Personal Reflections,” under the “For Contemplation” section. Finally, the authors share their wisdom, accrued over many years of experience (with the clear recognition that their students have served as their teachers), under a new heading titled “a word to the wise” that is periodically inserted at the end of a topic or subject under discussion.

This textbook is also an excellent resource for faculty who facilitate the weekly or bi-weekly seminars commonly associated with student internships, and/or for faculty who supervise interns in the field. Just as the developmental approach predicts and helps the student to understand his or her experience in the field, it also serves as a framework for faculty to recognize and appreciate student behaviors and responses to those field placement experiences. Furthermore, the book provides faculty with guidelines and tools for making the core concepts and components of an internship come alive to the students. Embedded in the content of the chapters are lots of ideas faculty can use in planning their seminars. Each chapter has a section at the end titled “Seminar Springboards,” listing exercises that can be used during the seminar to highlight key chapter content. In addition, there is a brief annotated bibliography of relevant literature at the conclusion of every chapter which can be referenced by both faculty and students. As a final point for those faculty in human service education programs who are interested in, or in the process of, seeking accreditation, the textbook can be used as a reference for achieving compliance with Standards 21-23, which cover the fieldwork component of these programs (Council for Standards in Human Service Education, www.cshse.org).

Specific chapters deserve mention as examples of how the textbook serves as a resource, especially for faculty in charge of placing students at sites and/or of the internship seminar. This is not intended to diminish the value of any other chapters, but rather to illustrate the serious potential of the book for faculty use. Chapter 1 provides an overview of an effective seminar and uses Michael Kahn’s clever metaphors to describe the different kinds of seminars – “Free for All,” “Beauty Contest,” “Distinguished House Tour,” and “Barn Raising” (p. 13-16). Together, Chapters 1-4 serve

as an excellent orientation to the internship. Chapter 5 includes very specific strategies for helping students create goals and objectives for their Learning Contracts. Of particular note is the inclusion of suggestions of how to develop goals and objectives related to the civic development of the students. Chapter 6 offers guidelines for faculty to structure the internship experience using clear criteria. A range of placement site issues, along with an in-depth exploration of the supervision component, is addressed in Chapter 7. “Getting the Know the Community” is the title of Chapter 8, which expands on the concept of the development of a “civic professional.” The Confrontation Stage is explored in Chapter 11, with emphasis on encouraging the student to become an active agent in the process of personal change and/or solving a problem or crisis. Two items are worth mentioning. First, the recognition of the role of the affective domain as an equal partner in problem solving, or in the authors’ words, the importance of “leading with the heart” (p.228). Second, the Eight Step Metamodel for Creating Change that is presented in detail (p. 231-242). This is an excellent and practical model to teach to students and to apply as faculty.

The explicit intentions of *The Successful Internship* are that it can be broadly applied to a range of professional disciplines and that it is flexible in terms of the context in which it is used. To honor the first intention, the authors have identified and labeled sections “For Helping and Service Professionals.” In addition, the annotated bibliographies at the end of each chapter cover a diversity of fields of study. To deal with the second intention, Sweitzer and King recommend the following: that the first four chapters be read in sequence in preparation for the internship; that the order of the stages be preserved, with the exception that Chapters 5 through 9 (the Anticipation stage) be read in an order appropriate to the program’s curriculum, before moving on to Chapters 10, 11, 12 and 14, which cover the remaining four stages. Chapter 13 which addresses professional, ethical and legal issues can be read at a time deemed appropriate by the faculty (Preface, xxi).

There are a few minor questions related to the use of this textbook. It is so crammed with useful information, resources, advice, techniques, provocative topics and questions that one wonders how to do justice to its content if its use is limited to weekly or biweekly seminars? How can the book be used effectively when students have more than one field placement and those are spread out over two to three quarters or semesters? Finally, one wonders how useful the text might be, given its pervasive emphasis on self-understanding, for professions less intensively focused on the self as a tool for helping others. All considered, this is a notably improved version of an already outstanding educational textbook.

Guidelines for Authors

Human Service Education (HSE) is a national refereed journal. Manuscripts judged by the editors to fall within the range of interest of the journal will be submitted to reviewers without the names and identifying information of the authors. The principal audiences of HSE are human service faculty members, administrators, practitioners, and undergraduate and graduate students. Sample areas of interest include teaching methods, models of internships, faculty development, career paths of graduates, credentialing, accreditation, models of undergraduate and graduate study, clinical issues in human service treatment, and supervision of human service practitioners.

HSE publishes three types of submissions: 1) articles, 2) brief notes, and 3) critical reviews of instructional materials and scholarly books of interest to human service educators.

Directions for each type of submission include the following:

1. **Articles.** Manuscripts for articles should not exceed twelve (12) typed pages. **Manuscripts may not exceed this page limit.** Following the title page, include an abstract of not more than 100 words. This statement should express the central idea of the article in non-technical language and should appear on a page separate from the text.
2. **Brief Notes.** Submissions appropriate for this format include brief reports of research projects or program innovations. Manuscripts should not exceed four (4) double-spaced typed pages; it is recommended that the results and implications occupy at least half of the brief note. A 50-word capsule statement should accompany the note.
3. **Critical Reviews.** HSE accepts reviews of textbooks, other instructional materials, and scholarly books of interest to human service educators and practitioners. Manuscripts should not exceed three (3) typed pages unless two or more related books are included in one review in which case manuscripts should not exceed five (5) typed pages.

The following instructions apply to all three types of submissions:

1. Manuscripts should be well organized and present the idea in a clear and concise manner. Use headings and subheadings to guide the reader. Avoid the use of jargon and sexist terminology.
2. Manuscripts should be typed in 12-point type with margins of at least one inch on all four sides. All materials should be double spaced including references, all lines of tables, and extensive quotations.

3. All material should conform to the style of the fifth edition of the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association.
4. Avoid footnotes wherever possible.
5. Tables should be kept to a minimum. Include only essential data and combine tables whenever possible. Each table should be on a separate sheet of paper following the reference section of the article. Final placement of tables is at the discretion of the editors.
6. Figures (graphs, illustrations) must be supplied in electronic format and must be in black and white with a minimum of gray shading. Use of submitted figures or a re-rendering of the figures for clarity is at the discretion of the editors.
7. Two (2) copies of the manuscript must be electronically submitted (Microsoft Word or text file versions only). The first version should include, on a separate page, the title of the article, the names of the authors, their professional titles, and their institutional affiliations. The second version must be free of any identifying information. Articles' titles and headings should be as short as possible.
8. Check all references for completeness; make sure all references mentioned in the text are listed in the reference section and vice versa.
9. Manuscripts are edited for consistency of grammar, spelling, and punctuation. In some cases, portions of manuscripts may be reworded for conciseness or clarity of expression.
10. Manuscripts are accepted for review with the understanding that they represent original work and are not under review by another publication.

NOTE: All manuscripts must meet the specifications detailed above or they will be returned to the authors before review for publication.

Send two (2) electronic Microsoft Word or text file versions of the manuscript, one with and one without identifying information, as well as inquiries concerning the publication via e-mail to:

Jill C. Jurgens, Ed.D., Lead Editor
Human Service Education
NOHSHSE@yahoo.com

